

EXPERTS' REPORT

DENTISTRY (BACHELOR)

Universidad Autónoma de Chile (Chile) August 2021

HEI	Universidad Autónoma de Chile (Chile)			
Programme	Dentistry			
Degree	Bachelor			
Extent	360 CP			
Length of studies	12 semester			
Language	Spanish			
Concept accreditation				
First-time international accreditation				
No. reaccreditation				
Responsible agency	AQAS e.V.			
Responsible consultants	Patrick Heinzer / Ronny Heintze			



Content

I.	. Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS4				
II.	Preamble				
III.	II. Accreditation procedure				
	1.	Criteria			
	2.	Approach and methodology			
IV.	Gener	al Information on the University8	;		
٧.	Asses	sment of the study programme(s)9	ı		
	1.	Quality of the Curriculum9	i		
	2.	Procedures for Quality Assurance			
	3.	Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students			
	4.	Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification	i		
	5.	Teaching Staff	,		
	6.	Learning Resources and Student Support	i		
	7.	Public information			
VI.	Findin	gs of the panel of experts	,		



Decision of the AQAS Commission

on the bachelor programme

"Dentistry" (Bachelor)

offered by

Universidad Autónoma de Chile, Chile

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Commission in its 10th meeting on 30 August 2021, the AQAS Commission decides:

 The study programme "Dentistry" (Bachelor) offered by Universidad Autónoma de Chile, Chile is accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is conditional.

The study programme essentially complies with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.

- 2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than 30 September 2022.
- 3. The accreditation is given for the period of six years and is valid until 30 September 2027.

Conditions:

- 1. Interdisciplinarity, practical and applied elements (e.g. in Pharmacology or oral Physiology) must be included in the basic science courses
- 2. The relation between theoretical and practical components must be clarified in the course descriptions to create transparency concerning the course content.
- 3. It must be assured that implemented actions resulting from the PDCA cycle are consistently communicated with all relevant stakeholders to increase acceptance and ownership of the QA cycle.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programme:

- 1. When designing the examination of students, all three competence areas should be assessed consistently.
- 2. The programme should establish regionally focused research lines which are relevant to the respective regional society.
- 3. Policies should be implemented to assure progress in the development of English competencies of staff and students to enable a better exchange with non-Spanish speaking universities on the one hand and to expand their research activities with non-Spanish speaking countries on the other hand. Besides better





meeting labour market requirements, this will also support the broadness of the academic quality of the education.

- 4. It should be assured that more specific equipment for physiology is included in the laboratories.
- 5. In the light of the internationalisation efforts of UAC the experts suggest that mobility agreements are expanded for the programme.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.



EXPERTS' REPORT ON THE BACHELOR PROGRAMME "DENTISTRY" (BACHELOR) OFFERED BY UNIVERSIDAD AUTÓNOMA DE CHILE (CHILE)

Visit to the university: 31 May - 4 June 2021

Panel of Experts:

Prof. Dr. Jan Ehlers University Witten/Herdecke (Germany), Vice-President

for Teaching and Learning

Prof. Dr. Jon Irazusta Astiazaran University of the Basque Country (Spain), Director of the

Department of Physiology at Faculty of Medicine and

Odontology

Prof. Dr. Andrea Kaplan University of Buenos Aires (Argentina), School of Dentis-

try, Department for Dental Materials

Dr. Patricio Ricardo Rodríguez Bastías Dentistry Coordinator at SanaSalud (Santiago de

Chile/Chile) (representative from the labour market)

Dominik Kubon Student of RWTH Aachen University (Germany) (student

expert)

Coordinators:

Patrick Heinzer / Ronny Heintze AQAS, Cologne, Germany



II. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution.

III. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor programme in "Dentistry" offered by Universidad Autónoma de Chile (Chile).

1. Criteria

The programme is assessed against a set of criteria for programme accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to a programme.

2. Approach and methodology

The initialisation

The University mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in November 2019.

The University produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In February 2020, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the study programme and an appendix as well as statistical data on the programme.

The appendix included e.g.:

- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts).
- CVs of the teaching staff
- Information on student services
- Core information on the main library
- Undergraduate academic regulations

()



AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in April 2021.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on August 2020.

The nomination of the panel of expert

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in April 2021 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the University did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

The preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

The site visit

After a review of the Self Evaluation Report, a digital site visit to the University took place from 31 May to 4 June 2021. During the meeting, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the University's representatives.

The report writing

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Standing Commission. The report was sent to the University for comments.

The decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to make a decision regarding the accreditation of the programme. Based on these two documents, on 31 August 2021 the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In October 2021, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

IV. General Information on the University

Universidad Autónoma de Chile (UAC) is a non-profit institution founded in Temuco in 1989 (as Universidad Autónoma de Sur). Starting with undergraduate degree programmes in Law and Commercial Engineering, the University expanded in 1993 in the Maule and the Metropolitan region and decided to change its name. The University points out that the direction of expansion (from regional towards the capital) was an exception within the Chilean Higher Education system because many universities in Chile expanded from the capital towards



other regions. At the time of the self-evaluation report (SER), the University has 25,605 students and 2,160 academics. By now, UAC has four campuses located in three cities (Providencia Campus and El Llano Campus in Santiago de Chile, Talca and Temuco).

On a structural level and based on a university-wide regulation, the organization of UAC is headed by a share-holder's board, a board of directors and the rector. The administrative organization chart foresees the differentiation between a university council, an academic council, and the general secretary. Following an administrative principle of decentralization, each campus has six vice-chancellors who share the academic and administrative responsibility (academic, administration and finance, graduate and research, public engagement, quality assurance, and the campus itself). As stated in the SER, UAC decided in 2008 to create faculties in order to be able to develop educational projects which respect the local needs of the academic and professional environment. At the moment, UAC has established seven faculties (business and administration, architecture and construction, medical and health sciences, humanities and social science, law, education, engineering) which offer 32 undergraduate programmes.

The programme under accreditation is located at the faculty of health sciences. It is stated that this faculty is the largest of UAC with over 10,000 students offering programmes in nursing, speech therapy, kinesiology, medicine, nutrition and dietetics, obstetrics and puericulture, chemistry and pharmacy, occupational therapy, and odontology. According to the self-evaluation report, most of the study programmes are offered at least at three campuses. The study programme "Odontology" is offered at Providencia Campus (since 2010) and in Temuco (since 2011). Recurring on the statistical data given in the SER, the study programme is relatively small comparing it to other programmes, but the number of students has constantly grown in the last five intakes (from 547 in 2015 to 739 students in 2019).

V. Assessment of the study programme(s)

1. Quality of the Curriculum

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Description

Study Programme Objectives

As outlined in the SER, the intended learning outcomes (ILO) on the programme level are based on the graduation profile. In general, graduation profiles are defined at UAC through a process that covers discipline-specific, up-to-date scientific, and technological aspects. Each profile is defined in a participative way that includes internal and external stakeholders, and it is said that each profile is in line with the national accreditation commission (CNA). Following this procedure, the current graduation profile was prepared in 2012 and has been validated in the following year. The University applies the graduate profile competencies over a three-dimensional matrix (disciplinary, professional, and generic).

In this sense, the University points out that graduates of the Bachelor study programme "Odontology" will have disciplinary knowledge of the biological, structural, and morpho-functional bases to discriminate general



systemic factors involved in the development of pathological pictures of human beings. Furthermore, graduates shall be enabled to carry out basic research in dentistry, which follows current principles of ethics.

As professional competencies, UAC outlines the design of preventive oral health plans, including detecting early structural and functional anomalies and the formulation of diagnoses, treatment, and maintenance plans as key intended learning outcomes. In addition, the execution of dental treatment plans focuses for the prevention, rehabilitation, and maintenance of the stomatognathic system.

Upon completing the Bachelor programme, students will be able to apply generic skills such as communication skills, the capacity for abstraction, analysis and synthesis, teamwork skills, ethical behaviour, critical thinking, and social responsibility.

Curricular Elements and Programme Quality

According to the SER, the curricular structure of the programme is divided into three training cycles (initial cycle, intermediate cycle, and advanced cycle). It is stated that the initial cycle (Semester 1-4) covers 40% of the undergraduate programme and aims to impart general competencies which build the scientific foundations for students. The intermediate cycle (Semester 5- 10; 40% of the undergraduate programme) focuses on deepening the areas of specialization and is integrated into the curriculum to understand the essential aspects of the discipline. The curriculum foresees that students will get their first practical experiences through clinical internships in different field-specific disciplines. The University states that students are expected to have the theoretical set of skills associated with a Bachelor's degree programme at the end of the intermediate cycle. The advanced cycle (Semester 11-12) aims to intensify the implementation of theoretical knowledge into practice. It is indicated that students will take a clinical internship of 13 weeks per semester, followed by a three-week post-processing phase for these internships (report and oral examination). The University outlines that the study programme covers a total of 6,757 hours which are differentiated into theoretical hours, laboratory hours, and clinical internship hours.

As indicated in the documentation, the overview of the study programme course plan differentiates between basic training courses, disciplinary professional training courses, and general training courses. The University uses a matrix to allocate the required competencies to each course. The curriculum indicates 14 basic training courses, 26 disciplinary professional courses, and six courses designated for general skills. Whereas basic training and disciplinary professional courses are mandatory, general skill courses are marked as elective courses.

Since 2016, the University uses the Chilean credit transfer system (SCT-Chile) as a reference model for their study programmes. Consequently, UAC has defined 1,800 hours of student workload for each year, including contact hours and time for self-study. One SCT-Chile corresponds to 30 hours of student dedication, and 60 SCT-Chile are distributed for each academic year.

Experts' Evaluation

Based on the graduation profile, which is in line with national requirements, the Bachelor programme "Dentistry" curriculum can be defined as very solid and robust. The level is in line with the national qualifications framework in Chile and comparable to the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) on bachelor's level. The curriculum follows the stages which have been defined on the institutional level (initial, intermediate, and advanced cycle) to obtain on the one hand the academic degree (*licenciatura*), and, on the other hand, the professional degree which allows graduates to work professionally as dentists. The curricular structure is well defined and comprises basic knowledge (with courses in mathematics, anatomy, chemistry, or physiology), discipline-related competencies (such as oral pathology, odontological pharmacology, oral physiology, or preventive odontology). These are particularly important to students to give them a robust basis during the first semesters. However, given the importance of understanding "Dentistry" in a holistic and interdisciplinary



fashion, the panel of experts believes that interdisciplinary, practical and applied elements (e.g., in pharmacology or oral physiology) must be included in these courses (**Finding 1**). First preclinical courses in dental biomaterials and integrated clinical courses (during the intermediate cycle) create a balanced mix between theory and practice. The essential part for students comes during the internships in the last two semesters (two clinical internships). In addition, students have room to specialize according to their interests within the general training area. Here students can take courses in communication, ethics, social responsibility, or others. Summarizing the programme's composition, it can be stated that students of this programme will be well prepared for the labour market.

The course descriptions give students a good overview of the programme's structure and the content of the respective course. It clarifies workload and examination methods used for the course and creates thus a high level of transparency for students. Nonetheless, there is currently a lack of transparency concerning the relation between theoretical and practical components within the courses, which needs to be addressed. A clarification of this matter will help the programme management to better outline what competencies students will learn theoretically and practically (**Finding 2**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for Quality Assurance

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes. A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular

feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

The quality assurance model and the quality assurance policy (in its current version: 2018) foresee a multiplestep procedure for the quality assurance procedures for study programmes at UAC. The procedures outlined in the SER focus mainly on the assessment of teaching quality, the integration of research into teaching, and the continuous improvement of the programme quality.

The internal quality assurance system described in the report intends to build a closed PDCA cycle and focus on the systematisation of processes and strategies, the enhancement of said strategies, the monitoring of relevant stakeholders' satisfaction of needs, and transparency with regards to national and international regulations. It includes the following levels:

- The strategic level, which involves government regulations, internal evaluation, quality management and institutional analysis
- The academic level, on which training programs for undergraduate and graduate students, academic body management, research and public engagement are both sources for the exploration of opportunities and subjects of reviews and adjustments



 The support level, which includes finances, relevant stakeholders as well as necessary resources and infrastructure

The assessment of teaching quality is based on the monitoring and assessment mechanisms detailed in the annual programme action plan. UAC uses a pedagogical management system that includes several procedures for measuring the quality of the teaching staff for a specific study programme.

Experts' Evaluation

The Odontology study programme is subject to the associated procedures for quality assurance. The measures derived within the quality assurance procedures are collected within the faculty in an improvement plan that contains weaknesses, the actions determined from them, a schedule and expected outcomes. The plan and measures show the experts that the QA system is well established and used to optimize the study programme continuously.

In the opinion of the experts, students have sufficient opportunities to provide anonymous feedback on the study conditions via the various surveys. The faculty also has accurate metrics on student data so that academic success can be tracked to identify targeted modules that possibly can threaten academic progress and provide low-performing students with appropriate offerings to support them in their study success.

The expert panel can confirm that the results of all surveys are used intensively within the quality assurance system, but not all stakeholders are yet informed about the results and implemented actions derived from them. Within the well-thought and robust QA system of UAC, it is challenging to share outcomes with all key stakeholders at all stages. However, the experts consider informing all stakeholders about the results and measures to close the PDCA cycle as essential (**Finding 3**). In particular, the results of surveys completed by students and the derived actions should be systematically communicated.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes. [ESG 1.3]

Description

The SER describes that the methodologies used in the teaching and learning process of the Odontology programme are varied and depend on the requirements of the intended outcomes. UAC recognizes in its documentation that the use of more expository methods is traditional among the teaching staff of the discipline. Recent developments led to the promotion of strategies that allow for more active participation of students, transforming them into protagonists of their learning. The SER describes that these newly enforced teaching methods enable the development of complex intellectual skills, study methods, the strengthening of clinical reasoning, psychomotor skills, and the personal and social development of future dental surgeons. Examples of these activities could be flipped classrooms, field trips, discussion panels, and simulations.

Provided General Regulations for Undergraduate Students regulate the scope of evaluations (attendance, evaluation, and promotion), pointing out that assessment is a permanent, continuous, and systematic process.





The SER highlights that, in particular, the Odontology Programme adheres to an assessment approach as a resource for learning and understanding and describes that learning outcomes should not be understood in isolation or emphasize only their instrumental nature for curriculum design. They also represent a method that serves a broader purpose of academic education, vocational training, and learning assessment.

The implemented grading scale is from 1.0 to 7.0, and the minimum passing grade is equivalent to 4.0. The University regulations foresee that students must be informed about their evaluations and performance within ten calendar days following their exam. This regulation is described to enable students to monitor their learning process. Also, regulations establish that students have the right to know the expected and ideal results on written evaluations. In the case of theoretical-practical lectures at the professional training, students must obtain a minimum score of 4.0 in both the theoretical and practical parts to pass the lecture.

The Programme Council, chaired by the Director of the Degree and composed of all the academics who teach in the degree, regularly analyses the development of lectures, the curricular progress of the students, and updates the study plan. These coordination tasks also include coordination of assessment methods and exams. Any concerns and needs are forwarded to the corresponding authorities, particularly the Dean and Director of Undergraduate Teaching.

Experts' Evaluation

The overall teaching and learning methods focusing on the active participation of students are applied to the Dentistry Bachelor programme. A variety of methods are used for the programme that graduates are equipped with essential skills to practice as dentists. Students are sometimes given original English publications to follow up on courses. This is essential in the sense of evidence-based medicine.

UAC's teaching covers all three areas of competence, i.e. knowledge, skills, and attitudes (social and personal skills), which are of particular importance for graduates of the Dentistry programme. The curriculum and the teaching methods include all three competence areas to a sufficient and expectable amount. However, the assessment methods only focus on competencies in the first two areas. This bears the risk that the social-personal area is seen as less relevant by the students. When designing exams, this third and precious competence area should be considered (**Finding 4**).

The UAC handled the Covid-19 pandemic outstanding in teaching. It quickly switched to digital learning methods, which even brought students from the different campuses even closer together. In addition, new content was included, e.g., telemedicine. After the pandemic, the UAC should carefully evaluate which methods and contents it can use profitably.

The curriculum and course structure include regular examination situations and tests for students with good learning analytic tools to closely follow the learner's progression. This dense examination system is, in general, precious because students and teachers can easily detect potential areas of problems. During the site visit, it became apparent that the time for feedback and support from teaching staff was somehow too short in few instances. If this circumstance happens regularly, it might lower the potential of this close monitoring tool of students.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.



[ESG 1.4]

Description

Universidad Autónoma de Chile explains in its SER that it adheres to the Single Admission System (SUA), which is a national initiative created with the purpose of address the need for continuous improvement and management of national universities selection and admission system that is implemented by Public Universities Council and private universities affiliated to this council. This system annually defines the process and timelines for applying the national selection test (PSU), as well as vacancies and requirements for each programme on every university. This centrally coordinated process leads to the enrolment of the new students.

The vacancies established by the university for the academic year 2020 reach a total of 55 students in each campus: Santiago and Temuco. The programme management team proposes the number of vacancies through the faculty to higher authorities, considering teaching capacity, clinical fields, and available infrastructure to fulfil expected outcomes. Admission capacity and numbers for the past three years are presented as part of the SER.

In terms of monitoring students' progression, the institutional system SAGAF allows the academic management team to follow up on students' performance. It uses numerous indicators that can be compared on the level of each programme, campus or student. Early alerts can help identify students at risk or with low performance so they can overcome their difficulties. Data on first-year retention rates (87 - 96%) and first-year dropout rates (3.6 - 12.5%) for the last three to five years is presented as part of the SER. The average time to graduate in 13,4 semesters, with the national average being 14,5.

Following the SER, recognition is regulated by resolution 105/2016 which establishes the validation regulation for all programmes considering validation, homologation, and relevant knowledge exams. This process is implemented upon request by a student. The thematic contents must have an equivalence equal to or greater than 75% of the courses to be recognized, and it is not possible to validate, approve or take relevant knowledge tests beyond 70% of the programme's compulsory lectures. In 2015/16/17 31 recognition procedures were processed alone for the campus in Temuco.

Once students have completed all academic and administrative requirements for graduation, they are awarded the bachelor's degree and the professional title of Dental Surgeon. Examples of diplomas are delivered as annexe 10 to the SER.

Experts' Evaluation

The admission process for the dentistry bachelor programme is clearly defined and follows the national requirements defined under SUA. The programme follows high school grades (focusing on language and mathematics competencies), the general grade point ranking and the high school grade average. The criteria are publicly available, which leads to a high level of transparency for prospective students. Acknowledging the highly centralized admission system in Chilean higher education and the difficulty of adjusting the admission requirements, the experts' panel believes that the current requirements are not entirely congruent with the programme graduation profile. It might be beneficial for the cohorts to require more knowledge of biology, physics, or chemistry, but there is not much room for adjustments in the centralised system. The expert panel found that the systems and procedures for student admission are transparent and are adequately defined and that policies are supporting equal opportunities for students with particular circumstances. The interviews with the students and stakeholders confirmed UAC's assurance that the admission criteria are applied consistently. Some offers introduce new students to their programme and the university surrounding, and even in times of pandemic, UAC managed well to address the needs of new students. UAC provided the panel of experts with data on current but also earlier cohorts. The data showed a consistent number of enrolled students with



discernible differences according to the different branches (with Santiago de Chile as a significant point of attractiveness). The data indicates that the programme is attractive and valuated by prospective Chilean higher education system students.

Upon completion, graduates of the programme receive a certificate and a document explaining the higher education context and the degree awarded.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching Staff

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

Following the tables provided in the SER, the teaching staff for the Odontology programme in total arises to 146 lecturers, with 71 in Campus Santiago and 75 in Campus Temuco. It is mainly composed of professors with medical speciality (104) followed by holders of a Master's degree (23) and PhD (10).

As a result of the specific character of the programme and following the distribution of the curricular program established in training cycles, the highest percentage of lecturers (66%) is concentrated in the intermediate and advanced Cycles, where the lecturer/student ratio reaches its maximum expression with one lecturer for every eight students, which allows implementing a highly personalized and student-centred teaching. Also resulting from the specific character of clinical education is the number of associate lecturers (113) compared to 33 regular staff members. Out of the 146 teaching staff members, 23 have permanent contracts, while 123 are part-time employees.

Staff hiring is regulated by a predefined Recruitment and Selection Process (AP-GH-01), which begins when the Personnel Department announces a request for recruitment of a position according to a defined position profile and concludes with contract signing and initiation of the induction process (AC-GH-02). Candidates for all positions are explained to be selected through a standardized and objective process aimed to guarantee equity and excellence.

Experts' Evaluation

Having two campuses with different backgrounds comes with challenges, but also opportunities. The university's approach concerning research might lead to a situation that considers these different backgrounds in the research scopes of the programme. Therefore, the panel of experts suggests to strengthen research towards an applied focus with a special consideration of the regional background of the different campuses (**Finding 5**).



It became evident that amongst teaching staff there is continuous exchange which is especially important in the light of two campuses. The additional challenge to harmonize the programme at two branches is solved by UAC very satisfactorily. The vast amount of introductory sessions offered to permanent and non-permanent staff provides a good introduction to the UAC system. The didactical and discipline-related opportunities for staff is at a good level and enhances the quality of staff continuously. The recruitment processes at UAC for the Dentistry programme are transparently described and accessible to the public. The recruitment criteria are consistently applied and consider the academic background and practical experience.

The experts conclude that sufficient teaching staff in terms of quantity and quality is in place for both campuses. The teaching staff composition leads to a good ratio of staff and students for all subjects of the curriculum. The staff is actively engaged in the further development of the curriculum and their skills and competencies reflect latest development in the labour market and the academic level of the study programme. Currently, the number of PhD holders is low but still satisfactory. However, following UAC's institutional mission, should be part of particular attention in case the number of students increases in the future. The focus of the programme is per se on the Chilean/Latin American market. However, with an increasing internationalisation of the discipline and a consequently opening towards other higher education system due to the internationalisation strategy of UAC, it might be beneficial for the programme if a process is implemented to enhance the language competencies of staff in English (**Finding 6**).

Conclusion

Criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning Resources and Student Support

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

As outlined in the annexes, the University provides course descriptions for the study programme. These descriptions specify the course content, clarify the course's contribution to the graduation profile, the methodical strategy, teaching support resources, bibliography resources, and define the profile of the teacher of that course. Furthermore, the descriptions outline assessment methods and the expected workload (differentiated in self-study and in-class hours).

According to the SER, UAC has implemented several mechanisms that ensure that learning resources are available for the study programme. This mechanism starts when developing the study programme and accompanies the study programme with the annual report, academic audits, and satisfaction surveys of students and staff. The study programme uses classrooms of different sizes, basic science laboratories (which are shared with other programmes of the faculty and have a maximum size of 25 people), and preclinical laboratories with a simulation room. Practical experience can be gained using the dental clinic integrated into the Integrated Health Clinic (*Clínica integrada de Salud*), equipped with dental units, sterilization service, diagnostic unit, imaging, and two outpatient wards. The acquisition of biomaterial and supplies is under the supervision of a corporate supply staff member. Decisions about updating learning resources will be made institutionally.



UAC has a library system, and students have access to book collections and scientific and technical journals. Using online databases, students can use the library system theoretically at every branch. Besides the e-library catalogue, students can use the so-called knowledge portal, which informs them about new acquisitions, unique resources per faculty, and access to databases for undergraduate and research purposes. Furthermore, UAC provides access to electronic resources, such as databases (e.g. Ebsco, LegalPublishing, and medicine specific databases).

Experts' Evaluation

Based on the impression during the digital site visit, the resources can be seen as adequate for the intended learning outcomes of the programme. However, the confirmation site visit will serve as a double-check mechanism to get a more holistic perspective of resources available at the branches for the programme. Based on the videos provided, adequate spaces are in place. Special attention is given during the preclinical learning experience, where phantoms are available. It became apparent that there is a slight mismatch in resources concerning specific equipment for physiology if one compares it to other fields. This should be addressed in the further development of the programme (**Finding 7**). However, summarising the current situation for the programme, it can be stated that the programme provides students with good practical experiences which enables graduates to have a solid level to work as dentists.

The faculty has access to extensive science databases, such as EBSCO and Wiley. The database covers discipline-specific and non-specific literature in analogue and digital copies. This enables the students to work at the library and from home. Due to the pandemic, the focus shifted more into the digital world. UAC provided fellowships to students to increase internet and mobile access, which is highly commended by the panel of experts.

Thus, the programme follows the so-called SAC system (*Sistema de Acompañamiento Academico Complementario* - Complementary Academic Accompaniment System), which offers workshops in different areas (introductions, job interview, mobility placements, and others). The University shifted these workshops during the pandemic to a digital workshop and planned to keep these in that format. This creates synergies between the two branches and enhances the harmonisation processes on a structural level. The programme management supports students with internship placements in hospitals and small clinical offices on the programme level. This provides essential insights for students concerning the labour market experience and enables them to have the first contact with potential employees.

The internationalisation efforts for the programme have already led to some agreements with European universities (*Universidad de Granada* (Spain) and *Sapienza Università di Roma* (Italy)), although only a few students are participating currently. Currently, the student exchange for the programme is at a relatively low level, which is understandable from the experts' perspective due to the specific character of the programme. However, the site visit demonstrated that in some instances, students went abroad for one semester. Internationalisation is one of the strategic aims of UAC that should be fostered. The panel of experts believes that mobility agreements (and, thus, learning agreements) with Spanish-speaking universities and beyond might support the internationalisation efforts on the programme level (**Finding 8**).

Conclusion

Criterion is fulfilled.

7. Public information

()



Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders. [ESG 1.8]

Description

UAC states that on a general level information on the academic offer, curriculum and degree objectives, graduate profiles, policies, service offers, and the outcomes of external quality assessments is collected, updated, and made available to all internal and external stakeholders. The tools to systematically collect, analyse and process relevant information towards improvements mentioned are (1) annual reports, (2) annual audits, (3) the online platform SAGAF, (4) cycle evaluations, and (5) student, graduate and alumni surveys.

Concerning the "Dentistry" Bachelor programme, the academic offer, curriculum, and the graduation profile of students are published on the faculty's homepage. The information given includes the selection procedure and information about the different branches. Potential students can inform themselves by using this information or via an online guidance tool that is programme specific.

Experts' Evaluation

The experts consider the information provided on the selection procedure and the general examination regulations sufficient to inform both prospective students and students about the most important regulations. Interested parties can find the programme's learning outcomes broken down by disciplinary, professional, and generic competencies on the faculty website. However, in the interest of transparency, the module descriptions and detailed qualification objectives should also be published on the websites of the individual programs.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.





VI. Findings of the panel of experts

- 1. Interdisciplinarity, practical and applied elements (e.g., in pharmacology or oral physiology) must be included in the basic science courses.
- 2. The relation between theoretical and practical components must be clarified in the course descriptions to create transparency concerning the course content.
- 3. It must be assured that implemented actions resulting from the PDCA cycle are consistently communicated with all relevant stakeholders to increase acceptance and ownership of the QA cycle.
- 4. When designing the examination of students, all three competence areas should be assessed consistently.
- 5. The programme should establish regionally focused research lines which are relevant to the respective regional society.
- 6. Policies should be implemented to assure progress in the development of English competencies of staff and students to enable a better exchange with non-Spanish speaking universities on the one hand and to expand their research activities with non-Spanish speaking countries on the other hand. Besides better meeting labour market requirements, this will also support the broadness of the academic quality of the education.
- 7. It should be assured that more specific equipment for physiology is included in the laboratories.
- 8. In the light of the internationalisation efforts of UAC the experts suggest that mobility agreements are expanded for the programme.

