



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

EXPERTS' REPORT

**ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION
(BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

**ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION
(MASTER OF EDUCATION)**

**APPLIED LINGUISTICS (MASTER OF
APPLIED LINGUISTICS)**

**LANGUAGE EDUCATION SCIENCE
(DOCTOR OF LANGUAGE EDUCATION
SCIENCE)**

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta



HEI	Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
Campus, if applicable	

Programme	English Language Education		
Degree	Bachelor of Education		
Extent	144 credits (= 233 ECTS credits)		
Length of studies	7 semesters		
Language	English/Bahasa		
Start Study programme	1965		
Maximum capacity of students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of entering students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of graduates	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
* reference period:			

Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
No. reaccreditation	

Responsible agency	AQAS e.V.
Responsible consultants	Dr. Dorothee Groeger, Patrick Heinzer

Programme	English Language Education		
Degree	Master of Education		
Extent	40 credits (= 60 ECTS credits)		
Length of studies	4 semesters		
Language	English/Bahasa		
Start Study programme	2014		
Maximum capacity of students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of entering students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of graduates	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
* reference period:			
Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>		
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
No. reaccreditation			

Programme	Applied Linguistics		
Degree	Master of Applied Linguistics		
Extent	40 credits (= 60 ECTS credits)		
Length of studies	4 semesters		
Language	English/Bahasa		
Start Study programme	2001		
Maximum capacity of students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of entering students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of graduates	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
* reference period:			
Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>		
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
No. reaccreditation			

Programme	Language Education Science		
Degree	Doctor of Language Education Science		
Extent	50 credits		
Length of studies	4 semesters		
Language	English/Bahasa		
Start Study programme	2012		
Maximum capacity of students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of entering students	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
Average number* of graduates	/	Per Semester <input type="checkbox"/>	Per Year <input type="checkbox"/>
* reference period:			
Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>		
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
No. reaccreditation			

Content

I. Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	7
I. Preamble	10
II. Accreditation procedure.....	10
1. Criteria.....	10
2. Approach and methodology	10
III. General Information on the University	11
IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....	12
1. Quality of the Curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme.....	12
2. Procedures for Quality Assurance	18
3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students / Learning and Assessment of Students	20
4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification / Legal Status, Admission and Certification	26
5. Teaching Staff / Academic Level of Supervisory Staff.....	30
6. Learning Resources and Student Support / Support and Research Environment	32
7. Information / Public Information	34
V. Recommendations of the panel of experts.....	36

Decision of the Standing Commission

on the programmes

“English Language Education” (Bachelor of Education)

“English Language Education” (Master of Education)

“Applied Linguistics” (Master of Applied Linguistics)

“Language Education Science” (Doctor of Language Education Science)

offered by Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the Standing Commission in its 10th meeting on 30 August 2021, the Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes **“English Language Education” (Bachelor of Education)**, **“English Language Education” (Master of Education)** and **“Applied Linguistics” (Master of Applied Linguistics)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The study programme **“Language Education Science” (Doctor of Language Education Science)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia** is accredited according to the AQAS criteria for PhD programmes.

The accreditation is unconditional.

The study programmes comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version.

2. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2027**.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

All programmes

1. Students receive feedback on the results of the student’s questionnaire via their student representative in the respective committees. UNY should inform students directly about the questionnaire’s results.
2. A clear outline of teaching methods in the course descriptions would enable the programmes to demonstrate the great variety of teaching.
3. When further developing the programmes, a greater integration of cultural/literary studies and media studies should be considered. In order to do so, the experts recommend recruiting teaching staff with a background in these areas and thereby increasing the diversity of teaching staff in the programmes.
4. Staff training should put an emphasis on digital and media skills as well as cooperative and communicative approaches to teaching and classroom management.

Bachelor in “English Language Education”

5. It is recommended that programme designers integrate interactive communicative skill development to a greater degree. Such an approach could combine oral and listening courses to an oral communication course; and the reading and writing courses could become a joint written communication course.

Bachelor and Master in “English Language Education”

6. To allow even more flexibility and academic freedom for students, more room should be given to programme-specific elective courses.

All Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes

7. In the programmes, training in communicative and intercultural skills could be strengthened. This may be achieved by integrating even more digital learning tools and literary and intercultural aspects.
8. Being one of the strengths of the programmes, practical elements should be outlined more clearly in the documentation – both in the course descriptions as well as in the marketing of the programmes.
9. Being important for the employability of graduates, entrepreneurial skills should be fostered more prominently, e.g. as elective courses, in the programmes.
10. References should be updated for all courses.

Master in “Applied Linguistics”

11. The programme could benefit from introducing current topics in forensic linguistics and/or medical linguistics.
12. It is recommended that the grade for the journal publication is generally assigned based on the paper quality and not on the journal type.
13. An update of discipline-specific software is recommended.

Doctoral programme in “Language Education Science”

14. Being the scientific lingua franca, English language competences of teaching staff should be strengthened to create further possibilities for the internationalisation of the programme.
15. The programme should strive to increase the use of mixed methods (qualitative and quantitative) in research.
16. The university should further facilitate the attendance of students and staff at international conferences, e.g. via online formats.
17. It is recommended to mention the implicitly fostered skills, such as critical thinking and autonomous learning, explicitly in the course descriptions.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT
ON THE PROGRAMMES
ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (MASTER OF EDUCATION)
APPLIED LINGUISTICS (MASTER OF APPLIED LINGUISTICS)
LANGUAGE EDUCATION SCIENCE (DOCTOR OF LANGUAGE EDUCATION SCIENCE)
OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI YOGYAKARTA**

Visit to the university: 14 – 17 June 2021

Panel of Experts:

Prof. Dr. Jennifer Schluer	Chemnitz University of Technology, Faculty of Humanities
Prof. Dr. Laurenz Volkmann	Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Faculty of Arts
Eka Firmansyah, M. Pd.	SMAN 14 Bandung, Indonesia (labour market representative)
Elif Benli	Student of Heinrich Heine University Düsseldorf (student representative)

Coordinators:

Dr. Dorothee Groeger, Patrick Heinzer AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the programmes in English Language Education (Bachelor), English Language Education (Master), Applied Linguistics (Master) and Language Education Science (Doctor of Language Education Science) offered by Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta (UNY).

1. Criteria

The programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to a programme.

2. Approach and methodology

The initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in June 2020.

The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In November 2020, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the programmes and an appendix.

The appendix included e.g.:

- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs).
- CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors
- Information on student services
- Core information on the main library

- academic regulations

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in February 2021.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 7 May 2020.

The nomination of the panel of expert

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in March 2021 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

The preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

The site visit

After a review of the Self Evaluation Report, a virtual site visit to the University took place 14 – 17 June 2021. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

The report writing

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

The decision

The report, together with the comments of the department, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, on 30 August 2021 the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation. AQAS forwarded the decision to the Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. The Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In September 2021, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General Information on the University

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta (UNY) was established as a teacher training institute in 1964 and received full university status in 1999, now offering non-education programmes as well. The university is organised into

seven faculties which offer programmes at Diploma, Bachelor, Master and doctoral level, 112 in total. Student numbers as per December 2019 stand at circa 27,700.

The university is governed by a rector and four vice rectors (for academic issues, general and financial issues, students and alumni, planning and cooperation). As two supporting institutes, UNY has established a Research and Community Service Institute and a Quality Assurance and Educational Development Institute.

As outlined by the university, it follows a “Tri Dharma” approach, i.e. the university is engaged in teaching, research and community services.

According to its strategic plan, UNY pursues four strategic policies that are directed to (1) be an educational quality reference, (2) grow creativity and innovation, (3) strengthen students’ competitiveness and (4) improve academic reputation. Key indicators set to monitor the achievement of these goals are formulated as 10 strategic targets. The Strategic Plan is transferred into Faculty Strategic Plans.

The programmes to be accredited are affiliated with the Faculty of Languages and Arts (Bachelor and Master) and the Graduate School (doctoral degree). Due to national regulations, the doctoral programme will be relocated to the Faculty of Languages and Arts within two years. The faculty is headed by a dean and 3 vice deans who are supported by senates, a quality assurance unit and several administrative units. The faculty offers 11 Bachelor’s programmes and five Master’s programmes. The Bachelor’s programme in English Language Education is the largest programme of the faculty concerning student numbers.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the Curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.</i></p> <p><i>The curriculum’s design is readily available and transparently formulated.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.2]</i></p>	<p><i>The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.</i></p> <p><i>The curriculum’s design is readily available and transparently formulated.</i></p>

Description

UNY uses a credit system which specifies allocated time to different learning formats provided in 16 face-to-face weekly meetings over one semester: one credit of *theoretical courses* represents 200 minutes (50 minutes face-to-face per week, 50 minutes of structured assignments, and 100 minutes of independent assignments), one credit of *seminars* 170 minutes (100 minutes presentation and 70 minutes of independent assignment per



week) and one credit of *practicum* 170 minutes per week. The majority of courses offered in the Bachelor's and Master's programmes have two or three credit units. A comparison to ECTS credits is provided in the SER.

According to UNY, a link between research and teaching is common to all programmes. Students shall be equipped with knowledge and skills in conducting research and writing research reports according to their qualifications. Furthermore, students are supposed to be encouraged to do research on issues related to an umbrella topic set by their lecturers. Some students are involved in lecturers' research as members and/or assistants in their research groups. All programmes have a final thesis.

The **Bachelor's programme** in "**English Language Education**" is designed to qualify students to become competent professionals in English language teaching and its learning; they are supposed to be able to transfer knowledge from English to Indonesian (and vice versa) and be able to provide English language services for a vast array of applications. In particular, the objectives are defined into 15 programme learning outcomes which are divided into four aspects, attitude, knowledge, generic skills and specific skills.

Graduates are supposed to work as e.g. professional English teachers, ELT material developers, EL assessment tools developers, interpreters/translators or researchers in ELT and English language. Elements which support the employability of students are highlighted by UNY to be e.g. courses that equip students with the skills required in professional settings such as "Writing for Business Communication" and "Speaking in Professional Contexts", courses that give students the knowledge and practice in entrepreneurship and business such as "Entrepreneurship" and "Program Development of Business English", courses such as "Translating and Interpreting" introducing the students to the business of translating and interpreting or the invitation of guest lecturers who share their experience in applying and working in specific jobs/careers.

The curriculum, as outlined in the SER, covers seven semesters and includes 83 courses which fall into the categories university stream courses (eight compulsory courses offered to all students of UNY), basic education courses (four compulsory courses that equip students with basic theories on educational practice), faculty courses (two compulsory courses: cultural appreciation and foreign language where students can choose one out of five languages) and subject-specific/expertise courses. The subject-specific courses cover 49 courses and four electives where students can choose from the topics of English for Children, Linguistics, Translation, ELT and Business English. Furthermore, the programme includes a teaching practicum in which students can gain experience in teaching at schools. Towards the end of their studies, students are required to publish their thesis in a journal managed by the study programme.

Based on QA results the programme has introduced regular meetings once per semester to monitor students' thesis progress and to provide help and guidance.

With the **Master's programme** in "**English Language Education**" graduates will be qualified to contribute to the development of English instruction, the advancement of theories and practices of English language teaching and learning, the curriculum and materials development that supports the use of English as a means of global communication as well as the advancement of instructional technology to meet stakeholders' needs to support the improvement of teaching and learning outcomes of English as a global language.

In particular, graduates should demonstrate the ability to develop EFL curricula innovatively and creatively, to understand teaching, learning and media both in theory and practice in response to current trends and the increasing demand of society using inter-/multidisciplinary perspectives. Furthermore, they should be able to communicate and disseminate research findings and innovations in the field of English Language Education in an EFL context.

According to the SER the programme prepares for various careers such as English language teachers, English curriculum and materials developers, researchers in English language education or ELT media developers.

The outlined curriculum consists of 14 courses with a total of 38 credits of compulsory courses and two credits of elective courses (choice of one out of three). The compulsory courses consist of three foundation courses and 10 subject-specific/expertise courses which are exclusive to the programme and which include the thesis. The foundation courses are offered to all Master students at UNY and cover “Philosophy of Science”, “Educational Research Methods” and “Statistics”. According to UNY, the distribution of courses considers the needs of the students in that in semester three students collect data for their research to write their thesis. Students are required to publish their thesis in a nationally accredited journal or an international journal.

According to UNY, evaluations have shown that alumni have difficulties in contributing and/or participating in international forums which is why the programme encourages students to participate in one international event, ideally organised by UNY.

The profile of the graduates of the **Master’s programme** in “**Applied Linguistics**” is centred on the professions linguist, language educator and translator. The aim of the programme is to convey in-depth theoretical, methodological and applied knowledge and skills in Applied Linguistics and foster inter-, multi-, and transdisciplinary research. Graduates are qualified to produce ethical academic works in various formats and international forums. As specialisations for students, the programme offers three specialisations, namely language teaching, literature education and translation.

The programme learning outcomes are defined according to knowledge and specific skills related to the academic discipline such as being able to apply Applied Linguistics theories, methods and technology to great details or being able to evaluate knowledge and skills in the fields of linguistics, literature and translation to exhibit new ideas and according to attitudes, as well as according to general skills such as being able to independently increase one’s own learning capacity through the use of various media.

As the Master’s programme in “English Language Education”, the curriculum includes three compulsory foundation courses for all Master students and expertise courses exclusively offered for the programme. These courses cover “Linguistic Theory”, “Literary Theory”, “Critical Discourse Analysis”, “Corpus Linguistics”, “Scientific Writing” and the thesis. The specialisation is implemented in five additional courses. Students are required to publish their thesis in a nationally accredited journal or an international journal.

Graduates of the **doctoral programme** in “**Language Education Science**” are described with the following profile: they are able to develop language education knowledge creatively and innovatively through research applying an inter-/multi-/transdisciplinary approach and evaluating ICT developments to improve language education, they are capable to manage, lead and develop research employing an inter-/multi-/transdisciplinary approach that is creative, innovative, original and tested in reputable scientific forums and/or journals at national and international levels, they are able to manage, design, implement, monitor and evaluate creative and innovative education and training programmes to meet the demands of global users, and they are prepared to solve the problems and design programmes related to language education policies, employment policies, language education management and cross-sector entrepreneurship according to the needs of consulting service user partners.

According to UNY, the programme equips students to effectively communicate in national and international forums, to plan multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary language education policies, to produce findings in the field of language, to publish in national and international publications and to plan, implement, and evaluate formal and non-formal education programmes in the field of language education.

The curriculum covers 50 credits and includes different sets of courses: general courses by the School of Graduate Studies (seven credit units), study programme courses (29 credit units), required courses on subject matter (eight credit units), compulsory courses (six credit units). So-called “Matriculation Courses” are

designed for postgraduate students whose Master's degree is not related to language education and they cover twelve credit units.

Students have to write a dissertation. Supervision for research is provided by associate professors and professors. According to UNY, the schedule of the individual research project and supervision is agreed upon by the student and his/her supervisors. Students must publish their doctoral project in international journals.

UNY also offers a research-based doctoral programme in which students may not take any courses but focus only on their research. Admission to this programme requires a higher GPA and a recommendation from the prospective supervisor.

Experts' Evaluation

Bachelor & Master Degree Programmes

The desired qualifications are clearly stated for the Bachelor's/Master's programmes and can be described in terms of a dynamic spiral curriculum with deepening layers of complexity. Students first acquire skills and competences in the fields of the traditional "four skills" reading, writing, speaking and listening, with a specific focus on academic practices and application. Increasingly, communicative, EFL, linguistic, literary and cultural areas are focused on in the courses and students gain competences in various areas of knowledge, skills and attitudes. This competence development is not restricted to academic areas, but integrates interdisciplinary, transferable and practical competences as well as soft skills and personality development. The academic degrees awarded to the graduates correspond to the learning outcomes and the requirement of the appropriate levels of the European Qualifications Framework and they correspond to the respective levels of the national qualifications framework. In the case of the Bachelor's programme, this is a TOEFL score of 550, which is the (approximate) equivalent of the Common European Framework of References B2-level.

The Bachelor's programme's concept of progressing from receptive skills to productive skills (reading to writing, listening to speaking) could be shifted towards an even more integrative overall concept of skill development. It is recommended that programme designers integrate interactive communicative skill development to a greater degree. Such an approach could combine oral and listening courses to an oral communication course; and the reading and writing courses could become a joint written communication course (**Finding 5**).

The concept of "intercultural communicative competence" could be reflected in an increased integration of media (digital, but also film) and intercultural aspects in the design of modules of all programmes (**Finding 7**).

The site visit confirmed that alumni and representatives of the labour market praised the programmes as a "benchmark for other universities" and pointed out the efficiency of the programmes regarding the fostering of analytical skills, discipline, innovation, cooperation and the development of "well-rounded" personalities. Specifically, alumni praised the quality of the programmes with regard to developing students' practical knowledge and the transfer of social and spiritual values. Graduates are described as "ready to embark on their work". The uniqueness of the study programmes was seen in its positive interweaving of theoretical with practical elements.

The intended learning outcomes are updated regularly and quickly in response to new developments in linguistics, teaching and social fields as well as in the labour market. The response to the Covid-19 crisis was speedy and adequate by changing the format of courses and exams, e.g. introducing distant learning, implementing online testing and providing a sustainable online infrastructure. It seems recommendable that recent developments in online and hybrid teaching-learning formats remain reflected in the curricula, modules and course practices.

In their courses, students are to fulfil a broad palette of requirements, from short written assignments to oral presentations and written exams or term papers. Instructors make an effort to use cooperative and student-

oriented teaching and learning methods in their courses such as task-based learning and project work (see below). These teaching methods and practical components should be depicted more prominently in the module descriptions (**Finding 2**, see below). Instructors could be encouraged to use even more student-oriented methods fostering communicative and cooperative skills.

Workload and requirements are challenging and demanding, but are perceived as “doable” by the students (see below). The requirements for the final theses (Bachelor and Master) are transparently stated and students are given adequate instructions and support. There is a broad scope of topics and methodologies as displayed by sample theses.

The curricular elements and their functions are well documented and kept up to date. The concept of a spiral progression is evident to the students. The programmes are densely designed, structured and demanding. Formal and informal support systems are in place. The instructors involved are extremely committed, providing guidance to students. For example, an idealised typical course plan is available, course or module requirements are documented, and instructors inform students at the beginning of courses about the specifics of assignments and requirements. To avoid spoon-feeding students and to allow for an even closer and more flexible preparation of students to changes in the labour market, the number of electives in the Bachelor’s and Master’s programme in “English Language Education” could be increased (**Finding 6**). In addition, literary and media studies as well as cultural and intercultural elements could be integrated to a higher degree in all programmes (**Finding 3**). An additional focus could be put on fostering critical thinking skills (e.g., critical media literacies or digital literacies). Moreover, to prepare students for the job-market, greater emphasis could be put on fostering entrepreneurial and leadership skills, especially in the Master’s degree, e.g. as an elective course (**Finding 9**). In accordance with the idea of a dynamic curriculum that is responsive to societal needs and research innovations, some further courses could be added as well. Notably, the Master of Applied Linguistics might be enriched by a course on forensic or medical linguistics, for instance (**Finding 11**). Likewise, the academic literature referenced and the reading list for all programmes should be kept up to date, including both local and international references (**Finding 10**).

The university is advised to make the programmes’ “unique selling point” more public and stress the positive integration of theory and practice, as displayed in opportunities for internships at schools during the programmes (seventh semester) and practically oriented projects such as micro-teaching (**Finding 8**).

Doctoral programme

The tightly structured doctoral programme attracts both national and international students and is committed to fostering academic skills through personal as well as institutional supervision and support. It successfully negotiates between the demands of incorporating and valuing local languages on the one hand and considering global practices of English as a lingua franca on the other. It is recommended that all instructors are given support in mastering academic English so they can communicate with international students and (co)publish in English in international journals (**Finding 14**, see below). Whenever possible, instruction and documents should be in English to make the programme even more attractive to international students and to prepare students for the international or internationalised labour market.

The doctoral programme is characterised by a densely designed system of flexible, individual and structured demands, control mechanisms, support, guidance and incentives. All elements are documented and made transparent to students. A careful screening process is implemented. Key milestones of doctoral research are embedded in a time plan. This plan covers the acquisition of methodological and general academic skills as well as skills needed for designing and working on the specific approach of the individual student’s doctoral thesis. Students document and self-assess their progress, supported by members of staff.

The topics of theses correspond with the programme's concept to interlace theoretical and practical aspects. An adequate methodological mix of both quantitative and qualitative methods should be developed further and be reflected in the methodologies used in the theses (**Finding 15**, see below).

Supervisors are extremely committed and do their best to ensure students' success. For example, supervisors offer regular courses on scientific/academic writing and organise "supervision camps" to ensure their students' successful progress. External supervisors and examiners add to the quality of the programme, as do visits by international scholars. However, the number of visiting professors from abroad could be increased. Supervisors and doctoral students actively cooperate to publish in national and international journals and students are given the chance to present their studies at international conferences. The university is encouraged to step up efforts towards internationalisation even more.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

For the further developments of the programmes the experts provide the following recommendations:

All programmes:

In the programmes, training in communicative and intercultural skills could be strengthened. This may be achieved by integrating even more digital learning tools and literary and intercultural aspects.

A clear outline of teaching methods in the course descriptions would enable the programmes to demonstrate the great variety of teaching.

When further developing the programmes, a greater integration of cultural/literary studies and media studies should be considered.

Being important for the employability of graduates, entrepreneurial skills should be fostered more prominently, e.g. as elective courses, in the programmes.

References should be updated for all courses.

Being one of the strengths of the programmes, practical elements should be outlined more clearly in the documentation – both in the course descriptions as well as in the marketing of the programmes.

Bachelor in "English Language Education":

It is recommended that programme designers integrate interactive communicative skill development to a greater degree. Such an approach could combine oral and listening courses to an oral communication course; and the reading and writing courses could become a joint written communication course.

Bachelor and Master in "English Language Education":

To allow even more flexibility and academic freedom for students, more room should be given to programme-specific elective courses.

Master in "Applied Linguistics":

The programme could benefit from introducing current topics in forensic linguistics and/or medical linguistics.

Doctoral programme in "Language Education Science":

Being the scientific lingua franca, English language competences of teaching staff should be strengthened to create further possibilities for the internationalisation of the programme.

The programme should strive to increase the use of mixed methods (qualitative and quantitative) in research.

2. Procedures for Quality Assurance

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The programme is subject to the higher education institution’s policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.</i></p> <p><i>A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]</i></p>	<p><i>The programme is subject to the higher education institution’s policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.</i></p> <p><i>A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]</i></p>

Description

The internal quality assurance system is based on national regulations and UNY’s Strategic Plan and internal regulations. The system is coordinated by a Quality Assurance Centre and is outlined to follow the PDCA-cycle. Six quality standards have been set for UNY which are to be implemented into the programmes. They are monitored by formative/diagnostic and summative evaluations. The first ones include regular meetings at the programme level (once a month) and the faculty level (four times a year). UNY outlines that results of evaluations are analysed by the QA team and reported to the top management at faculty level. In particular, the faculty management holds a coordination meeting in which the agenda includes discussing the electronic monitoring and evaluation results, which are based on regular online surveys at the beginning and the end of every semester. The discussion results in several recommendations. Respective units and study programmes then decide on actions responding to the recommendations.

As further diagnostic assessment UNY lists student satisfaction surveys, an exit survey, tracer studies, a monitoring on research and community services and an online survey on UNY stakeholders’ opinion. Results are said to be controlled and improvements will be made.

UNY outlines procedures for curriculum development as well as curriculum revision. The curriculum development includes the implementation of a Study Programme Development Team which defines a graduate profile, programme education objectives and programme learning outcomes.

Major revisions of curricula are undertaken every five years, minor revisions are said to be done annually, e.g. to revise the module handbook. According to the information in the SER, the revisions take into account



recommendations from the National Accreditation Board and suggestions from stakeholders (e.g. users, parents, educational and non-educational institutions). Besides that, revisions consider the dynamics of science, the demands of the job market and national and university policies.

Characteristics of the doctoral programme

Doctoral students are required to produce an ethics compliance statement prior to entering the university. Students' work including doctoral theses are required to pass similarity checks. Supervision regulations are set down in the Supervision Policy of Dissertations for Ph.D. students of UNY.

Experts' Evaluation

The procedures for quality assurance are very appropriate and well structured. There is a densely structured system of evaluations and feedback loops, including informal feedback communication during course sessions. Students are encouraged to give informal feedback before, during and after sessions and have reported that staff respond positively and quickly to suggestions. Formal evaluations and feedback from the labour market are extremely positive. Regular and on-going programme evaluations are implemented.

In particular, the quality of study courses is monitored through the so-called "e-monev questionnaire", in which the students are asked about their workload in general, its suitability regarding learning outcomes, and how it compares to the workload in other courses, as well as the effective time normally spent on coursework outside the class in one week. This is a compulsory assessment at the beginning and the end of the semester; only after students have assessed their classes, will they be able to access their semester scores. The results are overall good, showing that the students are not currently over-worked.

Generally, the e-monev surveys mainly consist of four-point rating scales, but also contain space for open comments. The results are summarised and handed to the head of the programmes and the lecturers. In case lecturers underperform, they will receive further training. Yet, overall, the results are usually good, without any unexpected deviations. The suggestions made by the students are taken seriously and incorporated into the dynamic curriculum whenever appropriate. Students, however, cannot directly access the results, but can receive them indirectly via the student representative association. It would be preferable if the students could see the results directly for their class feedback, and if it were made sure that every student knows that they can view the feedback results (**Finding 1**).

There is a clear communication of assessment formats before courses start. The university uses input from external and international experts to improve assessment methodologies, including self-assessment and peer-assessment methods for students, which supports them in developing critical thinking skills.

Students are also encouraged to provide feedback directly via discussions and oral feedback, since informal feedback is often more helpful than formal feedback. This is especially effective in small classes and groups.

Students and the labour market are involved in the quality-assurance procedures for the programmes as well. Experiences from student advisory bodies/groups are used for the enhancement of the programmes. The results of quality-assurance procedures lead to concrete measures to enhance quality and address identified problems.

Procedures are in place to safeguard academic integrity and prevent academic fraud within the programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

For the further developments of the programmes the experts provide the following recommendation:

Students receive feedback on the results of the student’s questionnaire via their student representative in the respective committees. UNY should inform students directly about the questionnaire’s results.

3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students / Learning and Assessment of Students

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.</i></p> <p><i>Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.</i></p> <p><i>Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.3]</p>	<p><i>The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.</i></p> <p><i>Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.3]</p>

Description

Learning methods at UNY are described as being outcome-based. Learning is fostered mainly via face-to-face lectures using project-based learning and active learning such as discussion, presentation, group work, performance, practice, assignments and seminars. Furthermore, the learning process is said to be carried out online using a blended-learning approach.

UNY provides guidelines and checklists to assist students in achieving the course learning outcomes, such as a checklist to review the components of a course syllabus, a guide to writing an academic paper or a guide to proposing a development model of language learning.

Furthermore, UNY applies a continuous evaluation system covering the learning achievement and learning process evaluations. Evaluation is conducted in semesters three and six for the Bachelor’s degree, in semester 3 for the Master’s degrees and in semester six for the doctoral degree. It includes the number of minimum units of credits and the minimum grade point average achieved. The result of the evaluation is sent to the students and academic supervisors.

International students receive help and may participate in a structured programme by UNY to foster language skills. Teaching staff is supposed to be trained in offering teaching and learning methods to students with special needs based on a handbook for disability services, which includes all services offered to students with special needs.

UNY confirms that regulations and procedures for students’ complaints and appeals are in place. The Faculty of Languages and Arts governs the academic aspects of teaching schedules, examination schedules, the use of teaching resources and teaching facilities.

To measure the achievement of the learning outcomes, a summative assessment is carried out at the end of the semester or at the end of a lesson. In order to participate in the final examination, students must have attended 75 % of class hours. Other assessment techniques are described by UNY, such as mid-term examinations, observations, practicums, assignments and projects.



The administration of the final examination is under the responsibility of a final examination committee appointed by the faculty in the case of undergraduate programmes and appointed by the graduate programme in the case of graduate programmes.

All rules and regulations concerning the assessment of students are provided in the Academic Regulations.

Doctoral programme

In the doctoral programme, independent study and research is applied, which means that students are assigned to search for literature and expand as well as deepen their knowledge on previous research studies in journals that are related to their dissertation. The students also learn, discuss, and present the results of their research studies.

Doctoral students are assigned two or more supervisors, so-called “promoters” for their research. According to UNY, the schedule on the individual research project and supervision is agreed upon between students and promoters.

The promoter’s main roles are providing advice and guidance on how to organise, produce and improve the dissertation which includes suggesting preliminary readings, planning primary and secondary studies needed in the dissertation, assisting in selecting suitable research methods, suggesting improvement on the presentation of the dissertation, advising approach, scope, questions to ask to guide the study, and the research design. In the dissertation defence, promoters assist students to accept suggestions from examiners and guide in the revision of their dissertation.

Based on the supervision policy, an individual supervision schedule is set by agreement between the promoters and the student. Aspects such as methods of communication, draft submission, feedback provision, supervision meetings and the clear description of students’ and promoters’ rights and obligations are outlined to be agreed prior to supervision.

In the doctoral programme, students have to pass a dissertation proposal examination which assesses the feasibility of the research problem being studied, the originality of the research problem and problem-solving stages, the depth of the research problem as well as the significances of theoretical and practical research and the use of scientific language and grammar.

The final dissertation examination consists of two stages, i.e. a closed and an open examination. Both stages of the dissertation examination are held orally in front of the examiners, i.e. the chairman, secretary, promotor, co-promotor, examiners from inside and outside UNY.

Experts’ Evaluation

Overall, all programmes provide detailed information about the intended learning outcomes. The descriptions in the module handbooks are clear and comprehensive and thus make the goals of each individual course fully transparent. This was repeatedly confirmed by the students and staff during the site visit. The students are familiarised with the learning goals, the required assignments and assessment procedures in the very first session of each course. This way, they can schedule their time investment for the different courses well in advance and prepare for their examinations. Despite the breadth and density of the curricula, the workload is perceived as manageable. Moreover, both students and staff highlight that there is room for negotiation regarding the course contents and that the curricula are flexibly adapted based on students’ needs, the evaluation results and societal developments. For instance, the submitted programme documents already showed adjustments with regard to digitalisation as a result of the Covid-19 pandemic. Teaching, learning, assessment and grading was done online. For the future, the university considers hybrid approaches that could seize the potentials of both face-to-face and digital teaching. It utilises BeSmart as its internal learning platform as well as Glacier (Global Access for Independent Learning) that can also be used externally. Moreover, UNY cited

Zoom for the live delivery of lectures, but also other tools, such as WebEx and Google Classroom. Crucially, the feasibility of all learning, teaching and assessment depends on the availability of resources, as will be detailed further in Chapter 6. UNY ensures that students have access to sufficient resources before, during and after the pandemic by granting access to a digital library, Eduroam, Microsoft Office as well as programme-specific software. Furthermore, to prevent plagiarism, all submitted work is checked by means of the TurnItIn software.

During the site visit, a variety of assignment types and assessment procedures was reported by the students and staff. The SER, however, was not explicit about the learning, teaching and assessment methods, whereas the site visit was insightful. During the discussions, the staff promptly provided numerous examples of their teaching, learning and assessment procedures and submitted additional materials to complement the report. This included a variety of tasks as well as assignments completed by students of the different programmes, such as presentations, reports, project work and reflection tasks. Thus, even though the tightly structured programmes might suggest otherwise, UNY supports student-centred learning. Likewise, the separation of different skills as outlined in Chapter 1 implied a rather traditional approach, which in fact proved to be more integrated in practice. Regarding the learning methods, the community service approach deserves special mention. It is not only one of the three responsibilities of each lecturer (in addition to teaching and research), but also an opportunity for the students to gain insight into their potential future job or to get into contact with potential future employers.

In line with the various learning goals, not only the teaching methods vary, but also the assessment procedures. They comprise different kinds of formative and summative assessments, i. e. of assessment for learning and assessment of learning. Thus, beyond the mid- and end-term examinations, there are several smaller assignments, project work and presentations as well as room for peer reflection and self-reflection. There seems to be a good atmosphere between students and staff that allows for feedback in multiple directions. Students are encouraged to contribute their ideas and engage in critical thinking, report their problems and suggestions to the lecturers in both formal and informal ways. They may talk to the lecturers directly whenever needed.

In case students fail an exam, they can make use of the re-sit option. For that purpose, UNY offers the so-called “special semester” between the actual semesters. Moreover, the UNY language centre provides services to the students and staff in order to help them improve. This includes language training in English, but also the possibility for independent learning through the provision of learning resources.

As the programme-related documents did not fully clarify this variety of learning, teaching and assessment approaches, it is recommended to elaborate on them in the programme descriptions (**Finding 2**, see above) and to continue using more student-centred, communicative, self-directed and cooperative learning approaches. In line with the idea of a dynamic curriculum that responds to changing demands, it is expected that future curricula will likewise quickly adapt to recent developments.

Bachelor & Master degree programme in “English Language Education”

Especially in the Bachelor’s programme of English Language Education, the curriculum is densely structured and demanding. Nevertheless, the learning experience and quality of the education are seen as positive by current and former students. They value the interaction between lecturers and students that goes beyond the delivery of knowledge and also includes many practical components. From the course descriptions, however, the connection between theory and practice did not become fully evident, even though it turned out to be an outstanding feature of the Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes in “English Language Education”. The staff gave examples, such as micro-teaching, the development of teaching materials and best practices for teaching, classroom observations and the analysis of recorded classroom interactions as well as action research. Clearly, these practical components are highly important for future teachers and should therefore be described

in more detail in the module handbooks and as part of the public information that is visible to externals in order to attract potential future students (**Finding 8**, see above).

In line with the nature of the tasks and the learning goals, also collaborative and project-based learning as well as different methods of assessment are implemented. The exams do not only contain multiple-choice items, but also open-response questions. Apart from mid- and end-term tests, also portfolios and presentations are created, and papers are written. Moreover, students have the chance to engage in critical self-reflection and peer assessment. For this, the lecturer's assessment rubric is made available. Generally, the staff is willing to implement new ideas for assessment from colleagues as well as external (also international) experts. During the pandemic, the platform BeSmart was used to carry out quizzes and written exams, whereas Zoom or BigBlueButton (as part of the learning management platform) were available for oral exams (e.g. in pronunciation or speaking classes) and for the delivery of courses.

Overall, the aim is to assess students' achievement on the three dimensions of attitudes, knowledge and skills, and to interweave theory and practice. The literature cited in the course descriptions is comprehensive, but also contains several older references that should be updated or complemented by more recent resources (**Finding 10**, see above). The staff was responsive to this suggestion during the site-visit and strives to update their module descriptions in the near future. They explained that UNY has just ordered more recent books and that some old references are mainly used for critical discussion in relation to new approaches.

The class sizes and the student-staff ratio are regarded as highly appropriate. In the Bachelor's programme, the foundation classes have a maximum of 40 students, whereas the skills classes comprise 20 students and the practical classes (e.g. micro-teaching) about ten students. In the Master's programme, an average number of 20 to 25 students was adduced.

Given this good student-staff ratio, the learners feel supported throughout their studies. If needed, the students can take part in a writing camp or receive a timetable for supervision in order to finish their final thesis on time.

Master degree programme in "Applied Linguistics"

The Master of Applied Linguistics at UNY offers three concentrations, i.e. foreign language studies, translation and literature, and the teaching approaches and assignment types vary accordingly. Since the programme does not specifically focus on English as a target language but spans a larger variety of linguistic backgrounds and specialisations, teaching is not exclusively conducted in English. On the other hand, English has gained in importance as an international academic language across all subject fields, which is why a greater amount of English medium instruction is strived for. This would also help to attract more international students. To this end, UNY offers professional development courses to their staff in order to enhance their English language proficiency. Apart from these long-term efforts, a more immediate solution is the idea of bilingual team-teaching that is effectuated in some classes so that both domestic and international students can understand the contents. Moreover, lecturers may also engage in spontaneous language switches while explaining the contents. Finally, international students are also encouraged to learn Indonesian, which is in line with a multilingual policy.

Aside from the language of instruction, UNY provides written documents about the courses in English and issues the final diploma documents in English and Indonesian. Moreover, many assignments are done in English. In that regard, the requirement to write papers for submission to a (national) journal deserves special mention. If the paper is accepted in a national journal, an A- is assigned, and if it succeeds to be accepted by an international journal, the grade A is granted. If the paper is not accepted by a journal, the grade is presumed to be a B or B+ depending on the quality of the manuscript. Alternatively, students may also publish in conference proceedings. Moreover, since it always takes time until a paper is reviewed and eventually accepted, the lecturer can still revise the grade at a later point. Overall, it is recommended that the grade is generally

assigned based on the paper quality and not on the journal type, since also the standards of international journals may vary (**Finding 12**). The lecturers support the students throughout the publication process and are listed as second authors. In addition, they encourage their students to attend international conferences, such as the ones that are locally organised by UNY. The courses also foster the students' analytical skills, notably regarding quantitative data analysis. Yet, UNY also continuously strives to improve its courses and reported that they currently also integrate more qualitative research so as to cater for a greater spectrum of research goals.

Besides this strong research orientation, the Applied Linguistics programme is practically oriented. For instance, the foreign language education specialisation is concerned with topics of practical relevance for teachers, and in the translation concentration, there is a close collaboration with the association of translators in Indonesia. Moreover, projects are also done in collaboration with the tourism association in Jakarta. To further prepare the students for the labour market, it is recommended that students' entrepreneurial skills are strengthened (**Finding 9**). This way, the graduates can become employers themselves and create job opportunities for others. Furthermore, it is recommended to offer a few more specialised courses, such as forensic linguistics and medical linguistics, to reflect current needs (**Finding 11**, see above). UNY has immediately reacted to this recommendation based on its tracer study and plans to revise the curriculum accordingly.

The teacher-student ratio in the programme is 1:12 and thus allows for adequate student support. There are usually 20 to 24 students in each class that engage in different kinds of individual and collaborative assignments. These include project work and project reports, presentations, take-home assignments, quizzes, exams and papers. The software programmes that are available to the students to complete their assignments are Microsoft Office, Endnote/Mendeley (final thesis), SPSS (quantitative research), NVivo (qualitative re-search) and AntConc (corpus linguistics), for instance. It is recommended that the breadth of programmes be further increased, depending on the course topics (**Finding 13**).

Doctoral programme in "Language Education Science":

In the doctoral programme, there is a good support structure with a 1:12 to 1:15 staff-student ratio. The courses foster numerous relevant skills for conducting research and writing a thesis. Moreover, many skills are conveyed implicitly in the courses, such as critical thinking and autonomous learning. It is recommended to mention these implicitly fostered skills explicitly in the course descriptions (**Finding 17**). Regarding the methods, UNY explained that there has been a strong quantitative orientation in line with the educational research tradition. Yet, in recent years, the lecturers strive to integrate more qualitative methods to cater for a greater variety of research topics. Accordingly, also the software spectrum might be widened. So far, it mainly includes SPSS for statistics and NVivo for qualitative analysis. As with the other programmes of the cluster, UNY quickly adapts to changes, e.g. regarding the scheduling of the courses or the inclusion of further modules. In that respect, they value the feedback from students, employers and external experts.

Given the variety of linguistic specialisations, the language of instruction is not entirely in English. It used to be mainly Bahasa Indonesian, but UNY is committed to increasing the percentage of lectures in English as an academic language. UNY strives to foster the English language skills of the staff as part of their professional development and by adopting a team-teaching approach. More precisely, UNY pairs a senior lecturer with a junior lecturer who demonstrates higher English language proficiency. In class, the junior lecturers do not merely act as translators, but they likewise learn from the experience of the senior. Furthermore, all syllabi are gradually designed in English, while some are still in Bahasa Indonesian. This on-going transformation process is monitored by the department head.

On the other hand, the learning experience was positively described as a melting pot of cultures and nationalities and of students with different work experiences and career goals. Likewise, the positive, encouraging relationship with the lecturers, professors and supervisors was highlighted by the doctoral students and

graduates. They also felt well-informed about the expected requirements, with deadlines being announced well before the due date. The doctoral students set a focus depending on their specialisation, e.g. English, national or local language teaching in the language teaching specialisation. They engage in project work, develop a plan and timeline for it, search for suitable references about their topic, conduct a needs analysis or collect other relevant data. They present their project and write a paper about it. Throughout this process, they receive support from the lecturers and supervising staff. Moreover, self- and peer-assessment are fostered in the courses. This mutual social support and encouragement is considered beneficial for successful completion. In case students need special writing support, writing camps are offered to them. This is also meant to help the students finalise their doctoral thesis on time. UNY reported that most students need longer than expected, mostly because they face personal problems or are busy in their job as teachers, for instance. The graduate school monitors students' progress and enquires about possible reasons for delays. Some professors ask their students for a semester plan, which they will have to re-visit at the end of the semester to assess their progress or to discuss the reasons for delays with their instructors.

According to the university's policy, the maximum time for completion of the doctoral degree is 14 semesters. To obtain the doctorate, three examinations need to be passed. First, there is a preliminary assessment of the entire work as to whether it fulfils the requirement for a dissertation. External examiners are already part of this preliminary assessment. Second, there is a closed examination, which is the major assessment of the thesis. Overall, six examiners are involved in the closed examination, including the supervisor from an external university, a supervisor from UNY and the chairperson of the examination committee. Finally, in the open examination, the students share their results and the promotion is granted to them. Sometimes journalists are invited to this examination if the student wishes to make the wider public aware of the results. The thesis defence is held in English by students majoring in English education and also all thesis documents are written in English. Also, journal articles may follow from the thesis. If passed, the doctorate is assessed as satisfactory, very satisfactory or summa cum laude.

For further dissemination of the results or work-in-progress, UNY realises the importance of fostering the doctoral students' participation at academic conferences. In the past, though, there was no funding for travel costs (but only subsidies for registration fees), which the university wants to improve in the future. However, UNY organises its own international conferences. They reported that in 2017, the Asia TEFL conference was hosted with 1,060 participants from 34 countries. Many of their students presented at that conference. Apart from that, the doctoral students prepare a paper for a conference presentation in the Language Education seminar. Moreover, the pandemic and resultant upsurge in international online conferences made a remote conference attendance possible for many students. Still, an improved support structure for attending international conferences would be desirable, which UNY recognises (**Finding 16**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

For the further developments of the programmes the experts provide the following recommendations:

All programmes:

A clear outline of teaching methods in the course descriptions would enable the programmes to demonstrate the great variety of teaching.

References should be updated for all courses.

Being one of the strengths of the programmes, practical elements should be outlined more clearly in the documentation – both in the course descriptions as well as in the marketing of the programmes.

Being important for the employability of graduates, entrepreneurial skills should be fostered more prominently, e.g. as elective courses, in the programmes.

Master in “Applied Linguistics”:

The programme could benefit from introducing current topics in forensic linguistics and/or medical linguistics.

It is recommended that the grade for the journal publication is generally assigned based on the paper quality and not on the journal type.

An update of discipline-specific software is recommended.

Doctoral programme in “Language Education Science”:

It is recommended to mention the implicitly fostered skills, such as critical thinking and autonomous learning, explicitly in the course descriptions.

The university should further facilitate the attendance of students and staff at international conferences, e.g. via online formats.

4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification / Legal Status, Admission and Certification

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.4]</p>	<p><i>The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.</i></p> <p><i>Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.4]</p>

Description

Admission

Students’ admission is managed and coordinated by the admission unit of UNY and it is based on national regulations and internal procedures, which are defined in the Standard Operational Procedure for Students Admission.

Admission to Bachelor’s programmes is granted via national selection and allocation procedures, so-called State University Entrance Selection and Joint Entrance Test for State Universities, as well as an Independent Entrance Test which is organized by UNY itself. The admission is classified into five categories, namely 1) academic achievement-based selection, 2) achievement-based selection, 3) portfolio-based selection, 4) computer-based test selection (CBT) with scholastic aptitude test and TOEFL-like test and 5) talent/skill scouting-based selection.

In addition to passing the entrance test, admission requirements for the Master’s programmes include a degree from a recognised and accredited institution with the minimum national accreditation grade of B with a GPA of no less than 3.00 and a TOEFL score of 550. Applicants must also hand in two recommendation letters from previous thesis supervisors or people who are able to acknowledge the applicant’s academic merit.



Additionally for the doctoral programme, applicants must have a relevant educational qualification in language education, literature or language, be it in the Indonesian language, one of the local languages such as Javanese and Sundanese or one of the foreign languages such as English, Arabic, German, French, and Japanese and they must attend an interview test. Applicants from a non-education study programme (e.g., literature, language) must take matriculation subjects within the first year of the programme. In case of the research-based doctoral programme, applicants must have a publication relevant to the proposal, a recommendation letter by their prospective supervisor and a GPA of 3.50/4.00.

According to UNY, the admission and selection procedures consider special characteristics of students with special needs.

Progression

As outlined in the SER, the Academic Rules of UNY define rules of conduct to ensure that the students' learning process and progress are supervised, monitored and evaluated. Students are allocated an academic supervisor and a continuous evaluation system covering learning achievement and learning process evaluations is in place (see above).

Recognition

Regulations and requirements concerning the transfer from other higher education institutions or any other credit transfer are defined by UNY's Academic Regulation.

Certification

UNY outlines that it hands out a Diploma Supplement which includes an academic certificate and an academic transcript.

Characteristics of the doctoral programme

UNY is a public university by mandate from the Government of the Republic of Indonesia ruled by the president decision No. 93/1999. Requirements and regulations governing doctoral programmes are provided in UNY's Academic Regulations and Supervision Policy of Dissertations for Ph.D. Students.

Experts' Evaluation

Bachelor & Master Degree Programmes

Admission

Formal requirements for admission at the level of Bachelor's/Master's programmes are clearly stated and available in published form. This is regulated in a Rector Regulation about Academic Rules of Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, about Students Admission Process and Requirements and a Rector Regulation about Admission Service. Furthermore, the specific prerequisites relevant for the individual study programme (e.g. language skills and professional experience) reflect substantive qualities needed for a successful completion of the programme and are included in the published admissions criteria.

The selection procedure for the study programmes follows defined criteria and procedures that are publicly available. With regard to the admission procedure for the Bachelor's programme in "English Language Education", the types of the admission procedure, which is classified into Seleksi Nasional Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri (SNMPTN) (the State University Entrance Selection), Seleksi Bersama Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri (SBMPTN) (the Joint Entrance Test for State Universities), and Seleksi Mandiri (SM) (the Independent Entrance Test) are regulated both in a Rector Regulation and the Regulation by the Ministry of Education and Culture.

For additional information, Seleksi Nasional Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri (SNMPTN) (the State University Entrance Selection) is nationally coordinated by the Ministry of National Education and Culture through particular assigned universities. Meanwhile, Seleksi Bersama Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri (SBMPTN) (the Joint Entrance Test for State Universities) is a computer-based test which is centrally organized by a specific admission body supervised by the Ministry of Education and Culture. Finally, Seleksi Mandiri (SM) (the Independent Entrance Test) is organized internally by the university admission unit. The admission is classified into five categories: 1) academic achievement-based selection; 2) achievement-based selection; 3) portfolio-based selection; 4) computer-based test selection (CBT) with scholastic aptitude test and TOEFL-like test; 5) talent/skill scouting-based selection.

Furthermore, to admit new students to the English Language Education study programmes at both the Bachelor and Master levels and the Master's programme in "Applied Linguistics", the admission unit of the university, which closely works with the Rector and Vice Rector for Academic Affairs, has determined general and adequate requirements.

Progression

It is ensured by the establishment of several academic mechanisms that the students successfully progress in their studies. These academic mechanisms are, among others, 1) determining the study load, 2) having academic supervision for verifying the study load, 3) support in joining lectures and how lectures are supposed to be conducted, 4) monitoring students' academic milestones, 5) supporting academic life of students with special needs and international students, and 6) providing opportunities for student mobility.

Information on how lectures are supposed to be conducted is provided in a Rector Regulation about Academic Rules of Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. The rules of conduct for lectures ensure that students' learning process and progress are supervised, monitored and evaluated. Upon enrolment in the study programmes, students are allocated their own academic advisor. The assigned academic advisors facilitate the students' academic life such as supervising their study load for each semester, their active involvement in particular inter- and intra-collegiate activities, and academic problems or challenges students face.

Recognition

Regulations and processes for the recognition of courses/modules/credits gained at other higher education institutions and outside of the university are documented in a Rector Regulation. Furthermore, Master's and doctoral programme students from other state or non-state higher education institutions can join the transfer programme to UNY Graduate School if they meet the requirements.

Certification

Students' study completion is recognised by thesis examination and publication. At the Bachelor level, students are required to publish their thesis in a journal managed by the study programme. At the Master level, students are required to publish their thesis in a nationally accredited journal or an international journal.

All four programmes hand out to graduates three main documents on the graduation. The documents are 1) academic certificate, 2) academic transcript, and 3) graduation certificate (testamur) which contains the university logo, university name, statement of awarding degree, name of the graduate, place and date of birth, degree awarded, study programme, place and date of issuance, signature of the Dean/Graduate School Director and Rector of Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, and the relevant level of the Indonesian Qualifications Framework.

Another certification that graduates receive is a Diploma Supplement which supports an academic certificate and an academic transcript (Surat Keterangan Pendamping I-jasah/SKPI). This letter acknowledges students' profile of achievement they have gained during their study period.

Doctoral programme

Degree Awarding Powers

UNY is a state university with the right to award doctorates.

Admission

Formal requirements for admission into the doctoral programme are clearly stated and available in published form. This is mentioned in a Rector Regulation about Academic Rules of Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. Furthermore, the specific prerequisites relevant for the programme (e.g. language skills and professional experience) reflect substantive qualities needed for a successful completion of the programme and are included in the published admission criteria. In “Language Education Science”, the recruitments system includes the entrance test (basic academic potential test and English skills), portfolio and CV on academic experiences and research. The interview is mandatory, especially focusing on the research topic. Some doctoral students of the programme have already obtained their Bachelor’s degree at UNY and lecturers use conferences and contact with alumni to screen for potential doctoral candidates.

As mentioned above, specific requirements address particular needs of each programme. The doctoral programme’s applicants are required to submit a TOEFL score of 550. In addition, applicants are required to attend an interview test. To facilitate the process of students’ admission, the university has made information on students’ admission requirements available for the public on the website. Potential students can thus access information concerning academic activities such as the offered courses, the module handbook, and international mobility (credit transfer) at the university, faculty, graduate school or programme study websites.

Progression

It is ensured by the establishment of several academic mechanisms that the students successfully progress in their studies. To support doctoral students’ progression, especially in their research study, a course of Language Education Research Methodology is provided in the first semester. In the course, students are provided with knowledge of the nature and domains of educational research, identifying issues in language education research, types and paradigms of research, educational research procedures, practices on applying language education research methods covering population/research subjects, data collection techniques, instruments, analysis, and interpretation of results. This course allows students to explore their field of interest and present that in class to acquire feedback from the lecturers and their peers.

Doctoral students are also paired with supervisors (promoters) who have an expertise in the field of the students’ proposed study. A promoter and one to two co-promoters are allocated for each student.

In order to urge the students to graduate on time and to finish their dissertation, the supervisor provides a kind of supervision camp held every weekend (see above). This is a very useful and commendable service.

Certification

When doctoral students are about to finish their study, their study completion is recognised by thesis examination and publication. At the doctoral programme, students must publish their doctoral project in international journals.

Having completed their study, students receive the same documents as described above.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching Staff / Academic Level of Supervisory Staff

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.</i></p> <p><i>Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.5]</i></p>	<p><i>The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.</i></p> <p><i>Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.5]</i></p>

Description

The lecturer recruitment process is conducted based on government and university regulations, as stated by UNY. Minimum requirements are set at Master's degree for undergraduate programmes and doctoral degree for postgraduate programmes. Generally, teaching staff at UNY comprises lecturers, assistant professors, associate professors and professors who may be employed as permanent or non-permanent staff.

Lecturers of UNY are required to take part in a programme called Improvement of Basic Instructional Techniques Skills aiming to equip lecturers with student-centred teaching and learning management methods. In the academic field, UNY encourages teaching staff to take part in a series of training and workshops related to their scientific field. Workshops and guest lecturing activities shall be held periodically by UNY including speakers either from Indonesia or other countries. In addition, lecturers receive financial assistance to attend workshops.

Furthermore, it is stated that teaching staff is obliged to carry out research and publications.

As outlined in the SER, the Bachelor's programme of "English language education" has 35 lecturers consisting of three professors, four associate professors, 18 assistant professors and 10 lecturers.

In the Master's programme "English language education" 15 lecturers are carrying out teaching, of which three are professors, four associate professors, and eight assistant professors.

21 lecturers are affiliated with the Master's programme in "Applied Linguistics", namely eight professors, eleven associate professors and two assistant professors.

The teaching staff in the doctoral programme "Language Education Science" comprises twelve professors and nine associate professors.

Experts' Evaluation

Bachelor & Master Degree Programmes

The departments involved in recruiting new teaching and research staff for the programmes are advised to strictly continue recruiting well-qualified academics with the minimum requirement of a Master's degree for undergraduate programmes and doctoral degree for postgraduate programmes. Current teaching staff is adequately qualified for the achievement of the learning outcomes and the number of teaching staff and teaching



hours are documented and sufficient. The good student-teacher ratio is beneficial for good learning outcomes and for institutional as well as personal support of students. Staff appear as extremely committed, friendly in their interaction with students and take their responsibility to do community service seriously. Their overall workload appears as adequate.

The field of academic expertise of staff reflects a broad scope of linguistic (namely sociolinguistic and pragmalinguistic) as well as language and EFL related topics. In line with the experts' recommendation to broaden the programmes' academic content by integrating elements of intercultural learning, media and digital literacy and literary studies, it is recommended that new recruitment takes these additional areas into consideration (**Finding 3**, see above). This should be included in the continuity plan of the programmes.

Doctoral programme

Human resources involved in teaching within the programme are well documented and their academic qualifications and fields of expertise are clearly stated. Qualifications are appropriate. It is recommended that all staff acquire adequate English language skills to communicate internationally and that the programme ascertains a sound balance of qualitative and quantitative research (also with regard to the research methods favoured by participating professors) (**Finding 15**, see above).

The personnel are sufficient in number to safeguard supervision arrangements on the doctoral programme with an adequate student-supervisor ratio of 12 to 15 students per supervisor. External supervisors add to the quality of the programme. The programme is encouraged to increase the number of guest or visiting professors from Indonesia and abroad. In addition, online as well as analogue attendance of international conferences should be furthered even more (**Finding 16**, see above).

All programmes

There is a concept for staff development in place and staff take part in training for further development. It is recommended that such training covers digital and media skills as well as cooperative and communicative approaches to teaching and classroom management (**Finding 4**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

For the further developments of the programmes the experts provide the following recommendations:

All programmes:

When further developing the programmes, a greater integration of cultural/literary studies and media studies should be considered. In order to do so, the experts recommend recruiting teaching staff with a background in these areas and thereby increasing the diversity of teaching staff in the programmes.

Staff training should put an emphasis on digital and media skills as well as cooperative and communicative approaches to teaching and classroom management.

Doctoral programme in "Language Education Science":

The programme should strive to increase the use of mixed methods (qualitative and quantitative) in research.

The university should further facilitate the attendance of students and staff at international conferences, e.g. via online formats.

6. Learning Resources and Student Support / Support and Research Environment

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.</i></p> <p><i>Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.6]</i></p>	<p><i>Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.</i></p> <p><i>Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.6]</i></p>

Description

Learning resources and student support are outlined in a Rector’s Regulation by UNY and include both physical support, such as learning equipment and media, books and learning resources, buildings and rooms (e.g. classrooms, laboratories, sports, religious and health facilities, libraries and canteens), information and communication technology support, research support, and non-physical support (both academic and non-academic).

The Bachelor’s programme makes use of facilities of the Faculty of Languages and Arts, the Master’s and doctoral programmes are taught at the School of Graduate Studies. According to the SER, the buildings are equipped with lanes for wheelchair users, complemented with security and safety tools.

According to UNY, its library has more than 290,000 prints and four million electronic items. It has developed a digital catalogue system and subscribed to international journals (e.g., JSTOR, SPRINGER LINK, IEEE EXPLORE, EBSCO). Needs assessments with regard to book and material resources are carried out annually to further equip the library. Computers with internet access are available for use in the libraries, computer laboratories and ICT Centre, according to information in the SER.

Course content is outlined in a module handbook, which is reviewed by a curriculum committee, according to UNY. The procedure of updating module handbooks is regulated in the Academic Regulations.

According to UNY, a freshmen orientation programme is offered to all students which provides information about the service units and the programmes. Several student organisations and units shall provide guidance as well. A Student Centre building hosts student organisations and other facilities for extra-curricular activities.

Students receive support by their academic advisor, who is assigned at the beginning of their studies. Further support services highlighted by UNY are the Guidance and Counselling Service Unit and the Career Centre. Furthermore, there is a Sports and Health Centre, an ICT Centre and an International Office.

Students with below-standard TOEFL scores are given English trainings at the Language Centre of UNY. The centre also provides language translation and thesis draft language editing services.

Free Indonesian language courses and scholarship schemes are provided to international students.

The faculty has initiated and maintained a number of cooperation and partnerships with universities abroad, realised in different schemes such as visiting scholars and students exchange programmes. Facilitation to students related to national or international academic exchange programmes include open information sharing sessions, travel documents handling facilitation and student mobility grants.



To support students in developing their academic writing skills, UNY outlines that it provides students with both academic writing training for freshmen and compulsory subjects of scientific writing for Master and doctoral students. An ICT workshop aims at familiarising students with the digital academic information system and e-learning used at university.

Characteristics of the doctoral programme

As mentioned earlier, doctoral students have paired supervisors, so-called promotor, who have expertise in the field suited to the students' proposed study.

UNY claims that students are facilitated and encouraged to take part in national and international competitions, attend national and international academic gatherings like workshops, seminars and conferences relevant to their topic of study, refer and cite updated research through nationally and internationally reputed journals as well as through digital media and join a sandwich programme with overseas universities.

In order to facilitate students' research and foster research career, UNY defines several further methods that programmes provide for students, among others, the provision of a "Language Education Research Methodology and Multivariate Statistics" course, the visiting lecturer programmes which involve national and international researchers as well as efficient academic and administrative services which include publication facilitation/support in the form of a course of academic writing, workshops and language help, editing, and a coaching team. Furthermore, lecturers are required to involve students in their research and research groups.

Physical facilities to foster research are listed by UNY, among those micro teaching laboratories, computer laboratories and independent study rooms.

Experts' Evaluation

Students have access to digital libraries. Data shows that they are also constantly accessing these resources.

Undergraduate students are allowed to complete within twelve semesters. 36% of them graduate in time (in four years), some graduate within three years. Many students had difficulties with the timely graduation, which led to further curriculum improvements. It has been stated that the reasons for students not being able to finish their studies in time are not the courses themselves, but rather the thesis/dissertation or often personal problems, including some of the students working part-time, so it is difficult for them to reserve more time for their studies. There is no official part-time system set up at UNY, so it may be worth implementing one in order to support those students who also have to work besides their studies.

The university maintains a weekly offer to students for support guidance. Additionally, the professors themselves individually offer guidance meetings. For Master students, three to six semesters of time are allocated. Master students who do not finish in time receive support, and there is an acceleration programme to push students forward, provide guidance and training, especially in preparing the final thesis and conducting research. Thesis supervision is also provided online.

Overall, a lot of guidance is provided, which is very beneficial for the students and is something other universities should also implement. There is a very good student-teacher ratio in the programmes.

Students receive access to software packages they can use, including MS Office, Endnote/Mendeley (final thesis), SPSS (quantitative research), NVivo (qualitative research), and AntConc (corpus linguistics).

There is a Career Centre that helps students move on from their graduation into the world of employment. They provide information about companies, open vacancies and the respective requirement and support in the preparation of job interviews, for example, how to write application letters.

Some international students are present in the programmes, and UNY pursues the aim to have more international students, including providing good support to international students and having staff that is trained in helping them. To foster the mobility of students, guidance is provided.

Student diversity is considered when allocating, planning, and providing learning resources. The university also offers scholarships for students who lack financial means and students from the Eastern part of Indonesia. It also has a language centre that offers free English courses. Additionally, the university waives the tuition for students from low-income families. Finally, there is scholarship funding from the government available for disadvantaged students.

The students interviewed stated that they have statistics courses which support them in carrying out research and that lecturers also help them with studying abroad so that they have the chance to participate in workshops, tutorials, and field research in other countries. The university supports them by covering the fees, and students can also join courses of other universities online. They are also encouraged to publish articles, and the supervisors support them with their publications. Students are also participating in the research of their lecturers.

Overall, the students are satisfied about their studies and teachers. The course and module descriptions contain the learning expectations and expected self-learn time. The university offers a lot of resources for their students for this: Learning rooms, libraries, group rooms with good equipment and new PCs. The course rooms are modern, and the campus is very spacious, there are a lot of parks for students and the buildings are well kept up to standard.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information / Public Information

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.8]</p>	<p><i>Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.8]</p>

Description

Information on the programmes is provided in the academic handbook, leaflets, booklets and posters which are circulated by the respective units and study programmes. As the most common channel to inform the public about its endeavours, UNY defines its website and social media with information on both academic and non-academic aspects. Information is provided about programmes including their vision and mission, learning outcomes, programme education objectives, curriculum, assessment criteria, teaching staff, teaching and learning process, qualification awards, programme news and activities. A Board of Information and Documentation Service ensures that information is provided regularly.

For internal use, an internet-based information system has been established to access students' academic achievements, lecturers' performances (covering activities on teaching, researching, and community service), quality assurance processes and financial matters – restricted to the respective people involved.



Experts' Evaluation

Generally, UNY follows strategies for sharing information about the university to the public. The most commonly used channel is the university website. All information, both academic and non-academic, is shared via this site and can be accessed by the public. The specific information on study programmes including campus vision and mission, learning outcomes, programme education objectives, curriculum, assessment criteria, teaching staff, teaching and learning process, qualification awards, study programme news and activities can be easily obtained from each programme's website and its social media. The website is available in Indonesian and English, which is good to attract foreign students.

The second main channel for public information is printed documents such as academic handbook, leaflets, booklets, and posters which are circulated by the respective units and study programmes. The positive point is that these documents are also made available online via the website and social media. UNY, on certain occasions, also uses mass media such as newspaper and TV special feature programmes to dispatch important information to its stakeholders. It is beneficial for the public to access all UNY information easily, anywhere and anytime.

The activities above are in accordance with university regulations indicating that public information is provided and can be achieved in two modes: online and offline. Options for online inquiry responses include emails, telephone calls, and facsimiles whereas offline/onsite responses can be obtained via post mails and direct inquiries to the representative units/offices/programmes for which a number of staff are ready to assist. This staff is the one who is in charge of monitoring and updating public information needed by stakeholders. These units/offices/programmes are open daily on weekdays during the office hours.

Furthermore, complying with national regulations, UNY has a body responsible to assess and monitor the public information services, called Pejabat Pengelola Informasi dan Dokumentasi (PPID) or the Board of Information and Documentation Services that is regulated through Rector Regulation No. 19/2019 about UNY Public Information Services. The board has to ensure that the information is delivered in three ways: at all times, periodically, and right at the time the information is required.

Another positive aspect is that UNY through its PPID office has annually conducted a survey to gather stakeholders' evaluation, feedback, and suggestions on UNY public information services with regard to the customer expectations. Results of this survey constitute inputs for future improvement. Results indicated that information provided by UNY has met its expectations. To highlight, these findings are also supported by the assessment results reported by the Information Commission of Indonesia (KIP), awarding UNY as one of most informative institutions in terms of public information disclosure (2017, 2018, 2019).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Recommendations of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit

the study programmes “**English Language Education**” (Bachelor of Education), “**English Language Education**” (Master of Education), “**Applied Linguistics**” (Master of Applied Linguistics) and “**Language Education Science**” (Doctor of Language Education Science) offered by **Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta**.

Findings:

All programmes:

1. Students receive feedback on the results of the student’s questionnaire via their student representative in the respective committees. UNY should inform students directly about the questionnaire’s results.
2. A clear outline of teaching methods in the course descriptions would enable the programmes to demonstrate the great variety of teaching.
3. When further developing the programmes, a greater integration of cultural/literary studies and media studies should be considered. In order to do so, the experts recommend recruiting teaching staff with a background in these areas and thereby increasing the diversity of teaching staff in the programmes.
4. Staff training should put an emphasis on digital and media skills as well as cooperative and communicative approaches to teaching and classroom management.

Bachelor in “English Language Education”:

5. It is recommended that programme designers integrate interactive communicative skill development to a greater degree. Such an approach could combine oral and listening courses to an oral communication course; and the reading and writing courses could become a joint written communication course.

Bachelor and Master in “English Language Education”:

6. To allow even more flexibility and academic freedom for students, more room should be given to programme-specific elective courses.

All Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes:

7. In the programmes, training in communicative and intercultural skills could be strengthened. This may be achieved by integrating even more digital learning tools and literary and intercultural aspects.
8. Being one of the strengths of the programmes, practical elements should be outlined more clearly in the documentation– both in the course descriptions as well as in the marketing of the programmes.
9. Being important for the employability of graduates, entrepreneurial skills should be fostered more prominently, e.g. as elective courses, in the programmes.
10. References should be updated for all courses.

Master in “Applied Linguistics”:

11. The programme could benefit from introducing current topics in forensic linguistics and/or medical linguistics.
12. It is recommended that the grade for the journal publication is generally assigned based on the paper quality and not on the journal type.

13. An update of discipline-specific software is recommended.

Doctoral programme in “Language Education Science”:

14. Being the scientific lingua franca, English language competences of teaching staff should be strengthened to create further possibilities for the internationalisation of the programme.
15. The programme should strive to increase the use of mixed methods (qualitative and quantitative) in research.
16. The university should further facilitate the attendance of students and staff at international conferences, e.g. via online formats.
17. It is recommended to mention the implicitly fostered skills, such as critical thinking and autonomous learning, explicitly in the course descriptions.