



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

EXPERTS' REPORT

MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR)

ACCOUNTING (BACHELOR)

ECONOMICS EDUCATION (BACHELOR)

LAW (BACHELOR)

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

September 2021



HEI	Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
Campus, if applicable	

Programme	Management
Degree	Bachelor of Economics
Extent	144 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian

Programme	Accounting
Degree	Bachelor of Economics
Extent	148 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian

Programme	Economics Education
Degree	Bachelor of Education
Extent	
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian

Programme	Law
Degree	Bachelor of Law
Extent	144 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian

Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
No. reaccreditation	

Responsible agency	AQAS e.V.
Responsible consultant(s)	Doris Herrmann

Content

I. Preamble	8
II. Accreditation procedure	8
1. Criteria.....	8
2. Approach and methodology	8
III. General Information on the University	10
IV. Assessment of the study programmes	10
1. Quality of the Curriculum.....	10
2. Procedures for Quality Assurance	16
3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students	17
4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification	20
5. Teaching Staff	21
6. Learning Resources and Student Support.....	23
7. Information	26
V. Recommendations of the panel of experts.....	27

Decision of the AQAS Commission

on the Bachelor programmes

- **MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF ECONOMICS)**
- **ACCOUNTING (BACHELOR OF ECONOMICS)**
- **ECONOMICS EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- **LAW (BACHELOR OF LAW)**

offered by Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Based on the report of the expert panel and the extensive discussions of the Standing Commission on 30 August 2021, the Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “**Management Education**” (Bachelor of Economics), “**Accounting**” (Bachelor of Economics), “**Economics Education**” (Bachelor of Education) and “**Law**” (Bachelor of Law) offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang** are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is conditional for all programmes.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments must be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the condition has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 September 2022**.
3. The accreditation for all programmes is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2027**.

The following conditions must be fulfilled:

All programmes:

1. Several **course descriptions of all programmes** must be more specific and therefore need to be revised. In the process of revision, the Expected Learning Outcomes (ELO) in the **course descriptions** must be made explicit and specific and also reflect the profile of the university (“green”, “smart”, “conservation”).
2. In the course descriptions the relationship between ELOs and **competence-oriented forms of examination** must be described more transparently. It needs to be clear for the students, which variety of modern teaching and assessment methods is applied in the programmes.

“Economics Education” (Bachelor of Education):

3. The **profile of Economics Education must be sharpened** to serve the needs of the respective target groups by emphasizing a more subject-specific access. The Economics Education programme must focus more on development and reflection of professionalisation of the students as educators on the course level.

Recommendations are usually made if the study programme can still be specifically improved with regard to features that do not represent deficiencies in the fulfilment of the criteria for the accreditation of study programmes. The following recommendations are given for the further improvement of the programmes:

All programmes:

1. The **English language and presentation skills** should be strengthened as a basis for further internationalization.
2. For future development of the programme it is recommended to revise the structure of the curriculum in such a way that courses are combined into **larger study units (modules) and to reformulate the intended learning outcomes**.
3. **Exchange with the labour market** takes place on different levels (feedback via tracer studies, guest lecturers), but should be strengthened and be more systematic.
4. **Results of the internal QA processes** should be reported in at least an aggregated manner to the students.
5. UNNES should inform the relevant bodies in Indonesia about the need of a table which allows to **compare the workload and credits** in the Indonesian system with the workload system in the European Higher Education Area (ECTS).
6. **The internationalisation should be strengthened** by supporting the mobility of staff and students in both directions, by inviting more guest lecturers and by offering more courses on English language and presentation skills for lecturers (and students).

“Accounting and Management” (Bachelor):

7. The Accounting and Management programmes should describe more transparently in the course descriptions the **international content of courses** and which courses taught in English.
8. The Accounting and Management programmes should increase **international content of courses** and the number of courses taught in English.

“Economics Education” (Bachelor of Education):

9. UNNES should doublecheck how the **ELOs of some courses** in “Economics Education” can be aligned with level 6 of the European Qualification Framework, e.g. by integrating the topics in a course which addresses a more theoretical level and just serve as one example of practical application.
10. The programme Economics Education should check whether an **orienting practical phase** appears helpful at an early stage to give the chance to students to examine the study decision.

“Law” (Bachelor):

11. The Faculty of Law should **integrate new topics**, especially regarding cyber law and law of new technologies, and also widen the interdisciplinarity of the curriculum by offering more interdisciplinary or inter-faculty-modules and by encouraging students to take courses from other faculties, namely economy or IT.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

EXPERTS' REPORT**ON THE BACHELOR'S DEGREE PROGRAMMES**

- **MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF ECONOMICS)**
- **ACCOUNTING (BACHELOR OF ECONOMICS)**
- **ECONOMICS EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- **LAW (BACHELOR OF LAW)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SEMARANG

Visit to the university: 9-14 July 2021

Panel of Experts:

Prof. Dr. Konstantin Hassemer	HTWG Konstanz – University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Management
Prof. Dr. jur. Stefan Koos	Universität der Bundeswehr München, Department of Economics and Management
Prof. Dr. H.-Hugo Kremer	University of Paderborn, Centre for Vocational Education and Training,
Paramita Dewi Wijaya	PT BASF Indonesia, Director Human Resources (representative from the labour market)
Tobias Burk	University of Hohenheim and Université de Liège (student expert)
Coordinator: Doris Herrmann	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor programmes in Management (Bachelor of Economics/Sarjana Ekonomi), Accounting (Bachelor of Economics/Sarjana Ekonomi), Economics Education (Bachelor of Education/Sarjana Pendidikan), and Law (Bachelor of Law/Sarjana Hukum) offered by Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia.

1. Criteria

The programmes are assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programmes since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to a programme.

2. Approach and methodology

The initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in August 2020.

The Universitas Negeri Semarang produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In December 2020, the university handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the study programmes and the appendices.

The appendices included e.g.:

- Academic Guidebook
- Course descriptions
- Undergraduate academic regulations
- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs).
- Business Strategic Plan

- Standard Operating Procedures
- CVs of the teaching staff
- Information on student services
- Core information on the main library

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in March 2021.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the Standing Commission on 22 February 2021.

The nomination of the panel of expert

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in May 2021 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the University did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

The preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

The site visit

After a review of the Self Evaluation Report, a site visit to the University took place on 09-14th of July 2021. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the University's representatives.

The report writing

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Standing Commission. The report was sent to the University for comments.

The decision

The report, together with the comments of the department, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to make a decision regarding the accreditation of the programme. Based on these two documents, on 30th August 2021 the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In October 2021, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General Information on the University

Universitas Negeri Semarang (UNNES) is a state university with its main campus located in Semarang. It was founded in 1965 as a teacher education college and has since then expanded to eight faculties (Languages and Arts, Social Sciences, Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Engineering, Sports Science, Economy, Law, Education) offering 90 programmes, including 13 graduate and three doctoral programmes. Over 36,000 students are enrolled at UNNES.

According to its mission and vision statement UNNES is a university with a conservation insight, thus adopting a perspective and behaviour towards the principles of conservation (preservation, maintenance, care, and development) of natural resources and socio-cultural values. The university has developed short, medium and long-term Strategy Plans together with performance indicators for the university as a whole and its constituent faculties. Study programmes set equivalent goals and indicators for their own development. UNNES pursues *Tridharma Perguruan Tinggi* or the three pillars of higher education, namely education, research and community service. Its academic and administrative processes are regulated in an Academic Guidebook.

The programmes Accounting, Economics Education and Management are offered at the Faculty of Economy. This faculty offers eight undergraduate study programmes to close to 5,000 students. The study programme Law is offered at the Faculty of Law. Approximately 2,200 students study in the faculty's two programmes.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the Curriculum

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field.

The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Description

Bachelor programmes at UNNES are to be completed in eight semesters. The main language of instruction is Indonesian. The present programmes offer some international classes in English. Curriculum development is subject to defined procedures at UNNES. According to the SER curricula are developed and reviewed using inputs and feedback from study programme managers, teaching staff, alumni and students. This process includes a labour market analysis (Accounting) as well as focus group discussions and consultations with relevant stakeholder and professional groups and associations (Management). Furthermore, UNNES states in its SER that it considered the outcomes of its graduate tracer studies in reviewing its curricula.

According to the SER a recent policy decision by the Indonesian authorities led to further changes in all higher education curricula allowing for more learning to take place outside of the student's study programme. The aim of this policy is to provide students with opportunities to learn in a different setting and pursue knowledge according to their interests. This can include classes of other programmes at the university, placements and field studies or community service. This change should take effect for the 2020 class of the Accounting,

Economics Education, Management, and Law programmes. A matrix of programme learning outcomes and corresponding courses has been developed for each study programme.

UNNES describes in its SER that the aim of the **Management** programme is to educate graduates who can demonstrate and implement science and technology to solve problems in management science area, specifically in the field of marketing, finance and human resource management. According to the SER students are taught in accordance with level 6 of the Indonesian national qualification framework. Ten subject specific as well as generic programme learning outcomes have been defined. Graduates should be able to define, explain, discuss and practice statistics theories to solve business management issues. They should also be able to define, explain, discuss and distinguish basic and advanced theories and roles of economics and demonstrate problem-solving skills on economic issues. Students should be able to define, explain, examine particular management theories and demonstrate problem-solving on business-management issues based on the specific area in the industry 4.0 era. Finally, students should be able to integrate morale and academic values, have responsibilities, independency in commencing their tasks and also adopt a spirit of entrepreneurship, and resilience in this industry 4.0 era. The concentrations Finance, Marketing, and Human Resource are offered in the study programme. Graduates should find employment as managers, research assistants, general/educational institution managers or become entrepreneurs.

The curriculum covers a total of 144 credits, 138 of which are compulsory subjects (53 courses) and 6 are electives (6 courses representing 18 credits are available to students). In the curriculum 30 credits cover university wide subjects such as “Citizen Education” or “Five Principles Education”. Faculty wide subjects (e.g. “Introduction to Business”, “Mathematics for economics”) encompass 19 credits. Subject specific courses cover 95 credits, i.a. “International Business”, “Business Ethics”, “Budgeting”, “Business Plan”. In each concentration students take four compulsory courses (e.g. “Financial Research”, “Marketing Research”, “Human Resource Management Research”) and three out of seven electives (e.g. “Assets Management”, “Promotion and Advertising”, “Change Management”). The study programme includes in its seventh semester a mandatory internship, Community Services and a comprehensive test. Students conduct their Final Project or thesis in the eighth semester.

The aim of the **Accounting** Department at UNNES is to educate graduates who have academic and professional abilities, are ethical, honest and socially responsible in the accounting fields based on the development of science and technology and professional world of work. The department has developed ten subject specific as well as generic programme learning outcomes for the Accounting programme. Following their studies graduates should be able to demonstrate and implement financial accounting standard (SAK) and International Financial Reporting Standard (IFRS) based accounting standard in financial and accounting report. They should additionally be able to demonstrate a relevant professional standard for public accountant and International Standards on Auditing (ISA), and assess risk using quantitative methods in the auditing process. They should demonstrate the ability to perform taxation calculation for organisations and individuals. Finally, according to the SER, they should also be able to demonstrate critical thinking, logic, be systematic and innovative in science and knowledge development context and have high interest in Humanities values. Graduates should find a position as public accountants, management accountants, Islamic accountants, government accountants, educators accountants, internal auditors or tax consultants.

Students of the Accounting programme must achieve 148 credits. The curriculum consists of 49 compulsory and 12 elective courses, they cover 26 credits of university general subjects, 25 credits of faculty general subjects as well as 134 credits of study programme specific subjects including elective courses. University wide subjects in the first semester include courses such as “English” or “Islamic Education”. Faculty wide subjects in the first semester include “Introduction to Economics” and “Economics Mathematics”. In the second semester students take 10 courses including “Microeconomics”, “Business Communication” and “Taxation”. “Intermediate Financial Accounting II” and “Accounting Computing” are part of the third semester and

“Indonesian Economics” as well as “Audit II” part of the fourth semester. In their fifth semester students take the courses “Compliance Audit” and “Audit Practice”, in their sixth semester “Islamic Accounting” and “Tax Planning”. The seventh semester comprises a Field Practice, Community Services and a Comprehensive Test, the Final Project or thesis takes place in the eighth semester.

A total of ten programme learning outcomes are defined for the **Economics Education** study programme. They cover subject specific as well as interdisciplinary areas and correspond to level 6 of the Indonesian national qualification framework according to the SER. Students should thus, through their studies, demonstrate the ability to understand, analyse and evaluate law concepts and economics theories, accounting and office administration. They should demonstrate the ability to design, implement, and evaluate economics, accounting and office administration learning that is in accordance with the students’ competencies development. Graduates should be able to operate and utilise information technology applications to develop learning and scientific communication in economics, accounting, and office administration. According to the SER, they should also demonstrate the ability to work in a team, perform decision making and provide significant contributions both as team leader and team member. The programme offers three concentrations: Economics Education, Accounting Education, Office Administration Education. For each concentration UNNES gives exemplary occupation fields for its graduates, for example economics educator, entrepreneurship educator and banking educator, training instructor in accounting, or office administration consultant. Graduates should take up positions in education, research, management or consultancy services.

Students take common courses (e.g. university wide subjects such as “English Language” or “Conservation Education”) as well as concentration specific courses. Courses such as “Introduction to Economics”, “Mathematics for Economics” or “Micro Teaching” are common to all concentrations. In the specialisation Economics Education they take i.a. “Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises” and “Human Resources Economics”. “Tax Accounting” and “Accounting Information Systems” are part of the Accounting Education concentration. The courses “Archive Management” and “Learning Media of Office Administration” are part of the Office Administration Education concentration. A compulsory Teaching Practice, the subject “Guidance and Counselling” as well as a Community Service Programme and the students’ Final Project or thesis are included in the programme.

According to the SER the main aim of the **Law** programme is defined as educating graduates that can fulfil law market labour needs. UNNES lists law enforcement officer, clerk, advocate, legal drafter, legal officer, civil investigator, commissioner of government institution, legal expert and legal researcher in government agencies, in the judiciary, in lawyer practices or in private companies as employment areas for the programme’s graduates. According to the SER the study programme corresponds to level 6 of the Indonesian national qualification framework – nine corresponding programme learning outcomes have been defined. Through their studies students should be able to explain, comprehend, and discuss the Indonesian Law and National Law system comprehensively and systemically based on *Pancasila* values. They should also be able to analyse and apply the legal basic expertise in solving various legal cases as well as understand the basic knowledge and techniques of legal skills. They should be able to apply logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking in the development context, and implement science and technology on humanities values in accordance with their legal expertise.

The study programme offers three concentrations: Criminal Law, Civil Law, Constitutional Law and State Administration. The curriculum covers 144 credits and 107 courses such as “Constitutional Law”, “Legal Research Methodology”, “Clinic Law Education”, “Guarantee Law” or “Criminal Law II”.

Experts' Evaluation

General

The description of the study programmes is well understandable and detailed. The study programmes are oriented towards professional working fields / jobs. Universitas Negeri Semarang has the vision of a conversation university and set a focus on 'smart', 'green' and 'sustainable'. These focal points can only be recognized to a limited extent in the curriculum and are to be reflected upon at the course level and, in particular, to be further differentiated through a reformulation of the targeted learning outcomes (ELOs). Moreover, several course descriptions of all programmes are too unspecific and therefore need to be revised (see below). **[Finding 1]**

The study programmes show a variety of measures to ensure that the strategic goal is also visible at the course level. The establishment of international classes with an English-language offering or student exchanges (e.g. with Malaysia / Australia) or 'sister programmes' are good starting points here. It would be necessary to strengthen the English language and presentation skills as a basis for further internationalisation. **[Finding 2]** In this context, it should be emphasized that students and teachers are given the opportunity to participate in international conferences. These elements can introduce students to academic requirements in the undergraduate programmes.

The study programmes are characterised by a wide variety of courses, but the individual courses are relatively small and therefore, have a limited number of credits. This structure is associated with the danger of isolated learning and teaching pathways, many exams for students and a separation of knowledge and application. The number of small courses might also be an obstacle for international exchange. Although the modularisation of content is not requested in the European Standards and Guidelines (ESG), the panel of experts recommends for future enhancement of the programmes to revise the structure of the curriculum in such a way that courses are combined into larger study units (modules) and to reformulate the intended learning outcomes. **[Finding 3]** This would make it easier to align the overall learning outcome of the programme with the outcome of the modules and finally the Expected Learning Outcomes (ELOs) of the courses.

Accounting and Management Study Programmes

The undergraduate study programme Accounting and the undergraduate study programme Management are both designed in a competence-oriented manner. The individual courses are allocated with Credit Points (CPs) according to workload and course level (beginner, intermediate, advanced). The two study programmes cover the respective relevant subjects of accounting and management. On the basis of the course descriptions it was intransparent to which extent international content is included (e.g., of the more than 70 courses in the Management programme, only four are currently explicitly related to internationality). **[Finding 4]** Both study programmes offer specialisation/concentration subjects and thus opportunities for students to actively shape their own learning process in a competence-oriented manner.

The ELOs of the two study programmes emerge from a top-down and bottom-up process on an annual basis involving relevant stakeholders. ELOs represent subject-related, methodological, and general skills of students. Subject-specific and interdisciplinary competences are ensured through the composition of the two study programmes from courses provided at university, faculty or programme level. The feedback from the labour market on desired qualifications is partly piloted (through tracer studies), partly informal. Recommendations are reflected in changes of the study programme (e.g., offering the course digital marketing). Specific subjects (like Kampus Merdeka courses beyond regular study content) are manifested in the design of the curriculum.

The deeply differentiated structure of the two curricula (high number of courses on different, yet similar subjects) complicates the perception of common threads or thematic brackets. In this respect, a comprehensive understanding of the ELOs as well as a smooth learning progress on the student side might be compromised.

Economics Education Study Programme

From the perspective of the panel of experts the concept of the Economics Education programme is very heterogeneous because it tries to address different targets and combines a wide range of content. The programme is divided into three specifications: Accounting Education, Economic Education and Office Administration Education. The demarcation of these specifications takes place along the subject structures. The courses thus address subject-specific academic content on the one hand and subject-specific didactic content on the other hand. Thus, an orientation towards the underlying subject structures has a specific significance. Moreover, it can be stated that the study programme and its specifications are designed to be polyvalent because the profile of the graduates addresses the school-sector on the one hand and the non-school-sector on the other hand. Within the school-sector-profile there are different teaching areas since graduates can be employed in vocational education as well as in general education schools or further education. Accordingly, it is necessary to put the focus on different areas, as the requirements for teachers can differ significantly. Likewise, the focus must be directed to the respective target groups in these areas via the subject-specific access. This requires a further anchoring of the professionalisation of the students in the courses. Professionalisation is a challenge that must be pursued throughout the entire study programme. **[Finding 5]**

The organisation of the study programme is reflected in broadly differentiated course offerings with a small number of credits. The descriptions of the modules are similar. Special features of the individual modules could be better elaborated (cf. e. g. ELO in the courses 'Accounting Teaching-Learning Design and Strategy' and 'Education Finance'). The course descriptions of this programmes should be more specific and therefore need to be revised. **[see Finding 1]** Likewise, there are courses that need to be checked regarding the level of the ELOs, as they can hardly be classified at level 6 (example: Office Practice). These subject areas could become more important if the programme would emphasise the professional fields of activity more explicitly. UNNES should consider if these topics can be integrated in a course which addresses a more theoretical level and just serves as one example of practical application. This would give the chance to address an academic level with this kind of courses more easily. **[Finding 6]** It should be checked here whether these contents are interpreted from pedagogical-didactic subject areas and not considered in isolation.

Practical phases are systematically integrated into the Economics Education study programme. Students can gain practical teaching experience at regional schools. The field experience is well integrated in the curriculum and the students are provided for internship over a set of didactic-pedagogic courses (theoretically and practically). The panel of experts considers the Field Experience School (PLP) to be helpful to develop teaching competences. Nevertheless, the study programmes should check whether an orienting practical phase (field experience) appears helpful at an early stage to give students the chance to examine their study decision and thus also have an anchor point for individual professionalisation processes. **[Finding 7]**

Law Study Programme

The curriculum of the Undergraduate Programme Law essentially follows ministerial guidelines. It contains a large number of courses, some of which are very specific, especially in the more advanced stages of the programme. At the beginning of the programme, there are non-law module topics, which also follow ministerial guidelines in part, but are also due to the vision of the university. Options, especially for modules outside the study programme, were until now limited due to the ministerial guidelines. This has been reformed recently ('Kampus Merdeka' 'freedom to learn' MBKM), giving the faculties more freedom in adapting the curriculum especially in terms of choice options for students and integration of modules from other faculties. The Kampus

Merdeka program (MBKM) is currently implemented by UNNES: UNNES has reported to have started in 2021 to implement the flexibility for students to choose courses from outside the study program, either, in different study programs at the same university as well as in BA law study programs in other universities. It is recommended to the faculty to integrate further new topics in its curriculum, especially regarding cyber law and law of new technologies, and also widen the interdisciplinarity of the curriculum by continuously encouraging students to take courses from other faculties, namely economy or IT. **[Finding 8]** Particularly, in a more 'freedom of choice' system a stronger modularization – e.g. in focus or interest fields - than it is recently the case would make sense.

The curricular elements and their functions are documented. All courses are adequately described in terms of content. The module descriptions seem sufficiently detailed. Overall, the necessary transparency of the curricular structure is given. The curricular structure reflects the progression of the learners and is based consecutively on the respecting learning outcomes; the curriculum is designed from general to specific. Redundancies and overlaps between courses are possible but they are tried to be avoided by inter-lecturer communication. The high number of very specific courses makes it rather difficult for learners to understand thematic and systematic connections between the topics. A better modularisation - which bundles courses of related content - would be recommendable. **[see Finding 3]** The study programme covers all subjects relevant for the Indonesian legal and social order; courses related to international topics, such as International Private Law, International Public Law and International Commercial Law are integrated. The programme strives to achieve a broad overview on the legal system and integrates also feedback from the labour market. The number of credit points assigned to the courses depends on the expected workload.

The relevance of courses taught in English language may be improved; international courses are taught 80% in English language. The integration of interdisciplinarity or inter-faculty modules has been started; interdisciplinary lectures (e.g. F&E management together with economics; cyberlaw together with informatics) exist (with e.g. Juvenile law & psychology). Collaboration has been reported by the faculty with the faculty of social science and the faculty of education. Collaborations were reported by the faculty with several institutions of the state and province administration and the justice as well with partners from industry and trade. The Law of the Digitalization/Cyberlaw is not integrated into the curriculum by a separate course. **[see Finding 8]** Related to the specific law-related aspects the ELO describes methodical, practical and theoretical skills, which seems sufficient.

The ELO of the Undergraduate Law Study Program covers general and specialized skills and knowledge. It contains general character and religious qualities – following certain state regulations conditions - and general knowledge related to the Indonesian citizenship. It is additionally strongly bound to certain further non-scientific religion-related moral values linked to the general vision of UNNES. This is not regarded as an accreditation hurdle, as it is related to specific social and cultural conditions of the Indonesian State. Furthermore, the faculty seeks to promote interreligious events and to thematize issues of tolerance values within the lectures. The Programme Learning Outcomes (PLO) and Course Learning Outcomes (CLO) are appropriate. The Learning Outcomes are designed in a process of discussion between the faculty and stakeholders. Feedback also derives from Tracer Studies (e.g. contract drafting). The implementation of the need of the labour market may be improved by institutionalized meetings. **[Finding 9]**

Conclusion

Management Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

Accounting Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

Economics Education Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

Law Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for Quality Assurance

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes. A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

Quality assurance procedures at UNNES are based on specific regulations by the competent national authorities as well as Regulations from the Rector and defined processes at university level. The university has adopted policies on quality assurance, on academic freedom and on scientific autonomy as laid down in its Academic Guidebook. The University Honorary Council, a Panel of Professors, the Ethics Supervisory Team, the Student Ethics Council as well as the Quality Assurance Board are tasked with preserving integrity and preventing academic fraud.

UNNES' internal quality assurance system has been developed to control and improve the implementation and delivery of academic services as well as other supporting activities within the university. It relies on data on student progression and quantitative targets and indicators. Data on alumni is gathered and fed into a specific database. According to the SER the quality assurance system of the university has been reviewed against ISO 9001. A Quality Assurance Board has been set up as a body under the Rector to carry out and coordinate internal quality assurance processes in the area of education (a separate body deals with research and community services). Quality Assurance Boards are also set up at faculty level and are led by Quality Assurance Coordinators. Subject specific curriculum reviews should take place every four years; curricula are adapted as required depending on new national policies. Quality assurance procedures have been mapped out and defined. According to the SER each study programme is evaluated annually through an Internal Quality Audit performed by an internal independent auditor. This includes lecturer assessment in teaching and learning, faculties and study programmes performance evaluation as well as students' satisfaction.

The four programmes follow a PDCA-cycle and take into account the different stages of the "learning system". Feedback on teaching and learning is gathered through a "Lecturer Learning Performance Index" at the end of the semester and results are considered by the quality assurance managers of the faculty. According to its policy all UNNES lecturers should report annually on their educational, research and community service activities.

Study programme meetings are organised twice per semester, during which the teaching and learning process as well as the professional development of teaching staff are discussed. At the beginning of the semester specific tasks are assigned to teaching staff and the content of the learning media is reviewed. According to the SER annual meetings of the whole faculty as well as internal meetings of faculty managers and teaching staff provide further opportunities to discuss the state and the development of study programmes.

Experts' Evaluation

UNNES as a university and the evaluated faculties implemented quality assurance mechanisms at all levels. Following the national laws on quality management in higher education, the faculties have designated quality

assurance coordinators lead by a quality assurance board. The responsibilities are well defined and clearly described in multiple documents. Data on labour market requirements, student employability and the composition of the student body are collected regularly. The quality assurance on the programme level includes various methods including the involvement of alumni, student satisfaction surveys and internal evaluation of the teaching and learning process as well as student support and facilities. Students are involved in the process by evaluating their courses at the end of the semester as well as in informal feedback in or between the individual classes.

The programme representatives have convinced the panel of expert that the results of the student surveys are reviewed by the faculty management and taken as a basis for improvements in the next semesters. The staff members gave examples in the discussions with the panel of experts how the results of quality-assurance procedures lead to concrete measures to enhance quality. With regard to a procedural view on the quality assurance system at UNNES, the university states that they have implemented PDCA cycles. For the panel of experts, a closed loop is key for a universal quality assurance system. Therefore, all stakeholders need to be informed about the results of quality assurance measures. The student surveys play an important role in the quality assurance cycle. Hence, the results of student surveys need to be available for students at least in an aggregated form to close the PDCA cycle. **[Finding 10]**

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.
Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.
Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.
[ESG 1.3]*

Description

General academic provisions (e.g. details on the credit system), the generic structure of study programmes or the teaching and learning process as well as assessment guidelines are laid down in the university's Academic Guidebook.

The four Bachelor programmes cover eight semesters each, they include periods of study on campus as well as off-campus through field visits, internships or community service. A semester consists of 16 weeks including the mid-term and final examination phases. According to the typical study plans students take subjects totalling between 20 and 24 credits each semester – except in their last two semesters which are reserved for field learning and their final project. Each course ranges from 2 to 6 credits. The actual maximum amount of credits students can take in one semester depends on the achieved Grade Point Average (GPA) in the previous semester, i.e. students with lower grades can only take a limited number of courses. The credit system is based on study hours in various formats including face-to-face lectures, seminars, structured tasks and independent studies. There is an attendance requirement to at least 75 % of the programmes' classes.

For each programme the persons responsible have developed a teaching and learning strategy. Procedures for the organisation of online meetings as well as regarding the number of sessions within courses are defined as part of standard operating procedures. Teaching and learning is embedded in the information system of the

university. UNNES indicates that 45 ICT apps and platforms are used including tools aiming at monitoring the students' progression throughout their studies and in each course. It includes i.a. data on attendance, grades, supervision notes. According to the SER, lecturers use this data in providing guidance to students. The Academic Guidebook provides a framework for teaching and learning methods with the aim of implementing an interactive, holistic, integrative, scientific, contextual, thematic, effective, collaborative, and student-centred learning process. This should be achieved i.a. through case studies, project-based learning, problem-based learning and inquiry or small group discussion. According to the SER the learning process is supported by e-learning elements and/or blended learning; examples of student-centred learning are given for the four study programmes in the SER. UNNES states in its SER that research is also used as a form of learning, especially in the students' final project.

According to the Academic Guidebook observation, participation, performance, written tests, oral tests, and questionnaires can be used as assessment methods. Mid-terms as well as final exams are organised. In addition students sit a comprehensive examination and complete a final project or thesis. Written tests, portfolio assignments, participation records, quizzes as well as presentations, case studies and practice tests are used in the four programmes. The students' final grade is determined based on their daily test scores, their mid-term exam score and their final semester examination score. The relevant data is accessible through the ICT platforms and apps of the university.

Practice elements within all curricula are also regulated through the Academic Guidebook and quality requirements are defined by the Board of Quality Assurance. Students are required to complete an internship in the Accounting and Management programmes and teaching practices are compulsory in the Economics Education programme. According to the SER students are motivated to join law training and practices in partners' institutions as part of community service projects in the Law programme.

Experts' Evaluation

General

The range of teaching methods includes classical lectures as well as practical units. Because the panel of expert does not have the task to observe teaching in classes, this aspect cannot be evaluated. Most likely the dialogue character of the lectures depends on the individual lecturer.

The panel of experts has no doubt, that the formal requirement regarding the assessment of students are fulfilled. There are suitable opportunities for students to re-sit an exam. Transparent and published regulations or other mitigating circumstances to compensate for disadvantages, illness, or absence exist at UNNES. Data on the exams are collected.

One of the strong aspects of the programme is the integration of off-campus units, namely field-visits or community services. The programmes enable students to transfer their knowledge to situations outside the university context. Methods of teaching, learning, and assessment support an interlacing of theoretical and practical aspects.

Responsibilities and structures related to the organisation of exams are clearly defined. The timing of exams seems to be organised appropriately and the students reported that the examination dates are announced in a timely manner.

In the SER UNNES presented only the national credit system SKS and therefore, the workload of the students in ECTS cannot be assessed (see below). According to the students, their workload is very transparent from the students' point of view.

Accounting and Management Study Programmes

In both study programmes, a didactic and content-related progression of the student's learning process takes place. International classes are offered in both programmes, which are taught entirely in English.

Apart from student access to information in the comprehensive e-learning environment of the university, the structure of the courses, learning objectives and forms and requirements of examinations are addressed by the respective lecturers in the form of learning agreements at the beginning of the course. Students have pointed out a certain flexibility on the part of the lecturers with regard to forms of examination. In this respect, greater transparency and predictability in the organisation of examinations should be encouraged in order to clearly emphasise the relationship between ELOs and competence-oriented forms of examination. The examination formats take into account different types of learners and learning paths, but could be more varied in terms of modern teaching and assessment methods. **[Finding 11]**

Multidisciplinary learning environments are provided through internships and community service projects within the Kampus Merdeka framework which enables students to transfer their knowledge to situations outside the regular academic context.

Economics Education Study Programme

Feasibility of studying is regarded as given. Limitations of the feasibility can be found with regard to the already mentioned small size of the courses. The design of the individual study plans can be made by the students.

The examination structure is explained in the modules at the beginning of the semester and agreed with the students. The examination system provides for weekly, mid-term and final exams. Overall, there is a clearly structured and comprehensible examination system. Due to the large number of courses, the examination load should be checked in the student surveys. There are restrictions with regard to the publication of the examination forms in the course plans.

The integration of practical phases is possible and can be undertaken by the students. Students have the opportunity to complete a school-based internship in the Semarang region.

The final projects are well prepared with guidelines and support from the supervising lecturers. In the beginning of each lecture a teaching contract is elaborated and given to the students. An adequate progression scheme is applied.

Law Study Programme

The discussion climate in the lectures could not be evaluated as it depends on the individual didactic style of the lecturer. However, alumni and students reported an open discussion atmosphere within lectures. The law programme integrates international classes; however, these classes are only taught in 80% in the English language and therefore are maybe not completely suitable for non-Indonesian speaking international students. All students join international classes. Students are encouraged to write papers and present in international and national seminars; workshops are offered for the training of presentation skills. The support of the students and the information options by digital platforms seems excellent.

Students have a supervisor to address if they face difficulties in their studies (offline as well as online). However, similar to the study programmes Accounting and Management a certain flexibility on the part of the lecturers regarding the form of the examination may be problematic in terms of the transparency. The form of the respective module examination should be predictable before the lecture starts. **[see Finding 11]** Apart of this aspect, the process of making learning agreements on the structure and the learning objectives of the course between the individual lecturer and the students of the course seems a strength as it can support the learning motivation and help the learners to focus on the course topics. The teaching methods in the Law

programme are dominated by student-centred learning methods. They are complemented, depending on the subject, by lecturer-centred methods and face to face interaction. The Covid-19 pandemic led to a faster development of blended learning methods which is seen as a further option besides the classic learning methods also for the post-pandemic period.

The examination forms are adequate for Law studies. Examples of examination tasks show a mix of theoretic questions and case study tasks. The sufficient integration of the ability to work case oriented is important for Law studies, taking into account the ELO. This might be strengthened by a stronger integration of exercises in the respective modules. A clear strength are the multidisciplinary learning elements through internships and community service projects in the last semesters of the programme.

Conclusion

Management Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

Accounting Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

Economics Education Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

Law Study Programme: the criterion is partially fulfilled.

4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

Rules regarding students' admission, progression, recognition and certification are provided for in UNNES' Academic Guidebook. These are completed by specific Rector's Regulations, e.g. regarding Ethics. Admission to a study programme at UNNES is possible through three specific schemes: National Selection for Public Universities, Joint Selection for Public Universities, institution-managed selection. The first scheme takes into account academic achievement at secondary level, whereas the second scheme is based on the results of a computer-based written examination as well as a portfolio submitted by the candidates. The last scheme managed by UNNES includes a written test and/or an arts/sports skills test. Specific language skills are required to enrol in international classes.

UNNES indicates in its SER that equal opportunity is given to students with disabilities and that financial support can be afforded to students from a low-income background. Information on the enrolment requirements are published on the university's website. UNNES also gathers data on the number of places, of applications and of successful candidates and publishes it on its university wide platform.

According to the SER recognition and mobility regulations are laid down in specific Rector's Regulations. UNNES states that it encourages its students to actively take part in activities off-campus. According to the SER these activities can be recognised and credited in their study programmes.

Information on student mobility programmes is made available by the university. Specific partnerships have been established for the four Bachelor programmes including with higher education institutions and companies (for placement programmes) both within Indonesia and abroad in Malaysia, Macau, Taiwan, Vietnam, Thailand, the Philippines.

Graduation guidelines are set in the Academic Guidebook. The students' GPA is supplemented by a classification (e.g. "cum laude" for a GPA of 3.51-4.00). Students receive with their Bachelor certificates academic transcripts and diploma supplements.

Experts' Evaluation

The admission requirements of the programmes for Indonesian nationals as well as for international students are clearly defined and standardized for all applicants. The criteria are accessible for the general public. General admission to higher education programmes is mainly given through governmental processes.

Recognition of courses attended in a semester abroad is organized in accordance with European guidelines. The university uses agreements similar to the European learning agreements. Overall, the panel is convinced, that the faculty is enabling students to stay abroad and therefore focusses on a complaisant recognition policy. Still, the composition of the curricula with a great amount of small modules could potentially cause problems in recognition at European universities. The translation formula of SKS into ECTS Credits is provided by the university. It would be useful for the national Higher Education System to develop such a conversion table, because it cannot lie in the responsibility of a single university to do so. Still, the panel of experts encourages the programme management to increase transparency on SKS to ECTS Credit conversion. It is recommended to UNNES to contact the bodies in Indonesia which are in charge for developing a table which allows to compare the workload and credits in the Indonesian system with the workload system in the European Higher Education Area (ECTS). **[Finding 12]** The panel further supports the efforts of developing more international cooperation with standardized credit transfer agreement in the frame of the internationalization strategy.

Students and the International Office at UNNES described during the site visit which processes and measures are in place for the recognition of competences gained at other higher education institutions, such as degrees or coursework. These regulations are available to students. Learning agreements are provided before students start taking courses at other universities abroad. Some core regulations of the Lisbon Convention are fulfilled. After the site visit UNNES explained in a statement that takes part in a model project for recognition of prior learning. Nevertheless, this aspect cannot be regulated by UNNES as an individual university but needs to be addressed on a higher level.

Graduates receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including context, level, and status of the studies. After the completion of the studies, students are issued a kind of "Diploma Supplement", developed by UNNES. The panel of experts recommends to enrich the Diploma Supplement with more information about the Indonesian higher education system to support the seamless transfer of students into international master and PhD programmes.

Conclusion

The criteria are fulfilled, because the aspect of recognition of prior learning cannot be solved by UNNES. Nevertheless, the university should take initiative to address these issues on the national level.

5. Teaching Staff

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

Faculties are responsible for human resource planning proposals, which are decided upon centrally, either subject to ministry approval for civil servant positions or solely in the remit of the university for contract-based positions. The Rector's Regulations provide a framework regarding such positions as well as staff development and further training. Recruitment criteria are based on national and/or university regulations.

UNNES indicates that the maximal ratio of teaching staff to students in social sciences is 1:34. There are a total of 26 lecturers in the **Accounting** programme, 50 in the **Economics Education** programme, 29 in the **Management** programme and 45 in the **Law** programme. They range from professors to associate professors, senior lecturers, assistant professors and lecturers. According to the SER guest lecturers are also invited to contribute at both the Faculty of Economy and the Faculty of Law.

According to its policies each lecturer is allocated a specific amount of time (expressed in credits) for each activity including teaching, research, community service, academic development, and administration and management. Part of the university staff performance system includes the review of teaching staff in which the head of one's study programme is involved. Evaluation is conducted every semester by assessors from the Quality Assurance Board at the faculty level. According to the SER research activities are mandatory for teaching staff, research should thus feed into the teaching process. Career development programmes are provided internally and externally, teaching staff are further encouraged to participate in their respective scientific community.

Experts' Evaluation

General

Teaching staff of both faculties hold a recognised Masters' degree from grade A accredited universities or a PhD. They qualify for the teaching position on the basis of their professional competences and their didactic skills. The typical workload for lecturers is 3-4 courses per semester with larger courses sometimes being split into two classes.

International lecturers from various partner universities are regularly integrated into current teaching activities. The lecturers either take over a complete semester course with corresponding examination obligations or engage in co-teaching with UNNES lecturers.

The ongoing qualification of teaching staff is ensured in both faculties through various measures:

- (a) financial support for teaching staff in further training or acquiring competence certifications,
- (b) support in the academic development of staff (e.g., in the acquisition of language skills or the doctorate),
- (c) financial support (from faculties or ministry) or provision of training (e.g., writing workshops) and rewards for the publication of academic papers (fees, translations, proof-reading for publishing in SCOPUS-indexed journals),
- (d) support of research activities, participation in conferences and international academic exchange,
- (e) consideration of research activities in the allocation of the teaching load of lecturers.

Lecturers of both faculties would welcome more support with administrative tasks and further improvements of facilities and personnel. The use of assistants in research and examination activities is considered desirable in order to use one's own resources in the best possible way for improved student learning processes and high-quality graduates.

There is a unanimous opinion among lecturers that UNNES should further strengthen its international cooperative activities. This includes increasing the mobility of lecturers and students, intensifying cooperation with

universities and institutions abroad, and improving competence in English-language teaching and publication.

[Finding 13]

Accounting and Management Study Programmes

The lecturers in the two bachelor programmes meet the formal criteria for academic teaching at UNNES. The teaching staff covers the diverse subject areas of the two disciplines with their professional specialisation as well as a high level of commitment to teaching and research/publication. The international orientation of lecturers is fostered by the university's continuing education measures. Here, the focus is particularly on language competence and experience abroad.

Economics Education Study Programme

There are 50 teachers available. The teaching staff cover both the overarching, subject-specific and cross-cutting components. The faculty has expressed that sufficient personnel resources are available.

Law Study Programme

The whole teaching staff of the law faculty is obviously qualified for the study programme. The lecturers hold at least Master-degrees from universities, which have the national accreditation grade 'A' (a significant part of the Master-degrees is coming from Universitas Diponegoro; the reason for this concentration of alumni from one university is unclear. It may be a hint of problems within the recruitment process for staff). Some of them have also degrees from foreign universities (Australia, Malaysia). The number of full professors is rather low compared to MA and Dr/PhD degrees, which is a result of the special frame conditions of the tenure track in Indonesia. The motivations of the law lecturers made a very good impression.

The language skills of the lecturers seem partly good, however, not all lecturers seem accustomed to use English language. The University communicated though, that yearly English training courses are offered for lecturers. English language skills may be in the future even more evaluated in the recruitment process for new staff.

The short CVs of all lecturers including their academic qualifications and scientific interest are documented. Most lecturers publish articles in national law journals, some of them also in international journals. The teaching staff resources overall seem sufficient. International guest lecturers are integrated by invitations as speakers in international seminars and conferences and teaching activities for one semester. Some lecturers expressed the wish of a broader internationalisation process including more lecturer exchange.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled for all four programmes.

6. Learning Resources and Student Support

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.
Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.
[ESG 1.6]*

Description

Information regarding the university and its teaching and learning arrangements are provided to new students through a campus and academic orientation both at university and faculty level. According to the SER information and support services are made available to ensure that students complete their studies in the foreseen timeframe. Students are also informed about student representation at UNNES. Each of the four study programmes has a student association according to the SER.

Each semester students receive a Semester Learning Plan detailing teaching, learning and assessment procedures and providing an overview of the content of the courses, exam specifications and learning material. According to the SER these plans are reviewed each semester to ensure accuracy and validity of the courses' content. This information is made available on the ICT platforms and apps of UNNES.

Guidance and information may also be provided by the head of the study programme. UNNES states that students can consult with their academic supervisor regarding their choice of courses. The students' Final Project is guided by a supervisor assigned by the study programme (at least an assistant professor). Specific information and support are provided to international students by the university's international office. Students can also consult with the university's career and counselling service centre.

The Faculty of Economics and the Faculty of Law each have three buildings that are used for teaching and learning activities. They include office space for staff and laboratory spaces (e.g. Accounting Computer Laboratory, Data Analysis Laboratory, Office Administration Laboratory, Archive Laboratory, Investment Gallery/Capital Market Laboratory, Legal Laboratory). According to the SER they have been equipped with the latest necessary technology. Students have access to the respective Faculty Library as well as to the University Library and working and learning spaces.

The IT infrastructure at UNNES covers the aforementioned online platforms/apps and the provision of e-learning resources. IT support is provided by a central unit of the university. Further, UNNES offers students sports as well as health, social and religious facilities. Entrepreneurship support and guidance are provided by UNNES' Business Centre. The university has defined standards for environment, health and safety and considers the needs of students and people with disabilities according to the SER.

Experts' Evaluation

Due to the fact that the assessment of the four programmes has to take place online, several videos were shown which gave a good overview over the premises, the class rooms, library and recreation offers at UNNES. Resources have been provided covering the four undergraduate faculties; Accounting, Management, Economic Education and Law which include areas of: 1. Finance, 2. Infrastructure, 3. Laboratories, 4. Library, 5. IT Facilities including e-learning infrastructures, 6. The Environment, Health and Safety supports and access for people with special needs.

On the basis of the videos shown, the panel of experts has no concerns that the material resources (finance, computer workplaces, etc.) are available for the study programmes as necessary to achieve the intended learning outcomes. All classrooms and workspaces reflect current professional standards and are appropriate for the intended learning outcomes. Sufficient facilities are available with regard to room and space required for the number of students in the programme.

The management of information system is centrally managed by the Information and Communication Technology integrated service units.

The most appreciated features especially during this pandemic situation is the e-learning system created for the students. This system is created to assist the student in the learning process from registration process, selection of subject and administering the learning progress. From what was explained by the team during virtual campus visit, UNNES keep continuing to upgrade the system so that it may support the virtual learning process in most effective and efficient manners. Some of the system used including ELENA, SITEDI and SIKADU.

The library has been supporting the learning and research activities by providing latest information, journals and using satisfaction surveys to evaluate visitor satisfaction as the way to receive feedback. According to the information given by the students, access is provided to an appropriate amount of literature, journals, and academic sources to enable the achievement of the intended learning outcomes. For UNNES, like for all universities, there is the ongoing task to follow up on further digitalization and also make the IT visible through ELOs and to improve access to international journals and databases.

However, based on feedback received during sessions with students and alumni, UNNES is also expected to have more high-quality journals and research materials in the future.

All the buildings and facilities have a high standard of maintenance procedures and Environmental, Health and Safety aspects. During COVID19 pandemic, the faculties provide additional health facilities such as hand sanitizers on each floor, portable sinks, thermo gun as well as health and safety instruction and reminders.

More cooperation with foreign universities especially for some faculties e.g. Management and Law through internship and scholarship may give advantages for students in getting more exposures and this is also aligned with the internationalisation objective of UNNES (see above).

Student support

Students at UNNES have a large variety of support programmes offered by the university as well as by the faculties. The entry phase into the study programmes offers introduction weeks, welcome ceremonies and the introduction to study groups. In addition, the university offers support for internship organisation, financial as well as psychological support and individual support for stays abroad. Specific offerings are available for exchange students / incoming students. An International Office is also present. It assists students in all phases of their exchange: planning, possible scholarships, and recognition of credits among others.

Teaching staff members offer frequent consultation hours and are available to students. Course/module descriptions are available to students. These documents contain the intended learning outcomes, methods of learning and teaching, assessment methods, and the expected workload (self-study and in-class hours). Procedures are applied to ensure that course offerings are coordinated on both content and organizational levels to avoid overlap. The programme is implemented in such a way that students are able to complete their studies within the expected period of time as defined in the curriculum. The study programme Economics Education includes practical phases/internships, support is given in finding practical placements.

The panel is convinced, that the university puts great effort in the support of their students and creates a fruitful learning and living environment at the university.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled for all four programmes.

7. Information

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.
[ESG 1.8]

Description

UNNES provides information on its study programmes on its website, the websites of the faculties as well as on social media platforms. Academic regulations as laid down in its Academic Guidebook are also available to prospective and current students.

Experts' Evaluation

Public information is available through unnes.ac.id. Using this public website, students, faculty members and visitors can find sufficient information on the university from general information related to academy information such as details on each major, information on faculty members and some research projects or general information such as cooperation with government body and companies including the available job vacancies for graduates.

Some contents that can be obtained through public website include information on university profiles, academic information, student and faculty activities, expert comments, directory of faculty members and professors. In addition to the website, some relevant activities and news is also available in different social media platforms such as Instagram and YouTube.

Most of the news and articles posted in the social media is also quite recent and updated. This gives the impression that UNNES has pushed its efforts to maintain the public information transparently especially on quality of education and research as well as using different social media platforms as promotion media in increasing the students' interest to join UNNES.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Recommendations of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit with conditions
 - the programme “**Management**” (**Bachelor**) and
 - the programme “**Accounting**” (**Bachelor**) and
 - the programme “**Economics Education**” (**Bachelor of Education**)
 - the programme “**Law**” (**Bachelor**)

offered by Universitas Negeri Semarang (UNNES).

Findings:

1. Several **course descriptions of all programmes** must be more specific and therefore need to be revised. This revision must also be used to make the ELOs in the **course descriptions** more explicit and specific and also reflect the profile of the university (“green”, “smart”, “conservation”).
2. The **English language and presentation skills** should be strengthened as a basis for further internationalization.
3. For future development of the programme, it is recommended to revise the structure of the curriculum in such a way that courses are combined into **larger study units (modules)**.
4. The Accounting and Management programmes should describe more transparently in the course descriptions the **international content of courses** and which courses taught in English.
5. The **profile of Economics Education must be sharpened** to serve the needs of the respective target groups by emphasizing a more subject-specific access. The Economics Education programme must focus more on development and reflection of professionalisation of the students as educators on the course level.
6. UNNES should doublecheck how the ELOs of some courses in “Economics Education” can be aligned with **level 6 of the European Qualification Framework**, e. g. by integrating the topics in a course which addresses a more theoretical level and just serve as one example of practical application.
7. The programme Economics Education should check whether a **practical phase** is helpful at an early stage to give the chance to students to examine the study decision.
8. The Faculty of Law should **integrate new topics**, especially regarding cyber law and law of new technologies, and also widen the interdisciplinarity of the curriculum by offering more interdisciplinary or inter-faculty-modules and by encouraging students to take courses from other faculties, namely economy or IT.
9. **Exchange with the labour market** takes place on different levels (feedback via tracer studies, guest lecturers), but should be strengthened and be more systematic.
10. **Results of the internal QA processes** should be reported in at least an aggregated manner to the students.
11. In the course descriptions the **relationship between ELOs and competence-oriented forms of examination** must be described more transparently. It needs to be clear for the students, which variety of modern teaching and assessment methods is applied in the programmes.

12. UNNES should take initiative to inform the relevant bodies in Indonesia about the need of a table which allows to **compare the workload and credits** in the Indonesian system with the workload system in the European Higher Education Area (ECTS).
13. **The internationalisation should be strengthened** by supporting the mobility of staff and students in both directions, by inviting more guest lecturers and by offering more courses on English language and presentation skills for lecturers (and students).