



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

EXPERTS' REPORT

GEOGRAPHY (BACHELOR OF GEOGRAPHY)

SPORTS SCIENCES (BACHELOR OF SPORT)

GUIDANCE AND COUNSELLING (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia)

December 2021

HEI	Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia)
Programme	Geography
Degree	Bachelor of Geography
Extent	149 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian
Programme	Sports Sciences
Degree	Bachelor of Sport
Extent	144 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian
Programme	Guidance and Counselling
Degree	Bachelor of Education
Extent	142 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian
Programme	Early Childhood Teacher Education
Degree	Bachelor of Education
Extent	144 SKS
Length of studies	8 semesters
Language	Indonesian
Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
No. reaccreditation	-
Responsible agency	AQAS e.V.
Responsible consultant(s)	Patrick Heinzer & Dr. Melanie Brück

Content

I. Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	4
II. Preamble	8
a. Criteria.....	8
b. Approach and methodology	8
III. General Information on the University	10
IV. Assessment of the study programme(s)	11
1. Quality of the Curriculum.....	11
Geography (Bachelor)	11
Sports Sciences (Bachelor)	12
Guidance and Counselling (Bachelor)	14
Early Childhood Teacher Education (Bachelor)	16
2. Procedures for Quality Assurance	17
3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students	19
4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification	21
5. Teaching Staff	23
6. Learning Resources and Student Support.....	25
7. Public Information	27
Findings.....	28

Decision of the AQAS Commission

on the Bachelor programmes

“Geography” (Bachelor)

“Sports Sciences” (Bachelor)

“Guidance and Counselling” (Bachelor)

“Early Childhood Teacher Education” (Bachelor)

offered by

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Commission in its 11th meeting on 6 December 2021, the AQAS Commission decides:

1. The study programmes **“Geography” (Bachelor of Geography)**, **“Sports Sciences” (Bachelor of Sport)**, **“Guidance and Counselling” (Bachelor of Education)** and **“Early Childhood Teacher Education” (Bachelor of Education)** offered by Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2022**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2027**.

Conditions:

For all programmes:

1. It has to be demonstrated how the PDCA cycle for each individual programme is systematically closed. This refers specifically to non- or informal group discussions, which should be changed into structural processes.
2. It has to be demonstrated how results of the quality assurance procedures are shared with all relevant internal and external stakeholders, including students and labour market representatives.

In addition to the conditions above, programme-specific conditions read as follows:

Geography (Bachelor)

3. The intended learning outcomes on programme level must be specified in such a way to reflect the most important contents of the current programme (e.g., spatial planning and rural development)

Sports Sciences (Bachelor)

4. The various graduation profiles should be outlined more transparently to demonstrate the distinctiveness of this study programme for future students and the labour market.

Early Childhood Teacher Education (Bachelor)

5. The graduation profile must be updated and must be in line with the current status quo of employment fields beyond governmental directives.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all programmes:

1. Establishing regular and structured labour market focus groups to account for more formalized quality assurance measures is strongly recommended.
2. Room should be given to expand English competencies of students within the programmes.
3. It is recommended to provide the digital platform for students and staff also in English.
4. Internationalisation efforts should be strengthened to attract international students from Western countries as well as from other Asian countries.
5. To foster autonomous learning, more student-centred learning approaches should be implemented in the teaching methods of all programmes.
6. A system should be implemented to assure progress in the development of English competencies of staff to expand research opportunities with countries outside Southeast Asia and connect better to international research.
7. It should be assured that consistent up-to-date information on the study programmes is available for Indonesian and non-Indonesian speakers.

In addition to the recommendations given for all programmes, programme-specific recommendations read as follows:

Guidance and Counselling (Bachelor)

8. The graduation profile should include potential employment fields in an international environment, such as the American School Counsellor Association (ASCA) to strengthen its profile.

Early Childhood Teacher Education (Bachelor)

9. To strengthen to societal impact of the programme, topics of child protection, inclusion or family and relationship services should be fostered within the curriculum.
10. The department could reflect on possibilities to provide students with opportunities to specialise in certain areas via discipline-specific electives.
11. Special attention should be paid to the theoretical foundation of the programme to foster potential scientific paths of students.
12. Internship options in other sectors than schools should be given to broaden the scope of the programme.

EXPERTS' REPORT
ON THE BACHELOR PROGRAMMES
GEOGRAPHY (BACHELOR)
SPORTS SCIENCES (BACHELOR)
GUIDANCE AND COUNSELLING (BACHELOR)
EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)
OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SEMARANG (INDONESIA)

Visit to the university: 18 – 22 October 2021

Panel of Experts:

Prof. Dr. Janne Fengler	Alanus University of Arts and Social Sciences (Germany), Institute for Childhood Education, Department of Education
Prof. Dr. Arno Müller	University of Erfurt, Institute for Education (Germany), Department of Sports and exercise sciences
Prof. Dr. Burkard Richter	University of Education Schwäbisch Gmünd (Germany), Institute for Social Sciences, Department of Geography
Prof. Dr. Ipah Saripah	University of Education Indonesia (Indonesia), Department of Education and psychological guidance
Yvor Broer	Managing director at In Dialogue, Denmark / The Netherlands (representative from the labour market)
Johann Janssen	Student of Geography at University of Hannover (Student representative)

Coordinators:

Patrick Heinzer & Dr Melanie Brück

AQAS, Cologne, Germany

II. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution.

Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor programmes in “Geography” (Bachelor), “Sports Sciences” (Bachelor), “Guidance and Counselling” (Bachelor), and “Early Childhood Teacher Education” (Bachelor) offered by Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia).

a. Criteria

The programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to a programme.

b. Approach and methodology

The initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in 2020.

The University produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In February 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the programmes and an appendix.

The appendix included e.g.:

- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs).
- CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors
- Information on student services
- Core information on the main library
- academic regulations

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in in June 2021.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 15 February 2021.

The nomination of the panel of expert

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in July 2021 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the University did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

The preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

The site visit

After a review of the Self Evaluation Report, a digital site visit to the University took place from 18 – 22 October 2021. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the University's representatives.

The report writing

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission. The report was sent to the University for comments.

The decision

The report, together with the comments of the departments, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, on 6 December 2021 the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2022, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General Information on the University

Universitas Negeri Semarang (UNNES) is a public university located in Semarang City, Java/Indonesia. Before changing to a public university in 1999 by presidential decree, the university was founded as the Semarang Teacher Training and Education Institute (IKIP) in 1965. In 2021, UNNES consists of eight faculties (Social Sciences, Education, Language and Arts, Mathematics and Natural Science, Engineering, Sports Science, Economics, and Law) and one graduate school (with 22 Master programmes and eight PhD programmes). The programmes which are subject to this procedure are located at the Faculty of Social Sciences (Geography), Faculty of Sports Sciences (Sports Sciences), and the Faculty of Education (Guidance and Counselling, and Early Childhood Teacher Education).

According to the self-evaluation report (SER), UNNES has developed an overarching vision and mission to become a university with international recognition. One of the aspects outlined by UNNES is that a well-established quality assurance system throughout the whole university is crucial. Therefore, UNNES has implemented a quality assurance office (BPM) and a quality assurance agency (GPM) to organise the faculties' quality assurance processes. On the university level, UNNES has obtained A-results by the national higher education accreditation board in Indonesia (BAN-PT) and is ISO 9001: 2015 certified. Internationalisation is also one of the components that supports UNNES to fulfil its mission and vision. In its SER, the university outlines that collaboration with more than 50 higher education institutions worldwide is carried out. On a national scale, it is said that the university is amongst the Top 20 most popular universities concerning enrolment numbers of students. Furthermore, it is stated that UNNES is listed as 71st worldwide in terms of the sustainability of the resources.

The Faculty of Social Sciences integrates nine programmes (History Education, Geography, Geography Education, Civic Education, Political Sciences, Education of Sociology and Anthropology, Political Science, Social Science Education, and a Diploma programme on Regional Survey and Mapping). Currently, the faculty has 3,183 students enrolled. The faculty has 96 lecturers, out of which 41 hold a PhD and seven are full professors.

Concerning the number of study programmes, the Faculty of Sports Sciences only offers four study programmes on the Bachelor level (Physical Education, Health and Recreation, Sports Sciences, and Public Health). However, the number of current students enrolled is high (4,290 students). Furthermore, it is said that some international students coming from Southeast Asian countries (Korea, Thailand, or Malaysia) are enrolled at the faculty. A total of 110 lecturers are employed at the faculty (five full professors and 33 PhD holders).

The Faculty of Education is one of the oldest faculties at UNNES and has five study programmes (Instructional Technology, Non-formal education, Guidance and Counselling, Early Childhood Teacher Education, and Professional Education in Counselling). As of 2020, 4,315 students are enrolled at this faculty. The teaching staff at the faculty consists of 170 lecturers (seven full professors).

IV. Assessment of the study programme(s)

1. Quality of the Curriculum

Bachelor/Master Degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field.

The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Description

1.1 Geography (Bachelor)

The faculty uses a graduation profile for the study programme based on an analysis of labour market needs. As outlined in the SER, the Bachelor programme "Geography" investigate natural resources, environmental or disaster analysis, regional and urban planning, and geospatial information. These are given as the primary labour market targets. It is stated that the graduation profile is based on the results of the labour market analysis, including governmental agencies, public and private sectors, the industry and businesses and included the latest trends in the discipline. Based on these results, the curriculum was modified in 2019 (the former curriculum has been in place since 2015). Furthermore, the programme leadership has compared similar programmes on a national scale.

In general, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level have been designed according to the national qualifications framework (level 6) and differentiate between attitude, knowledge, generic and specific skills. Apart from more value-driven generic skills and competencies, graduates of the programme will have field-specific knowledge and competencies in concepts and methods of geographical data gathering, the human role in geosphere processes, and environmental resources' role to find adequate solutions for environmental problems and disaster. Furthermore, graduates are able to formulate geosphere data and information, determine solutions by applying geographical theories and concepts, and apply territorial theory using remote sensing and geographic information system technology.

As outlined in the SER, the curricular structure of the programme is designed using a matrix. The current curriculum consists of a total of 149 credit points (CP). The curriculum differentiates between university courses (24 CP), faculty courses (10 CP), and study programme specific courses (115 CP). University courses consist of "Pancasila Education" (2 CP), "Citizenship Education" (2 CP), "Indonesian Language" (2 CP), "Conservation Education" (2 CP), "Religion Education" (2 CP), "Internships" (4 CP), "Community Service" (4 CP), and the Bachelor thesis (6 P). Faculty courses consist of a total of four courses ("Introduction to Social Sciences" 3 CP, "Socio-Cultural Conservation" 3 CP, "English" 2 CP, and "Entrepreneurship" 2 CP). The study programme specific courses are divided into compulsory (97 CP) and elective courses (18 CP). It is stated that students have to take all compulsory courses within the first seven semesters, while elective courses can be taken between the fourth and the eighth semester.

All courses are assigned to a defined number of credits. Based on Indonesia's national regulations, one credit of non-practical courses consists of 50 minutes of face-to-face teaching per week per semester, 60 minutes of structured assignments per week per semester, and 60 minutes of self-learning per week per semester. One credit of practical courses consists of 170 minutes per week per semester.

Experts' Evaluation

During the online site visit, the department presented the graduation profile and the intended learning outcomes. The curriculum structure for the programme includes nationally prescribed courses and discipline-specific courses that lay good foundations for geography studies. Nonetheless, it became evident during the discussions that the programme aims at natural resource analysis, environmental or disaster analysis, spatial, rural and urban planning, and geoinformation, where the programme clearly has its strengths, and which provides students with essential skills, knowledge, and competencies on level 6 of the national qualifications framework (*Sarjana I*). However, this is diametrical to geography programmes in higher education being a centring science combining a broad spectrum of content (e.g., physical geography, anthropogeography, regional geography). These topics are not fully reflected in the curriculum. The experts are fully aware that the department has to move within a rather regulatory framework without many possibilities of relabelling study programmes (as is the case in Europe). However, the experts believe that the department and the university deprive them of a chance to strengthen their visibility in the Indonesian higher education system. The discussions with the labour market helped clarify that graduates are employed in the field of spatial analysis, spatial planning, and geographic information processing. At this moment, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level cover a general description of a geography programme. However, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level must be specified considering the strength of the Bachelor programme "Geography" in spatial planning and rural development (**Finding 1**). Carefully catered and clearly outlining the strengths in spatial planning and rural development, the department will fulfil its ambition to become more visible in the national higher education system and beyond.

In light of this context, the curriculum has been further developed, considering evaluations of students, graduate surveys, or labour market feedback. The curriculum is based in the first year on a mix of nationally prescribed courses and introductory courses (e.g., introduction to geography) and more advanced courses later. The achievement of the intended learning outcomes is demonstrated with a Bachelor's thesis placed in the last year of the curriculum. Students are also to take an internship in the last year. The curriculum is generally characterised as a strict curriculum with a clear indication of which courses have to be taken throughout the Bachelor's programme. The curriculum offers only a few electives starting in the fourth semester and a more significant emphasis in the last semester. The field of geography becomes more international, and a good command of English will be needed to share regional topics to the external world and in the light of lifelong learning aspects. Therefore, room should be given to students to expand their language competencies (**Finding 2**).

The experts have been provided with an ideal study plan available to students that supports them to manoeuvre through their studies. The comprehensive Learning Management System (LMS) Elena explained to the experts helps students understand the elements of the curriculum and their functions. All programme components are documented. However, the experts have been eager to learn more about the actual situation of the courses during the confirmation site visit. In case of changes in the curriculum, these changes should be transparently documented by the department management. All components of the curriculum are assigned to a number of local credits.

Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

1.2 Sports Sciences (Bachelor)

Using national regulations provided by the Ministry, provisions for level 6 programmes of the national qualifications framework, and the nationally wide acting consortium for Sports Sciences study programme in

Indonesia, the faculty has designed the intended learning outcomes on the programme level based on a graduation profile which enables graduates to fill vacancies in the sports analysis, sports research, fitness, sports business or sports events sector.

The faculty has translated the profile into intended learning outcomes on the programme level based on this graduation profile. Following the SER, the programme has 14 ILOs, differentiated into four categories (attitude, knowledge, generic, and specific skills), and covers discipline and non-discipline related learning outcomes. The department outlines that the curriculum is built so that the learner's progression is considered and in line with the graduate's profile. Like all Universitas Negeri Semarang programmes, the department uses a matrix to align the courses with the ILOs on the programme level.

The current curriculum is the result of a review made in 2019, which replaces the 2015 curriculum. It is stated that the department considered different instruments when further developing the curriculum, such as results of internal and external stakeholder evaluations, an actualisation of the programme content and technology-wise, and adjustments on the nationally defined regulations (Indonesian Qualifications framework, benchmarking with similar programmes, national higher education standards). Furthermore, the programme has been aligned with the higher education institution's vision and mission, respecting the institution's core values. The current curriculum comprises 144 national credits (SKS), and the programme has a typical length of eight semesters. The design of the curriculum allows students to take a maximum of 20 credits per semester. The curriculum consists of five different course types: Compulsory university courses (26 credits), compulsory faculty courses (one credit), study programme-related compulsory courses (97 credits), study programme-related elective courses (10 credits out of 14 courses offered), and compulsory specialisation courses (10 credits).

As for all programmes undergoing the international accreditation procedure, it is stated that all courses have a predefined number of credits. Non-practical courses cover 50 minutes of face-to-face teaching per week per semester, 60 minutes of structured assignments per week per semester, and 60 minutes of self-learning per week per semester. One credit of practical courses consists of 170 minutes per week per semester. This is a national regulation in Indonesia.

Experts' Evaluation

The Sports Science study programme at the faculty of Sports Science started in 1999 and can be seen as a well-established bachelor programme within UNNES. The study programme has been the object of national accreditation in 2016 and has been recently re-accredited in 2021. Those recent (national) accreditations have been finalised with A-level results. The labour market representatives appreciate the skills, knowledge and competencies of the Sports Science graduates. The labour market especially appreciates their attitude (supposedly work attitude/team players), and they are described as fast learners. It was stated that only 10 to 20% of the graduates were unemployed. The Sports Science department – within the faculty of Sports Science – offers five tracks (as mentioned above). The experts believe that the Bachelor's programme "Sports Science" offers a curriculum that covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge and includes methodological and general skills. It became evident that the matrix of the graduation profile and the curriculum transparently described the courses for each track. However, it also reveals that many courses are part of the general profile, and that gives the impression that the discriminatory power of the track in the light of profile might be relatively low and that the distinctiveness of the track should be sharpened and carefully integrated into the graduation profile (**Finding 3**).

According to the senior management of UNNES, "both national and international labour market representatives are involved in adapting current developments to the study programmes. There are discipline-specific and also interdisciplinary aspects within this programme. The intended learning outcomes are appropriate and balanced (i.e. ratio theory/practical courses) according to the feedback of stakeholders, respectively the students and alumni the experts talked to.

In discussion with the staff of the Sports Science study programme, it became evident that the staff received a grant to internationalise the curriculum commanded by the panel of experts. The academic degree and the intended learning outcomes correspond with level 6 of the Indonesian qualifications framework. The documentation presented to the experts showed a clear matrix demonstrating how the intended attitude, knowledge, generic and specific skills are transferred into the curriculum.

It has been stated that the current curriculum results from an analysis of the labour market, which fits the labour market needs. However, the panel of experts detected a potential overlap which might be a chance to create synergies within the faculty. In various discussions, it has been stated that graduates of this programme can also work as teachers in physical education. This statement is a bit ambiguous because the faculty has a specific department for physical education with obviously different intended learning outcomes on the programme level. The experts are fully aware that the faculty might have good reasons to offer these programmes parallelly, but, on the one hand, the chance of creating synergies might be beneficial for both programmes, and, on the other, the programme intended learning outcomes/graduation profile for the Sports Science programme does not include physical education. It might be the case that the educational job market is fully open to Sports Science graduates, but, in consequence, the Sports Science curriculum has to cover additionally in-depth courses on (sports) pedagogy, (sports) didactics, and school internships. Either the intended learning outcomes exclude this opportunity for students, or the curriculum integrates opportunities for students to have so-called career changer courses. The experts believe that the latter might be a suitable solution to provide students with chances to meet the requirements to become fully qualified teachers in physical education with the necessary educational competencies.

The documentation on the courses has been presented to the experts. It became evident that the curriculum structure fits the achievement of the learning outcomes on becoming a sport scientist. The order within the curriculum supports the learner's progression starting with introductory courses at the beginning and more advanced courses at later stages. The intended learning outcomes are demonstrated with a Bachelor's thesis in the last year, and students take an internship to gain professional experience in the job market. It has been stated that students sometimes start working after graduation in companies where they had their internships which is a good indicator.

Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

1.3 Guidance and Counselling (Bachelor)

The department outlines that the intended learning outcomes on the programme level for the Bachelor programme "Guidance and Counselling" are based on the Indonesian national qualifications framework for Bachelor programmes, the teacher education standard in its latest version, the recommendations and feedback from the study programme's forum, and the considerations of the responsible study programme leadership. The programme is developed to reflect level 6 of the national qualifications framework (Bachelor level). The programme's design focuses on students who strive to become instructors or facilitators, research assistants in the discipline, laboratory assistants, media developers, entrepreneurs or motivators in the guidance and counselling discipline. The department used this graduation profile for Bachelor students and translated the skills, knowledge, professional skills and qualifications into ILOs on the programme level. The ILOs focus, on a general level, on competencies such as attitude, knowledge, generic and specific skills. The SER indicates that the programme has a total of eleven ILOs on the programme level. The duration of the study programme is four years, and the programme consists of 142 national credit points (SKS), which have to be achieved in a

total of 60 courses. It is stated that the curriculum is divided into general knowledge courses (122 CP) and elementary school specialisation (20 CP).

As outlined above, the current curriculum (set up and rearranged in 2018) was arranged based on feedback from different stakeholders and national regulations. The programme has also benchmarked with several national higher education institutions and other higher education institutions in the region (e.g. Malaysia or Brunei Darussalam). It is stated that these changes have been taken into consideration and replaced the curriculum from 2015. The SER outlines that these refinements were based on a so-called “freedom to learn” provision from the Ministry of Education and Culture. This provision strives for a more student-centred learning process and enables students to determine activities and course types freely. This learning format includes eight activities, called student exchange, internships, teaching assistance, research, humanity projects, entrepreneurship, independent projects, and so-called thematic villages. Besides this, students can choose specialised courses (40 credits of the curriculum) as elective courses. These courses can be taken outside the study programme, outside the faculty, or even outside the university.

Experts' Evaluation

Following the graduation profile of the department, the experts can verify that the curriculum fits the graduation profile. The programme describes that the programme graduates are specially employed as educators, research assistants, media developers, entrepreneurs and motivators in guidance and counselling. The curriculum aligns with this graduation profile and supports the achievement of the expected graduate competencies. The relation between courses and graduate learning outcomes is clearly illustrated on the curriculum map, as shown in the structure of all intended learning outcomes on the course level. Despite that, it became apparent during the site visit that the programme also enables graduates to work in an international employment field, such as the American School Counsellor Association (ASCA), which shows a good level of visibility of graduates in the market. However, this visibility is instead on an informal level than visible in the documentation of the programme. Therefore, it might be wise to include these employment fields in the graduation profile to strengthen the department's profile in a highly competitive market (**Finding 4**).

The experts appreciate the solid curriculum with a clear distinction between aspects of knowledge, attitudes and skills. The number of credits offered allows students to gain theoretical and practical scientific foundations qualified as prospective guidance and counselling scholars. The courses offered consist of general courses (122 credits) and specialisations (20 credits) which students must take within four years. The final results of the student study achievements are stated in a final project in the form of a Bachelor's thesis. Students' success in defending their respective thesis is one of the requirements for obtaining a Bachelor of Education degree in the field of guidance and counselling. An internship in the last year of the curriculum provides students with a level of practical experience.

During the site visit, it became evident that the study programme has a long-standing history, being one of the first programmes of Guidance and Counselling in the Indonesian higher education system. The curriculum is regularly evaluated and updated. This happens regularly every four years, in the light of internal and external stakeholders' perspectives. The updates are also reviewed by academia and professional association to meet the latest development of science and the labour market. The documentation of the courses is adequate and covers all relevant aspects. This documentation enables the department management and the students to have a clear overview of the progression throughout the study programme.

Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

1.4 Early Childhood Teacher Education (Bachelor)

The Bachelor study programme department uses a graduation profile based on various internal and external stakeholders' involvement while considering the university's and faculty's mission and vision and the national qualifications framework for level 6 programmes (Bachelor level). It is stated that the students will be enabled to take positions as early childhood educators (assistant and junior assistant teachers), researchers, or early childhood centre managers, after having completed the study programme. It is stated that the department uses other areas of expertise, such as inclusive education, non-formal education, or psychology, coming from other departments to add these areas to the core area of Early Childhood Teacher Education.

It is shown that the graduates' profile is translated into intended learning outcomes on the programme level. These ILOs are differentiated into generic and special skills, knowledge, and attitude components. The programme has 13 ILOs on the programme level. The four-year programme has 144 national credit points, differentiated into compulsory courses (university and faculty courses), programme-related programmes, and elective courses.

The current curriculum is based on the latest changes made in 2018. The programme itself was developed and inaugurated in 2008 (revised in 2012 and 2015). It is stated that the changes made were based on the changing needs of the labour market. Furthermore, the programme was the subject of a national benchmarking project which compared similar study programmes from the national higher education system and the South-east Asian region. As a result of this project, students can take some courses (during the first and the fifth semester) in Early Childhood Teacher Education or pedagogy at other universities. The SER points out that the ILOs on the course level for these courses are identical to UNNES courses, so the graduation profile and the ILOs on programme level are not harmed.

Experts' Evaluation

The Bachelor programme "Early Childhood Teacher Education" was presented as a pioneering programme that is not offered in many universities in Indonesia. Before 2007, there was only one department in Indonesia; in 2007, seven additional departments were opened. In 2014, the Bachelor's degree was defined as the minimum requirement to work as an ECTE teacher, and as of 2021, 96 departments are active in the Indonesian higher education system. The department at UNNES was developed and inaugurated in 2008.

Based on the information, the curriculum's order supports the learner's progression, and the academic degree corresponds to level 6 of the Indonesian qualifications framework and to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). It could be testified that the elements of the programme's curriculum are documented, and an apparent reference is given to the national credits and the expected workload.

The intended learning outcomes on the programme level are in line with the graduation profile for Early Childhood Teacher Education in Indonesia. It became evident that the graduation profile was designed according to governmental directives. However, the panel of experts believe that the current graduation profile does not fully reflect the current status quo of graduates' employment. The documentation evidence indicated that the programme focuses on early childcare, kindergarten and schools, being the main institutional context of the labour market. However, in reality, the discussions showed that graduates of this programme are employed in labour market areas outside of this spectrum. In the light of chapter IV.2 of this report and concerning the interaction with the labour market, the graduation profile must be updated and in line with the current status quo of employment fields (**Finding 5**). From an external perspective, this will be beneficial to the programme and enable the department to stand out in the Indonesian higher education sector.

The department explained holistically to the panel of experts how the intended learning outcomes on the programme level are being transferred into the curriculum. The intended learning outcomes on the course level reflect the programme level and are subject-specific and interdisciplinary. Regular curricular modifications

contribute to an improvement in programme quality. The programme was revised in 2012 and 2015; the current curriculum is based on the latest changes made in 2018. It is stated that the changes made were based on the changing needs of the labour market. Following the tri dharma education approach of the university, the experts believe that the societal impact for this department might be even more vital as it is currently. The experts believe that interdisciplinary aspects will be the future in the discipline, and the interaction between social workers and Early Childhood Teacher Educationalists should be considered more in-depth. The study programme might unfold even more societal impact as the provision of education and support to children in need could be realised with greater scope. Topics of child protection, inclusion or family and relationship services could be fostered within the curriculum in the future (**Finding 6**).

The curriculum differentiates between compulsory and elective courses (with a current ratio of 58 to 8 courses).

Despite the high number of areas covered in the courses (66 modules), the programme provides the opportunity for in-depth study of the subjects. They include the nationally compulsory units as well as field-specific units. The subject-specific units are often also split to align with national regulations (as a result, the number of modules corresponds to the number of courses regulated by the national framework). Given the broadness of the discipline, the department could reflect on possibilities to provide students with opportunities to specialise in specific areas via discipline-specific electives (**Finding 7**). This might lead to a natural specification of the graduation profile and a broader spectrum of professional activity.

The curriculum aims to provide a combination of theoretical courses and practical components within the curriculum. The documentation of the programmes indicates 32 theoretical courses (69.6%) while 14 courses have a relatively practical character (30.4%). However, some theoretical courses integrate also practical components. This mix is appropriate according to the needs of the labour market. It became evident that the programme has initially been a Diploma 3 programme until the shift towards an academisation of the discipline was initiated in Indonesia. The experts congratulate the department for their success with this shift, providing solid theoretical and practical components. However, the online site visit clarified that graduates also strive to pursue scientific paths towards academia. Given the context of the discipline as a whole, the experts believe that it might be very beneficial for the programme if further attention to theoretical foundations of the discipline should be paid to foster these paths in the future (**Finding 8**).

On the other end of the programme, the curriculum indicates that practical components are integrated into the curriculum in terms of an internship in the last year of the study programme. The experts are in favor this approach, being a valuable source of practical experience for students. However, it became clear that these internships focus rather on the primary education sector. In the light of the necessity of resharpening the graduation profile, it might be wise to expand the possibilities of internships to other relevant sectors (**Finding 9**).

Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for Quality Assurance

Bachelor/Master Degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

Following the national policies for the quality assurance of higher education programmes in Indonesia, UNNES states that an internal and external quality assurance system has been implemented for all study programmes. In 2015, the university implemented the ISO 9001: 2015 quality management system and in 2018 IWA2 from PT AUR. The university level's quality assurance system follows a continuous cycle, including quality standard setting, quality standard implementation, quality standard control, and continuous improvement. As a result of this system, UNNES has developed several instruments, policies, or manuals to assure the quality of its programmes, focusing on the values in education, research, and community service of the programmes (academic policy), on the quality of the graduates (quality policy), and the implementation of the quality management system (quality manual). It is described that UNNES uses more than 30 quality procedures for the programmes for the whole student-life cycle (from admission to graduation). These instruments aim to enable the faculty and study programme leader to monitor and further develop the study programmes.

One of the key aspects is the evaluation of teaching and learning processes. The monitoring procedures, which apply to all programme in this cluster, include the availability of teaching materials (conducted through the SIKADU programme), the number of lecturer and student meetings (monitored through the Mulang programme), the student advisory sessions (SIBIMA) and the student thesis monitoring (SITEDI). As outlined in the SER, UNNES keeps track of the lecturer evaluation, which students hand in at the end of each course. These evaluations are based on the lecture materials, didactical competencies, and quality of the course. The results of these evaluations will be analysed and shared with the teaching staff of the respective courses. The SER indicates that the university uses an integrated academic system (called SIKADU 2.0), which teachers can use for the internal management of the courses (attendance, timetables, grading of students). Furthermore, the class attendance, class activities, internship reports, and the examination for all courses can be monitored by the systems used at UNNES.

Also, it is outlined that periodical review with programme-specific stakeholders is carried out. This covers workshops involving stakeholder representatives, policymakers, and similar programme leaders. A review of the curriculum takes place at least every four years, if needed, even every two years. The feedback also includes the relevant infrastructure, laboratories, IT facilities, and student services.

With instruments focusing on the research output, the university focuses on the one hand on how study programmes interact with the community and on the other side on the question of how latest research developments are integrated into the teaching activities for the respective programme.

Experts' Evaluation

The responsibilities and targets within the quality assurance systems of UNNES are defined and available, and have been transparently presented in the self-evaluation report. The internal and external quality assurance systems ensure the continuous improvement of all study programmes. The students are well informed about the responsibilities within the programme and for programme elements. The quality assurance systems for the relevant study programmes involve instruments with different scopes. Evaluations of teaching and learning processes, research output, teaching and research facilities and students progression are carried out regularly through the online platforms of UNNES. In addition, there frequently are also non-formal discussion

rounds between lecturers and students, where teaching and learning processes are discussed. Evaluations of the stakeholders' feedback are done by conducting a tracer study for alumni and by organising focus group discussions with different stakeholders. However, this system is rather informal and a systematic closing of the PDCA cycle is currently not fully implemented. Thus, it is required that the PDCA cycle for all programmes is systematically closed, e.g., by monitor and evaluate the existing processes and formalise them. Special attention has to be paid to the establishment of regular and structured labour market focus groups to follow new developments in the relevant discipline closely (**Finding 10**). Establishing regular and structured labour market focus groups to account for more formalized quality assurance measures is strongly recommended (**Finding 11**). The self-evaluation report includes very well developed standard operating procedures for curriculum preparations, internships, (online) teaching internships and preparations of lesson plans. These kinds of standard operating procedures are missing for the earlier described evaluations. For example, it is not noted, how often focus group discussions are being held, how the participants are selected and how these discussions are structured. It is also unclear, if detailed evaluation results are only shared and discussed with teaching staff and members from the management on the programme, faculty and university level or in addition also with students and labour market representatives. Therefore, it has to be demonstrated how results of the quality assurance procedures are shared with all relevant internal and external stakeholders (**Finding 12**).

The career progression of graduates from the study programme is followed and data on alumni experiences are considered during further development of the study programmes through a tracer study and the focus group discussions. The focus group discussions also give the opportunity to get information from other relevant sources (e.g. ministries, chambers and associations) and to use them for the development of the programmes.

Information on the composition of the student bodies of the study programmes is available and it shows high numbers of applications for the programmes in the years 2015 to 2019. The decrease in registration numbers, especially in 2019, is explained by a new enrolment system, that has been implemented by the ministry of education and which resulted in a nation-wide decline of student numbers. Detailed information on the duration of studies have not been made available for the panel of experts. Nevertheless, between 2015 and 2019, dropouts of students have only been registered for the Early Childhood Teacher Education programme and students are supported by mentoring lecturers, dedicated support programmes and policies for each study programme to finish their studies on time.

Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students

Bachelor/Master Degree
<p><i>The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.</i></p> <p><i>Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.</i></p> <p><i>Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.3]</p>

Description

The Academic handbook gives insights on the implementation of teaching and learning activities at UNNES. Focussing on a student-centred teaching approach, lecturers implement their courses as group discussion, simulations, case studies, cooperative learning activities, project- or problem-based learning. It is stated that

the quality assurance mechanisms focus on a student-centred teaching and learning approach in the courses. The university has implemented that teaching staff can offer face-to-face and online learning methods. While face-to-face sessions are scheduled, teachers can use the learning management system ELENA to provide online teaching to the class. Although this platform was already in place before 2020, it is stated that this was, especially valuable during the COVID-19 lockdown. Teachers can use the system to upload documents, provide additional materials or to attach questionnaires.

For the programmes, an active role in the learning process is taken by students especially in discussions, problem-based learning activities, and courses that focus on smaller research projects. Furthermore, practical courses (e.g., geosphere phenomenon study related courses for the “Geography” programme, teaching practice for the “Guidance and Counselling” programme, or field trips and practical courses for the “Early Childhood Teacher” and the “Sports Sciences” programme) or internships are intended to give students useful experiences.

Regarding the assessment type of courses, the SER states that the approach and the examination type highly depend on the course level's intended learning outcomes. In general, there are two types of examination: a paper-based examination, and a performance-based examination. While typically theoretical courses will have a paper-based examination, a performance-based examination or a project will be used in a course that combines theory and practice. The final project includes an oral defence. Students will have to present their scientific paper, and the examiners will raise some questions for a deeper understanding. These examination types are clarified in the UNNES Academic Handbook.

The higher education institution uses a predefined final scoring formula to calculate the final score for each course. This formula is based on the score of continuous assessment (so-called daily score), mid-term result, and the result of the final examination. Students need to score a minimum of 51 out of 100 to pass a course. The higher education institution outlines that students have the chance to appeal against the examination results. If a C Score or lower (65 out of 100 points) is obtained, the lecturer can automatically provide a re-sit option for the examination. It is stated that this re-sit option can either be the same examination method or writing a scientific paper. Appeals concerning the final score can be done within one month after the final score was announced. The flow of the procedure is shown in the Quality Procedure Manual.

Experts' Evaluation

Based on the discussion during the site visit, the experts conclude that the teaching and learning activities and the assessment procedures are comprehensively conceptualised. The teaching and learning activities address the specific needs of students and their diversity, enabling flexible learning paths to a certain degree. Generally speaking, the methods of teaching, learning, and assessment applied support an interlacing of theoretical and practical aspects.

The didactic methods stimulate student motivation, self-reflection, and engagement in the learning process and the designs of the study programs ensure that the students are familiarised with an appropriate spectrum of examination types over the course of their studies. However, it appears to the experts that student-centred learning approaches are not fully implemented yet, and components to foster the matter should be implemented on a broader scale in the teaching methods during the classes (**Finding 13**).

UNNES has two examination periods (mid-term and final examination). This enables the university to predefine the examination dates in the academic calendar. For the examination weeks, the examination committee is responsible for these periods' organisation (Examination arrangements, information on the date and overseeing the examinations). The committees consist of representatives of the university, the faculty, and the respective programmes. Based on the Academic handbook, a student must meet at least 75% of the attendance rate

to attend the examination. It is stated that in case of illness or other reasons for absence during the examination periods, students can get their examination rescheduled.

The assessment regulations and procedures are defined and made readily available in published form to the students. According to the faculties and confirmed by the students, the assessment methods are made transparently available to students at the beginning of the courses and via the ELENA platform. The study programmes describe how their didactic concepts and methods correspond to the intended learning outcomes and assessment methods (e.g. for the Bachelor's programme "Geography": knowledge = written test, skills = assignment during the semester, attitude = observation by professor; for the Bachelor's programme "Guidance and Counselling": theoretical aspects / knowledge: rubric for assessment, practical skills / competency = observation, internship performance). However, across the study programmes, the students seem to be enabled to transfer their knowledge to situations outside the university context, although, according to the estimates and assumptions of the stakeholders, the programs differ with respect to qualifying for the continuative academic vs. the workplace / practical path (balanced out vs. emphasize on workplace / practical path).

Students of all study programmes receive support and guidance concerning the organisation of the examination processes. It became evident that students at some instances know about the appeal regulations. However, this appears to the experts to be rather on an informal scale than as a formalised procedure.

Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification

Bachelor/Master Degree
<i>Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.</i>
[ESG 1.4]

Description

The admission procedures for the programmes which are assessed in this cluster follow national regulations which have different levels: the national selection of state universities (SNMPTN), respectively the joint selection of state universities (SBMPTN), and independent selection procedure at UNNES (SM-UNNES). While SNMPTN and SBMPTN are based on the state university entrance examination results, SM-UNNES is applicable for students with extraordinary achievements in sports or arts and who have passed an English language plus an academic potential test. Furthermore, these students must provide evidence that tuition fees and expenses during the study periods will be covered. The higher education institution publishes the different possibilities to enrol at UNNES on its homepage. Special admission regulations are indicated for the "Geography", "Sports Sciences", and "Early Childhood Teachers Education" study programme. Since "Geography" and "Early Childhood Teachers Education" have some bilingual classes, applicants must pass an English proficiency test. Furthermore, it is outlined that the applicants for the study programme "Sports Sciences" must submit a sports achievement form and a health certificate. Applicants for "Geography" who are colour blind are not allowed to enter the programme.

The SER shows data on the applicants for the respective programmes and students enrolled in the programmes for the last five years (2015 – 2019). The data show that the programme's enrollment quota has been stable for the programmes without any significant dropdown in the last years. In 2020, the current number of enrolled students was for "Geography" (563 students enrolled; 302 males and 261 females), for "Sports

Sciences” (660 students; 475 males and 185 females), for “Guidance and Counselling” (476 students; 106 males and 370 females), and for “Early Childhood Teacher Education” (559 students; 13 males and 546 females). Following the instruments as mentioned above for quality assurance of the programmes, the teaching staff and the programme management can use the internal platforms to monitor students' progression.

Following the so-called “Merdeka Belajar” project (“Freedom to learn”), UNNES cooperates with national and international higher education institutions, and other institutions, such as professional organisations, social communities, or educational institutions. UNNES can recognise courses that students have taken at these institutions within the respective curriculum.

“Guidance and Counselling” students have been actively engaged in the Indonesian Guidance and Counselling Association (ABKIN), the Indonesian Counsellors Association (IKI), or the Assalafi Miftahul Huda Islamic Boarding School.

The programme “Early Childhood Teacher Education” has collaborations with the Universitas Negeri Padang (Padang State University) and the Universitas Negeri Gorontalo (Gorontalo State University) but is also cooperating with the Indonesian Early Childhood Teacher Education Association (APGPAUD Indonesia), and several partnering schools which are relevant for the internships. On an international level, the programme is cooperating with the higher education institutions Whitireia New Zealand, University of Auckland (New Zealand), University of Hull (United Kingdom), Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris (Malaysia), Trnava University (Slovakia), University of Agder (Norway), La Trobe University (Australia), and Flinders University (Australia).

Students enrolled in the study programme “Geography” can take online courses at partner universities for one semester. A national exchange programme enables this through credit transfer system and information technology (PERMATA-SAKTI). Also, the programme has an agreement with several governmental agencies, such as the Regional Planning and Development Agency (BAPPEDA), the Spatial Planning/National Land Agency (BPN-ATR), the Environmental Services (DLH), or the National Space Aviation Institute (LAPAN).

Courses taken at other higher education institutions or internships at collaborating partner organisations are recorded in the transcript of records for students. Besides, UNNES aims to support all students to participate in national and international competitions. The results and certificates of these participations can be uploaded to the electronic student file as an additional achievement. After completing the respective study programme, graduates will receive documents that describe the student's qualification and competencies. They will receive the degree certificate, transcript of records and the diploma supplement.

Experts' Evaluation

UNNES has a fairly complete student admission system, including selection policies, selection criteria, and admission procedures, which are carried out consistently and listed on an easy-to-access website. The criteria, procedures, and requirements for choosing a particular study programme have been determined and are available to the public, as listed on the website of UNNES and their respective study programmes. Quantitatively, data on admission procedures for past cohorts, for the four study programmes that have been assessed over the past five years, is available. The available data shows that the four study programmes have a relatively stable number of registrants from year to year. Efforts to strengthen student competence are accommodated through student services which are divided into two, namely: (1) Student academic guidance services in the form of mentoring processes from academic advisors lecturers since students are accepted, following the learning process until students graduate. (2) Non-academic services: (a) student activity units (UKM) with various development focuses, associations as student organizations, and other services that facilitate students in developing their potential; and (b) career services (job vacancies, alumni, and scholarships).

In order to ensure that students can graduate on time, each study program has a preventive programme. The programme is in the form of integrating several courses, giving students the opportunity to take acceleration

in completing their final assignments, as well as meeting with parents at the beginning of the lecture to build mutual commitment.

The process of recognizing student learning experiences has been strengthened by establishing partnerships with several universities abroad, which allows for exchanges between students and participating in various international competitions. Internally, UNNES has also adopted the policy of "Merdeka Belajar" which is supported by an adequate curriculum and system support.

Recognition of learning outcomes and mastery of student competencies is formally given in the form of certificates in accordance with the scientific disciplines of each study programme. In addition to diplomas, at the time of graduation, students are also given transcripts of grades and SKPI (Certificate of Companion for Diplomas) which contain acknowledgment of supporting activities during their time as students in various fields outside of academia.

The awarding of degrees in each study programme has followed the provisions of the Ministry of National Education. Graduates of the Guidance and Counseling Study Program and ECTE receive an S.Pd. degree, a Geography graduate earns an S.Si. degree, while a Sports Science graduate obtains an S.Or. degree.

Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching Staff

Bachelor/Master Degree
<p><i>The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.</i></p> <p><i>Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.5]</p>

Description

Following national regulations, the recruitment systems at higher education institutions in Indonesia are identical at all HEIs. The requirements describe the prerequisites of applicants covering applicants' educational background, expertise, and experience. It is stated that the minimum academic qualification for a lecturer is a Master degree, while for other academic staff members it may vary depending on the needs of the programme. Lecturers at UNNES can be divided into three different status types: Civil Servant Lecturers (PNS), Contract Lecturer, and Adjunct Lecturers. It is stated that the overall workload of teaching staff is evaluated annually. The workload includes time for education, but also time for research and community service. University-wide, the lecturer has to perform a minimum workload which is an equivalent to twelve credit points. In case lecturers work more than this equivalent, they will get a bonus in remuneration. The general teaching workload for full-time lecturers is 38 working hours per week (for civil servant lecturers), which refers to twelve credit points. In case of changes in the teaching body due to retirement, it is stated that the process to replace this person starts six years before the actual retirement to use the knowledge and expertise and continuous development within the teaching body.

The SER outlines that UNNES supports the teaching staff to participate in several career development possibilities. The possibilities cover degree-related development options (support for PhD studies) and personal development plans. The support is organised by the head of the study programme and faculty leaders. UNNES

offers lecture management and method training programmes that focus on an applied approach in teaching concerning the professional development of staff. This is carried out as workshops and training. Discipline-related and competency-related development of staff (including non-academic staff) is carried by providing training and workshops at UNNES and outside the higher education institution. This includes ISO certified training and workshops to administrative staff.

As listed in the SER, the “Geography” programme has a total of two professors, 13 associate professors, nine assistant professors, and six lecturers, out of whom 15 are holding a PhD title. The programme is supported by four librarians (from the faculty library), three laboratory/technical assistants, and ten administrative workers.

The “Sports Sciences” programme has three professors, 16 associate professors, eleven assistant professors, and three lecturers. 13 of these teaching staff members hold a PhD title. The study programme's administrative part is supported by eleven librarian (Sports Sciences Library), eleven laboratory/technical assistants, and 19 administrative members.

The academic teaching staff for the “Guidance and Counselling” Bachelor programme consists of three professors, eight associate professors, two assistant professors, and ten lecturers (out of whom eight are holding a PhD degree). The programme is supported by seven librarians (coming from the faculty), eleven assistants, and 38 administrative workers.

The Bachelor programme “Early Childhood Teachers Education” has five associate professors, seven assistant professors, and five lecturers, which sums up to a total of 17 academic staff members for the programme out of whom four are PhD holders. The programme is supported by seven librarians, eleven assistants, and 38 administrative personnel.

Experts' Evaluation

Based on the documentation, the experts can testify that all human resources involved in teaching in the programmes are documented. The number of teaching staff involved in the programmes is sufficient in the light of the student's numbers. The background of the teaching staff involved fit to the intended learning outcomes on the programme level. Within this cluster, some differences are indicated given the historical context and the academic tradition of the programmes. For instance, currently no full professors but five associate professors are involved in teaching in the “Early Childhood Teacher Education” programme, but this is logical given the systematic changes in the Indonesian higher education system for this discipline in the early 2000s years, as explained in the chapter IV.1 of this report.

The academic output of staff is visible although many publications deal with small-scale research approaches and case analyses involving regional actors. Some publications are published in journals that are published by the university. In many instances, this makes sense due to an anchoring process of the programmes in the region.

In this aspect, it might be wise to implement a system that assures constant improvement of academic English competencies of staff (**Finding 14**). This will expand research opportunities with countries outside Southeast Asia and a stronger connection to international research. Despite that it was clearly seen that UNNES strives to a stronger internationalisation, being a crucial part of their mission, and first steps are already visible. The experts command this step-by-step approach to prevent the faculties from an institutional shock. On a regional level, it has been demonstrated that the teaching staff has opportunities to present their research activities to externals. An encouragement is given to provide additional opportunities beyond those regional activities.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning Resources and Student Support

Bachelor/Master Degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

Being a public university, the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia funds the learning facilities for the programmes. The programmes' relevant budget is distributed from the UNNES budget to the faculty budget, and then to the respective programmes. In general, the budget focuses on three pillars (teaching, research, and community service).

In general, all programmes can use classrooms, reading rooms, laboratories (if needed), meeting rooms, study management rooms, thesis examinations rooms, and public facilities. The classrooms have different sizes and include supporting facilities, such as desks, blackboards, computers, sound systems, LCDs, and air conditioners. All classrooms have access to Wi-Fi as a support to the e-learning process. Apart from facilities, students have access to several multipurpose buildings, libraries, UNNES health centre, places of worship, sports centres, student dormitories, entrepreneur buildings, counselling and career services, computer laboratories, language villages, or student activity centre buildings. In the following, study programme-related facilities will be described, but these are always shared with other programmes in the respective faculty.

The "Geography" Bachelor programme has access to eleven sub laboratories, such as a soil laboratory, cartography laboratory, disaster education laboratory, geology and geomorphology laboratory, GIS laboratory, soil measurement laboratory, remote sensing laboratory, micro-teaching laboratory, meteorology climatology laboratory, hydrology laboratory, and a demographics laboratory. The "Sports Sciences" Bachelor programme has access to six laboratories/studios (Sports massage, anatomy and physiology, aerobic dance studio, human performance, physical therapy laboratory, and nutrition laboratory) and nine sports facilities (basketball court, volleyball court, indoor and outdoor tennis court, athletic field, football field, softball fields, gymnastics hall, woodball field, a minigolf course, badminton court, petanque field, and a swimming pool). Whereas the "Guidance and Counselling" Bachelor programme includes facilities for individual, group, and family counselling laboratories, the "Early Childhood Teacher Education" programme has five laboratories (Music & recording, microteaching, dance laboratory, makeup & apparel laboratory and a growth development laboratory and counselling corner).

Students in all programmes have access to the general library and the respective faculty library. UNNES is cooperating with several reference sources from regional and national libraries, enabling UNNES to grant access to national and international journals. Students can access these books and journals via an online platform system.

To provide a comprehensive and close support of students from the beginning, all study programmes have implemented orientation programmes for new students at UNNES. They will be provided with the academic guidebooks, which gives them information on UNNES, the faculty, and the respective study programme. Students will get an academic adviser to assist them concerning academic and non-academic matters at the beginning of their studies. The advisory session with students will happen four times per semester, and the result of these sessions are uploaded on the student guidance and information system in order to be able to follow up on specific topics or issues.

International students are supported by several university entities, such as BIPA programme (Indonesian Language for Foreign Speakers). Both national and international students have the possibility to attend the career development and counselling centre. As stated in the SER, students can improve their qualifications and competencies through non-formal or informal activities. These activities cover a student creativity programme, the participation in student activity units on a general level for all programmes, and single-session counselling activities ("Guidance and Counselling") or the participation at international conferences ("Geography").

UNNES uses a university-wide system for all courses, which defines that per semester students have 16 meetings per course (including mid-term and final examination), with 50 minutes for each credit point. The Academic handbook outlines all courses' general structure, the possible learning and teaching methods, and defines the relationship between hours and credits allocated to each course. The organisation of the curriculum guaranteeing an avoidance of content overlap is delegated to the Centre of Curriculum Development and Educational Innovation. It is stated that each study programme creates on its programme level a so-called cluster of expertise, which has the task to secure this avoidance. This cluster of expertise regularly discusses with relevant external stakeholders, e.g., professional associations or graduates, the content of similar programmes. The Information and Communication Technology UPT is responsible for developing a course schedule system to avoid a time clash of courses.

Experts' Evaluation

Based on the evidence collected during the online site visit, the experts conclude that adequate resources are available for the study programmes and in relation to the intended learning outcomes on the programme level. The equipment including laboratories, computer workstations, and study rooms meet modern standards and are updated if needed. Being very relevant for the discipline, a major focus was put on the facilities in Sports Science. Facilities and equipment for track and field, gym, tennis, minigolf, swimming and others were presented. In many cases the standard was very high, and it has been appreciated by the experts. However, a mismatch was perceived when it comes to the Gymnastic Hall, where current (safety) standards might be problematic. The video tour included the library, cafeteria, laboratories, classroom, and the faculty surroundings with additional services, e.g., faculty bikes, parking lots, and other facilities. The library offers to a sufficient degree discipline-specific literature hard copies and digital versions. The library has also subscriptions to various e-journals to which students have access. However, the expert conclude that a confirmation site visit will provide even more evidence concerning the resources.

Students are provided with course descriptions via the ELENA platform. These documents contain the intended learning outcomes on the course, teaching and learning methods, assessment methods and the expected workload (differentiating between self-study and in-class hours). During the site visit access to the platform was given to the experts. In the light of the internationalisation efforts of UNNES it is recommend providing the digital platform for students and staff also in English, which will facilitate access for international students or external staff members from abroad (**Finding 15**).

The faculties stated that student support is given to students beyond the discipline in terms of writing classes, entrepreneurship courses, or career orientation opportunities. The student associations play an important role in the social life of students. Every department has a specific room assigned to these associations.

Furthermore, the faculties offer introductory sessions to new students to accommodate them into the UNNES system. Special attention is given to the digital platforms and student support activities (on the university level but also on faculty and department level). With this, students are informed about the consultation hours of the teaching staff. However, the discussions confirmed that the teaching staff follow an open-door policy, which has been confirmed by the students. After enrolment, students can access further information on general and university activities and services via an internal platform. Overall, the infrastructure, e.g., for library services

and online learning, appears to meet international standards. The student associations are also very active on social media.

International mobility with English speaking countries is yet to mature, but long-standing cooperation with regional universities enables students to spend a period abroad (e.g., Malaysia or Thailand). Knowing the difficulties to integrate international students into the student's life, the experts encourage the faculties to intensify the internationalisation efforts to attract international students from Western countries as well as from other Asian countries (**Finding 16**).

Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

7. Public Information

Bachelor/Master Degree
<i>Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.</i> [ESG 1.8]

Description

The necessary information on the study programme can be accessed primarily on the homepage of the higher education institution; however, the programmes are also advertised on social media. Students have access to the intended learning outcomes, course descriptions, and course information via the online platform when being enrolled. General information on the overall structure is provided in the Academic Handbook, which is regularly updated. Furthermore, UNNES publishes all necessary information concerning the admission regulations (including the different paths) the qualifications awarded, and the teaching, learning, and assessment procedures for the respective study programme.

Experts' Evaluation

The university uses a wide range of media to inform students and stakeholders about their education offerings. The main source of information is the university's website, but popular social media and self-produced videos are also used to convey information. The site visit showed that the social media videos produced meet the target group needs and inform external stakeholders to a sufficient degree. However, it became evident that the department homepages do not reflect the status quo of the programmes. At some instances, there was no up-to-date information available. At other instances links did not work. The Bachelor's programme "Guidance and Counselling" is an example, but the main information was primarily in Indonesian. Therefore, it must be assured that a constant and systematic update of information is in place, especially with regard to information on the application and selection process, expected learning outcomes, teaching procedures and career prospects. In terms of international orientation, it is necessary that the information about the degree programmes on the homepages of the departments be presented transparently to non-Indonesian speakers (**Finding 17**).

Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

Findings

1. The intended learning outcomes on the programme level must be specified in such a way to reflect the most important contents of the current programme (e.g., spatial planning and rural development).
2. Room should be given to expand English competencies of students within the programmes.
3. The various graduation profiles should be outlined more transparently to demonstrate the distinctiveness of this study programme for future students and the labour market.
4. The graduation profile of the “Guidance and Counselling” Bachelor programme should include potential employment fields in an international environment, such as the American School Counsellor Association (ASCA) to strengthen its profile.
5. The graduation profile for the Bachelor’s programme “Early Childhood Teacher Education” must be updated and in line with the current status quo of employment fields beyond governmental directives.
6. To strengthen to societal impact of the programme “Early Childhood teacher Education”, topics of child protection, inclusion or family and relationship services should be fostered within the curriculum.
7. The department “Early Childhood teacher Education” could reflect on possibilities to provide students with opportunities to specialise in certain areas via discipline-specific electives.
8. Special attention should be paid to the theoretical foundation of the “Early Childhood Teacher Education” programme to foster potential scientific paths of students.
9. Internship options in other sectors than schools should be given to broaden the scope of the Bachelor’s programme “Early Childhood Teacher Education”.
10. It has to be demonstrated how the PDCA cycle for each individual programme is systematically closed. This refers specifically to non- or informal group discussions, which should be changed into structural processes.
11. Establishing regular and structured labour market focus groups to account for more formalized quality assurance measures is strongly recommended.
12. It has to be demonstrated how results of the quality assurance procedures are shared with all relevant internal and external stakeholders, including students and labour market representatives.
13. To foster autonomous learning, more student-centred learning approaches should be implemented in teaching methods for all programmes.
14. A system should be implemented to assure progress in the development of English competencies of staff to expand research opportunities with countries outside Southeast Asia and connect better to international research.
15. It is recommended to provide the digital platform for students and staff also in English.
16. Internationalisation efforts should be strengthened to attract international students from Western countries as well as from other Asian countries.
17. It should be assured that consistent up-to-date information on the study programmes is available for Indonesian and Non-Indonesian speakers.