



Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS

on the study programme:

“Gastronomy and Culinary Arts” (B.A.), Faculty of Fine Arts (Turkish programme)

offered by the Faculty of Fine Arts of Istanbul Gelişim University

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the Accreditation Commission in its 70th meeting on 19/20 February 2018, the Accreditation Commission decides:

1. The study programme “**Gastronomy and Culinary Arts**” (**Bachelor of Arts**; Turkish programme) offered by the Faculty of Fine Arts of Istanbul Gelişim University is accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is conditional.

The study programme essentially complies with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of nine months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 November 2018**.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2024**.

Conditions:

1. The clear profile of the programme – also in comparison with the other Gastronomy programmes – has to be documented, e. g. in the Diploma Supplement.
2. The curriculum has to transfer academic skills more prominently. In particular:
 - a. The theoretical foundation has to be extended and research skills have to be trained as obligatory part of the curriculum.
 - b. More advanced gastronomy skills have to be trained, and the amount of courses on practical cooking skills have to be reduced to be able to add more academic ones.
3. The university has to present a hiring plan which shows how the changes of the curriculum of the study programme can be implemented by giving the exact number and denomination of teaching positions as well as the required qualifications of candidates.

The conditions were fulfilled on time.
The Accreditation Commission confirms this with its decision of 25.03.2019.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programme:

1. The quality assurance system should be formalised further to intensify the communication between the university and the industry.
2. Interdisciplinary courses should be made mandatory, together with such on global issues like hunger or climate change, and an interdisciplinary approach should be strengthened in general.
3. Managerial skills should be trained.
4. Professional etiquette should be trained.
5. Teaching, learning and assessment methods should be adapted to the revised curricula.
6. The production of alcoholic beverages should be taught so that graduates are better qualified for the labour market.
7. The number of teaching staff should be increased.
8. The university should set up specific laboratories to enable students to understand the cooking process.
9. The number of ECTS credit points should be raised for the internship to better reflect the workload of students.
10. Interdisciplinary research and teaching should be strengthened.
11. The access to specific databases for the students as well as the teaching staff should be broadened.
12. The scope of internship opportunities should be broadened.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Accreditation Commission refers to the attached assessment report.



Experts' Report

on the bachelor degree programme:

“Gastronomy and Culinary Arts” (B.A.), Faculty of Fine Arts

offered by Istanbul Gelişim University

Visit to the University: November 15–17, 2017

Panel of Experts:

Prof. Dr.-Ing. Burkhard Ahlert	University of Applied Sciences Fulda/Germany, professor of Food Technology and Production
Prof. Dr. Cinzia Scaffidi	Università degli Studi di Scienze Gastronomiche Bra/Italy, professor in the field of Gastronomic Sciences
Albert Kooy	Executive Chef/SVH Master Chef, Stenden Hotel/Restaurant Wannee, Leeuwarden/Netherlands (representative of the labour market)
Moritz Dragosits	Vienna University of Economics and Business/Austria, (student expert)

Coordination:

Dr. Katarina Löbel & Ninja Fischer	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
------------------------------------	------------------------

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 85 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), which all Bologna countries agreed upon as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the bachelor programmes in “Gastronomy and Culinary Arts” (B.A.) (Faculty of Fine Arts), and “Gastronomy” (B.Sc.) (School of Applied Sciences, English and Turkish version) offered by Istanbul Gelişim University (IGU).

1. Criteria

The assessment of the programmes is in accordance with a set of criteria for programme accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015 and feature a set of indicators used to demonstrate the fulfilment of each criterion. However, criteria are met even if single indicators are not fulfilled. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme as not all indicators are necessarily applicable to a programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

Istanbul Gelişim University mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in June 2017.

The university prepared a Self Evaluation Report (SER). In July 2017, IGU handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the study programmes and an appendix.

AQAS assessed the SER draft for completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in in September 2017.

The accreditation procedure has been officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Accreditation Commission on August 28–29, 2017.

Nomination of the expert panel

Composing the expert panel follows the stakeholder principle. Involved are consequently representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Accreditation Commission nominated the expert panel in September 2017. AQAS informed the university thereafter about the members of the expert panel and IGU did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential points in need of additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university as well as the panel members to increase transparency in the process and upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After review of the Self Evaluation Report, the site visit to the university took place from November 15–17, 2017. On site, the experts interviewed in separate discussions different stakeholders, such as the management of the university, the programme management, teaching and other staff as well as students, and consulted additional documentation such as an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs), CVs of the teaching staff, information on student services, core information on the main library, the processes and data of quality management, etc. The visit concluded with presenting preliminary findings by the experts to the university's representatives.

Report writing

Following the site visit, the expert group drafted the following report assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission. The report was sent to IGU for comments.

Decision

The experts' report, together with the comments by IGU, form the basis for the AQAS Accreditation Commission to make a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these documents, the Accreditation Commission decided on the accreditation on 19/20 February, 2018. AQAS forwarded the decision to IGU. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed imposed conditions.

In March 2018, AQAS published the report and the accreditation result of the accreditation along with the names of the panel of experts.

III. General Information on the University

Gelişim University is a private higher education institution located in Istanbul, Turkey. It started as a vocational school in 2008, having been founded by the "Gelişim Foundation for Education, Culture, Health and Social Development". In 2011, the institution acquired university status and has since expanded its programmes and number of students. Today, Istanbul Gelişim University is characterised by a student population of ca. 22.000 and a number of teaching staff of ca. 500.

The university structure consists of three faculties, three institutes, four graduate schools, and two vocational schools offering a wide range of graduate and postgraduate programmes: Faculty of Economics, Administrative and Social Sciences; Faculty of Fine Arts; Faculty of Engineering and Architecture; Institute of Social Sciences, Institute of Natural and Applied Sciences, Institute of Health Sciences; School of Applied Science, School of Foreign Languages, School of Physical Education and Sports, and School of Health Sciences.

Every private university is obliged by the Amendments of the Law on Higher Education to have a "Board of Trustees". It enters a contract with the Rector, all faculty members and all other staff. Furthermore, it decides on the budget, all hiring and termination decisions and the amount of

annual tuition fees. The university has a senate as well as all other organs comparable to a public institution of identical state.

The university pursues the goal of becoming an international education and learning institution by running joint projects with internationally recognised schools, by setting up a global research network and by providing high quality professional education in Turkish and English. A strategic plan 2016-2020 defines these objectives together with those of further developing and implementing graduate education and improving service processes as the main targets to be achieved by the university in the near future.

According to the university, its educational approach follows the principle of creative teaching and participatory learning. The university aims at educating civically engaged, self-reliant individuals by providing excellence and highest quality in its study programmes and by fostering critical intellectual development.

Istanbul Gelişim University offers continuous scholarships, free courses, internships and job opportunities to students. It supports international student exchange programmes. At the same time, it aims to support students' individual, social and academic development during university life. Students can receive consultation and help for their needs at the Psychological Counselling Guidance Unit. As outlined by the university, it supports its students in extra-curricular activities such as student clubs and student councils, summer schools and conferences.

IGU participates in the Erasmus+ programme and encourages student and staff mobility. As outlined by the university, the number of European partner institutions is currently 73. The International Relations Office shares responsibility for the organization of mobility.

The programmes to be accredited are offered by the Faculty of Fine Arts and by the School of Applied Sciences. The Faculty of Fine Arts offers seven bachelor programmes, including the one provided by the Department of "Gastronomy and Culinary Arts". The two programmes of "Gastronomy" are located at the School of Applied Science. According to the university, the research profiles of the academic staff in both departments cover a range of study fields including nutrition, food science, culinary arts, culture, cooking techniques, Turkish and world cuisines, etc. The school further aims to prepare students for working life but also aims to raise individuals who will question and enrich social, economic, and political aspects of the society, become knowledgeable, well-equipped, creative, responsive, libertarian, and well-rounded people, value ethics and ethical conduct, advocate democracy and human rights, and pursue public interest.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Policy and Procedures for Quality Assurance

The programme is subject to the Higher Education Institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

[ESG 1.1]

Description

As outlined by the university, one of Istanbul Gelişim University's main objectives in quality assurance lies in the effective participation of internal and external stakeholders in all activities in accordance with international quality standards.

The establishment of the quality assurance system of the university is based on ISO 9000 Quality Management System, TS EN ISO-9001:2015, Higher Education Law No. 2547 and "Higher Education Quality Assurance Regulation". The aims, mission and vision of the university are determined according to these criteria and their appropriateness is measured.

Feedback of internal and external stakeholders shall be collected within the framework of the University Quality Commission. It consists of the Rector, Vice-rector and 14 members from various faculties, institutes, vocational schools and colleges. The commission is supposed to define, implement and further develop factors necessary for the improvement of quality standards. It thus evaluates reports, surveys and suggestions by students and external stakeholders. Additionally, an Office of Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance has been implemented which is working in coordination with the commission. The main performance indicators set at Istanbul Gelişim University are: A) Number of Programmes, b) Number of Students, c) Number of Academic Personnel, d) Rate of fullness, e) Number of Programmes teaching in English, f) Erasmus Mobility, g) Student Activities, h) Number of Research Sources, and i) Scientific Publication Numbers of Staff.

A student council creates further opportunities for students to participate in the supervision of programmes, as presented by the university.

The incorporation of feedback of internal and external stakeholders forms the basis for the further development of study programmes. Evaluation reports have to be approved by the Rector, reviewed by Deans and Heads of study programmes and acknowledged by the Senate.

Furthermore, several measures are supposed to be in place to monitor a programme's quality: regular course and teaching staff assessment questionnaires as well as student assessment and internship evaluation questionnaires. As mentioned above, the university obtains data covering various activities of its programmes. At the end of each term, student's evaluations are taken into account in a success analysis.

The Istanbul Gelişim University Graduates and Members Association was established in May 2017 to continue the university's relation with its graduates, to increase information sharing, to foster the graduates' solidarity and to follow-up on their career developments.

Experts' Evaluation

The experts saw a clear willingness for a quality focused development of the university and its programmes. As mentioned by the Management of IGU, there is no need to obtain an international accreditation but IGU decided to carry out the process for all study programmes. However, there is a requirement to get a quality assessment by the Council of Higher Education of Turkey (CoHE) every five years. In this process specific criteria are used which are also based on the European Standards and Guidelines.

The main institutions for quality assurance at IGU are the advisory committees:

- The system prescribes programme boards and faculty/school boards as well as university boards. There are at minimum three members of teaching staff in each board plus the head of department; the students are consulted but by law they are not members; the decisions are documented in reports which are submitted to the board of the school/faculty and then to the university senate.
- The students vote for their representatives every year who are consulted by the boards.

If there is need for improvement it is discussed by the programme board at first hand, then by the faculty/school board and finally by the senate. Loops for improvement are implemented this way.

The Board of Trustees is interested in a continuous improvement of the university, because of that the board receives reports on quality assurance as well. This interest is also a reason why the university decided to start the accreditation process for the whole university.

In the latest curriculum change of the Gastronomy and Culinary Arts programme (Faculty of Fine Arts) the department collected the opinion of representatives of the labour market and of students in order to improve the programme. One of the Gastronomy and Culinary Arts department lecturers is employed outside the university and brings in his experiences and opinion of the needs of the labour market.

Some lecturers of the Gastronomy and Culinary Arts department are also members of a Turkish cooking organisation. When the new staff started at this university they were asked if the programme suited them or if they wanted any improvements. By that the new staff changed the curriculum in some aspects, for example the introduction of a course on world cuisine (4th semester; French, Italian, Spanish and Mexican cooking; Asian cooking in the following semester).

~~As outlined in the discussion with the staff of the Gastronomy department (School of Applied Sciences) 68% of the first graduates are now employed, 31% do a double major (e.g. in Nutrition and Dietetics) or are still in pedagogical formation and 3% are unemployed. So job opportunities seem to be quite good within the sector after graduation.~~

~~As discussed with the staff of the Gastronomy department, the teachers have collected feedback of the students on the quality of the study programme and on possible improvements; there are meetings with graduates in which the department also collects feedback of the alumni. This was confirmed by the students. The department is also very well informed about the success of its students. 75% of the students of the first cohort graduated after 4 years; the others are still studying or decided to change study programmes, etc.~~

In general, the quality assurance system of the university is convincing to the experts. However, in the future the system should be formalised further, especially with regard to the communication with the industry which should be intensified and established on a more regular basis. Especially meetings with stakeholders from the student body and labour market should be integrated. The experts recommend that there should be evaluation meetings with industry representatives each time students have completed their internship, or that regular career days specific for the programmes should be organized (**Finding 1**).

In Turkey in general, the course descriptions have to be prepared for the admission of a new study programme at the Council of Higher Education. When developing the Gastronomy programme a head of department of a renowned department of Tourism was invited to discuss the programme with the department and also representatives of the labour market were invited to give their opinion.

In the documents the experts found a clearly structured curriculum for each study programme with a course book in which every course was described on an up-to-date level (see also "Quality of the Curricula"). The students confirmed that they were informed about the courses on the internal information system OBIS and by the department prior to their participation in the programmes and prior to the start of every course by their lecturers.

Every semester the evaluation forms are handed out and the results end up in changes, as far as the students are aware of. Furthermore, students are approached by the teaching staff personally to provide feedback and to discuss improvements of each study programme. In the documents provided the experts found a wide range of indicators with detailed numbers on every cycle of evaluation.

If improvement for students is necessary it is discussed with the teaching staff and carried out. For example, the students wanted to go on a field trip to Antioquia; they wanted a garden product lecture and a lecture on cost analysis which were added to the curriculum. They also wanted a bed to seed which was also granted. Students' wishes are thus responded to very quickly by the university. For example, a special laboratory on nutrition will be opened in the future as it was requested by the students.

In the overall quality assurance system of the university rates and data on students' progression and completion of the study programmes are collected and allocated to the responsible persons.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Strong points are that a wide range of indicators and data is used to follow the students' success, and feedback of students and graduates is used for the further development of the study programmes. However, in the future the quality assurance system should be formalised further to intensify the communication between the university and the industry.

2. Quality of the Curricula

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG1.2]

Description

Study programme objectives

The study programmes in "Gastronomy" at the School of Applied Sciences and "Gastronomy and Culinary Arts" at the Faculty of Fine Arts embrace four years of study with 240 ECTS Credit Points. The programmes are supposed to meet both the requirements at level six of the Turkish Qualifications Framework for HE (TYYÇ, NQF-HETR) and level six of the European Qualifications Framework for Lifelong Learning (EQF-LLL). Upon successful completion of these programmes students are awarded with the qualification of a Bachelor's Degree in "Gastronomy" or "Gastronomy and Culinary Arts". The School of Applied Sciences awards a "Bachelor of Science" and the Faculty of Fine Arts a "Bachelor of Arts".

The study programmes are supposed to develop the students' analytical, communication and problem-solving skills, providing them with a global perspective on gastronomy and preparing them to pursue a career within the sector. According to the university, the fast-changing, dynamic and highly competitive field expects well-trained professionals with serious work ethic. The student should be prepared to work in both a national and an international environment and should be in tune with the needs of people from different social and cultural backgrounds while helping them enjoy their time off. The departments declare that the basic elements of the study programmes embrace three major disciplines: Turkish & World Cuisine, Food Science & Nutrition as well as Culinary & Cooking Technology.

The university defines qualifications for all study programmes under review. The graduates shall i. a.

- have knowledge on theories, facts, concepts and principles of the field as well as on legal regulations, professional standards, ethical values, labour safety and occupational health, social insurance, etc. with regard to the field, including knowledge on essential principles of domestic and worldwide cuisines,
- have essential knowledge on managing and organising catering businesses,
- know about the physical, chemical and microbiological characteristics of raw, additive and finished food substances as well as physical and chemical processes during food-preparation, and master the processes through selecting the raw materials required to prepare food and beverages, to selecting on/in what they will be served, and can prepare any kind of food or beverage using sanitary, hygienic and nutritious ingredients, and present those; create different tastes; prepare menus considering different nutritive requirements,
- can adopt strategic approaches with regard to the field, including approaching to the problems which may have effects on the service provided, and problem solving including the ability to communicate it,
- know how to take precautions for, and control the food hygiene and safety, in the environments they work and take the responsibility of; conduct quality control processes,
- can serve as a team member, lead a team; conduct top studies and can update their knowledge and improve their skills, with regard to the field, and are able to follow the developments and practices in the field; take responsibility through the period of turning their knowledge and skills into value added ideas/approaches/technologies/products,
- can express themselves by their history, culture and art knowledge, as well as
- can carry out the activities concerning the field, believing in the fact that social benefits are universal; and with the awareness acquired, on the importance of social justice, culture and nature of quality, conserving cultural values and preserving the environment, and occupational health and safety.

The university outlines that the two programmes in “Gastronomy” (in Turkish and English) are more practical-oriented whereas the study programme “Gastronomy and Culinary Arts” (in Turkish) is more oriented to theory and research as well as management.

According to Article 2.a of the National Regulations on Graduate Education, graduates of all the bachelor’s programmes are admitted to master’s programmes.

When developing or updating courses both departments declare that Essential Employability Skills (EES) learning outcomes are embedded in the course curriculum. They comprise skills in the areas of communication, numeracy, critical thinking and problem solving, information management as well as interpersonal and personal skills.

Curricular structure

The degree programmes are structured around four years of study, covering eight semesters. Each semester is 14 weeks long. Five to six courses per semester are usually taken in each programme. The awarded credit points of each course vary from one to ten.

For the study programmes “Gastronomy” at least 19 of 45 courses are in the Academic Core (AC) of each programme. 17 of the total number of courses are in the major cluster offered by the Department and YÖK’s compulsory policy. Students further choose nine elective courses (departmental and free) from the list offered by the Department.

In the study programme “Gastronomy and Culinary Arts” at least 34 of 55 courses are in the Academic Core (AC) of the programme which according to the SER ensures that students develop strong academic skills. Six of the total number of courses are in the major cluster offered by the

Department and YÖK's compulsory policy. Students may further choose 14 elective courses (departmental and free).

The mandatory courses are:

Semester 1: "Basic Art Education", "Introduction to Gastronomy", "Basic principles of Nutrition", "General Economy", "Turkish Language I", "Foreign Language I (Engl.)".

Semester 2: "Food and Beverage Cost Control", "Food Science and Technology", "Food Safety and Hygiene", "Occupational Health and Safety", "Turkish Language I", "Foreign Language I (Engl.)".

Semester 3: "History of Ataturk's Principles and Reforms I", "Sauces and Soups", "Gastronomy and Food History", "Menu Planning", "Professional English I".

Semester 4: "History of Ataturk's Principles and Reforms I", "Kitchen Applications", "Introduction to Beverages", "Introduction to Pastry", "Human Resources Management", "Professional English II".

Semester 5: "Turkish Cuisine I", "World Cuisine I", "Service Techniques and Etiquette", "Kitchen Terminology", "Food and Beverages Management in Hotels".

Semester 6: "Turkish Cuisine II", "World Cuisine II", "Bread Applications", "Restaurant Management", "Food Formulations and Sensory Analysis".

Semester 7: "Ottoman Kitchen", "Chocolate and Dessert Art", "Banquet Organisation", "Cuisine Trends", "Research Methods", "French I".

Semester 8: "Graduation Project", "Food Legislation and Occupational Ethics", "Cold Kitchen", "French II".

The elective courses differ between the programmes. All programmes include an internship. In "Gastronomy" (English and Turkish) it takes 60 days and is divided between the fourth and sixth semester. In "Gastronomy and Culinary Arts" it takes 40 days and is located in the fifth semester.

The faculty board is responsible for the content and the organisational capacity and infrastructure process. Following the description in the SER it takes care of the completeness of the courses offered considering the study programme and prevents the overlapping of courses, including co-ordination with the other departments to meet students' expectations.

Module descriptions

All modules of the study programmes are described and these descriptions are available to the students, e.g. on the webpage of the university. The university declares that the descriptions are updated regularly.

Experts' Evaluation

Gelişim University is a very young institution and the focus it has put on the importance of food in the economic landscape is really remarkable. The university attracts students who are projecting their future as chef or touristic operator or want to continue their academic path in the field of ~~Gastronomy~~/Gastronomy and Culinary Arts. Of course, the experts have to consider the cultural background of such a university, in a country that is universally known for the richness and variety of its culinary offers and touristic attractions.

Nonetheless, the experts cannot leave aside how complex and sophisticated, nowadays, the idea of Gastronomy in European countries has become in which the reflection on this issue (teaching Gastronomy as a science) has started about 30 years ago. Food here is meant as the result of many components, disciplines and different kinds of knowledge, from Chemistry to Anthropology, from Ecology to Sensorial Analysis, from Law to Organic Agriculture. This is what could be considered the most evident weakness in the learning and teaching landscape of Gelişim University: it started by considering a narrower view on Gastronomy, thus it should multiply its efforts to gain

a more complex approach to what food is, and to what studying food can be. Universities are not meant to train professionals but to build science-based knowledge. For that, research on Gastronomic Sciences is still at its beginning and needs more and more contributors.

When it comes to the definition of learning outcomes of each study programme the university should adopt a more comprehensive view on ~~Gastronomy and~~ Gastronomy and Culinary Arts including not only cooking but also management of kitchens, restaurant skills, food production, food distribution etc. which would lead to a more sophisticated view on ~~Gastronomy respectively~~ Gastronomy and Culinary Arts as defined above. By that the departments should also highlight the characteristics of the departments at the School of Applied Sciences and the Faculty of Fine Arts. The differences of the programmes have to be documented not only based on formal aspects but also content- and level-wise. The respective profile must be declared clearly in the official documents ~~for each study programme under review~~, e. g. in the Diploma Supplement (**Finding 2**).

The experts, however, have to state that until now the programme ~~is s-are~~ not sufficient for the future when it comes to level and content. The academic degree awarded in ~~each-the~~ study programme does not correspond to the requirements of an appropriate level of the European Qualification Framework of a Bachelor's Degree. One of the main reasons is that the curriculum is overloaded with the teaching of techniques for practical work in the kitchen. ~~Each-The~~ study programme seems to be more like a training for chefs rather than an academic study programme, and the teaching of the theoretical background is not prominent enough. There is no course for sensory evaluation, no laboratory work in hygiene and basic microbiology in the ~~curricula-curriculum~~ which are considered as mandatory by the experts if an academic training on a European level in the areas of ~~Gastronomy and~~ Gastronomy and Culinary Arts is to be achieved. Furthermore, it is not clear if during the lessons in the kitchen a theoretical background of all cooking processes and technologies exists or is taught. This includes the knowledge of all physical, chemical and biochemical changes of food during the heating and preparation process. During the site visit the teaching staff mentioned a course in sensory evaluation and another one in hygiene, but these courses are not implemented in the curriculum yet instead they are offered by cooperation between the industry and the departments, as was stated at the site visit.

This is why the experts conclude that the curriculum ~~uma~~ of all ~~three-programmes~~ ~~the programme~~ must focus more on academic skills and global issues connected to food (**Finding 3**). The theoretical foundation has to be extended and research skills have to be trained as obligatory part of ~~each-the~~ curriculum (**Finding 3.a**). The departments should turn some of the elective courses such as "Ecogastronomy", "Professional Ethics" and "Climate Change" into mandatory parts of ~~each-the~~ curriculum. Sustainable aspects are necessary for the future in gastronomy as well as physiological, ecological and social aspects in food preparation and consumption (**Finding 3.b**). Furthermore, an interdisciplinary approach should be strengthened by adding courses that are not part of the curriculum ~~uma~~ at the moment like anthropology, ethnobotany, ethics, molecular chemistry, agroecology, etc. to match the level of European study programmes teaching Gastronomy academically. Instead of teaching basic kitchen skills, which should rather be part of the training at a vocational school, more advanced gastronomy skills should be trained, and the amount of courses on practical cooking skills should be reduced to be able to add more academic ones (**Finding 3.c**). Also managerial skills should be trained to prepare students to take over responsible functions in the labour market early after graduation (**Finding 4**). Additionally, the training should focus on more awareness of professional etiquette (**Finding 5**). Also, the teaching, learning and assessment methods might need to be adapted to the revised curricula. This should be considered when adapting the curricula (**Finding 6**). To ensure a certain level of kitchen skills by students, the departments might consider an additional entrance exam focusing on the cooking abilities of applicants.

When revising the study programmes, the university should also bear in mind that it appeared to the experts that up until now the aims of the study programmes and the realization with regard to

the employment opportunities of graduates differ. The aim to place the graduates in certain work field diverges from the reality where students actually find employment in the industry. Most of the graduates seem to start working on the lowest level in the kitchen, e. g. of a hotel. When they are lucky, graduates have a vocational school background or just natural talent and by that get promoted quickly. Nevertheless, for these positions no academic background would be needed which was underlined by the representatives of the labour market to which the experts were able to talk to. It is also necessary, from the labour market point of view, to transfer stronger skills in areas such as theoretical background, an interdisciplinary view on gastronomy, management (especially the middle management) and marketing (see **Findings 3 and 4**). In addition to the need to revise the study programmes considering the academic and theoretical level of studies, the practical skills should be trained on a higher level to enable graduates to find appropriate work (see **Findings 4 and 5**). Furthermore, specific aspects like the production of alcoholic beverages (especially wine) should be part of the curriculum to enhance the qualification of graduates for the labour market (**Finding 7**). All these aspects should enable the graduates in the future to apply for positions in the middle management.

Despite the weak points just outlined, the experts are convinced that the university is able to add the missing components in the curriculum within a couple of months. The experts noticed the high motivation of the university's management as well as of the teaching staff of ~~each the~~ department to improve their study programmes and to enhance the possibilities of doing research. One example is the collaboration with the department of dietetics of the university, another example the plans to establish a laboratory for carbohydrates. These attempts should be expanded as well as the efforts to recruit more teaching staff with an adequate academic background to raise the academic level of the study programmes, especially when the student numbers increase (**Finding 8**, see also "Teaching staff"). The efforts to invite visiting lectures from foreign universities are considered positively by the experts and should continuously be expanded. Furthermore, the university should set up specific laboratories with respective equipment enabling the understanding of cooking processes e. g. the training of sensory aspects or hygienic analysis (**Finding 9**, see also "Learning resources and student support").

One of the stronger points of the study programmes is the documentation. The qualifications and competencies that are to be achieved within the ~~three~~ programmes discussed in this report are presented as intended learning outcomes, based on the arrangement of the curriculum of ~~each the~~ programme on the current level (which needs to be changed, however, as mentioned before). They include subject-specific aspects as well as generic competencies (which need to be specified; see **Finding 2**). The structure of ~~each curriculum~~ the curriculum is outlined clearly and comprehensibly in the documentation, and it is documented which courses are compulsory and which are electives. The courses which have to be taken by all Turkish students are prescribed by CoHE so that the university has no influence on this part of the curriculum. For all modules/courses a comprehensible amount of ECTS credit points is awarded although the credits awarded for the internships should be raised regarding the workload in case the regulations of CoHE allow this which seems not to be the case at this moment (**Finding 10**, see also "Learning resources and student support").

Finally, the experts recommend that the programme in English should have a stronger international approach and should be designed in order to be attractive for foreign students; the current situation in which Turkish professors teach Turkish students in English, who nevertheless study in the same programme as the students in the Turkish programme, is scarcely motivating for improving language skills. However, if using the English language may be motivated by the presence of foreign students and/or foreign teachers, it can be an added value to the programme.

The current students are carefully guided and accompanied, but they should be supported in understanding what Gastronomy (and Culinary Arts) ~~areis (are)~~ and what kind of different career options they can embrace once they graduate: from research to primary food production, which

are both almost left out by the programmes at the moment, from communication to education, from cooking to managing a business in the food field, from policies making to social activism. There is high potential in ~~all-threethe~~ study programmes which the experts support; they encourage the university to advance the existing study programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

The qualifications to be achieved are presented as Intended Learning Outcomes which regard both specific and generic competencies; however, they need to be specified. All curricular elements and their functions are documented and the curriculum ~~uma~~ includes compulsory and elective elements. All elements of the curriculum are assigned a certain number of credits related to the expected workload.

However, the curriculum ~~uma~~ of ~~all-the~~ study programmes in this review need to be further developed and specified so that the study programmes ~~meets~~ the requirements of the Bachelor level of the European Qualifications Framework.

In conclusion, the outlined shortages of the programmes need to be overcome and changes have to be made to the curriculum ~~uma~~ which are considered fundamental for the development in gastronomy.

3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

Learning, Teaching

In the SER, the university names the following delivery methods to train the intended learning outcomes: lecture & in-class Activities, land surveys, group work, laboratory, reading, assignment (Homework), project work, seminars, internships, technical visits, web based learning, implementation/application/practice, practice at a workplace/internships, occupational activities, social activities, thesis Work, field Studies, and report writing. By this methods' mix, knowledge and cross-subject knowledge as well as subject-related, methodological and generic skills are supposed to be taught and applied. The multitude of teaching strategies is supposed to be effective in educating diverse student learners. Diverse student learners include students from culturally and linguistically diverse families and communities of different socioeconomic status. In the SER, measures are described to support the career orientation/employability of the study programmes.

The university also aims to strengthen the exchange between research and teaching. In the SER, the university declares that research seminars have been introduced in the first year, including learning activities about disciplinary research methods and techniques, improvements in the assessment of the bachelor thesis and recommendations for the professionalisation of lecturers.

Assessment

The methods applied for the assessment of the achievement of the expected learning outcomes for the entire programme of "Gastronomy" and "Gastronomy and Culinary Arts" are mid-term ex-

ams, final exams, short exams, presentations of reports, homework assessments, presentation of the thesis, oral exams, and expert assessments.

The exams such as midterm and final exams are organised twice a semester. Except for these compulsory exams, the university describes that each academic staff is free to perform other exams or assessments such as pop-up quiz, homework, tests, oral evaluation etc. Exams are held from Monday to Saturday over a three-week period at the mid and end of semester. Students access their exam timetable in an electronic database/system before the exam week. Other exams and assessments are announced by the respective lecturer.

Istanbul Gelişim University Associate Degree and Undergraduate Education-Training and Examination Regulations contain provisions related to the formation of justified and valid causes that prevent students from continuing or entering the examination. Students who cannot enter the midterms and certify their excuse are entitled to an excuse examination by the decision of the faculty board of directors. Students who cannot attend the final exam due to their excuses are entitled to attend the make-up exams and the summer school.

Experts' Evaluation

The methods of teaching, learning and assessment are appropriate to the intended learning outcomes. Nonetheless, if necessary, they should be further developed to achieve the intended learning outcomes of the revised study programmes according to the above mentioned essentially required changes of the curricula (see "Quality of the Curricula", **Findings 3, 4, 5, 6**).

Methods, requirements and appointments of assessment are defined comprehensibly and information can be retrieved by the students via the university's online system. The responsibilities for organising exams are transparent. The diversity of the student body is taken into account appropriately by the university. The students reported that there are no problems with the organisation of exams and other forms of assessment, and that the teaching staff is very accommodating in case a makeup of an exam is needed. The regulations are transparent but the Training and Examination Regulations were not available in English yet.

A wide range of different assessment methods are documented in the course descriptions. Nevertheless, every course is mostly assessed by a midterm and a final exam. As discussed with the teaching staff, this is mandatory due to regulations of the Turkish higher education system for all mandatory courses but not for the electives. Therefore, the experts assume that changes of learning, teaching, and assessment methods are realisable at least for the elective elements of the study programmes (Finding 6).

Data regarding the number of failed course/module examinations are collected on a central level and are used for quality assurance of the programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Regarding the current curriculum the university uses appropriate methods of teaching and assessment. However, when the curriculum are adapted it should be checked if there is a need to change the teaching and assessment methods to achieve the intended learning outcomes, with a special focus on more diverse learning, teaching and assessment methods.

4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification

Consistently applied, pre-defined, published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

Admittance to the study programme

Students are placed in bachelor's programmes through a central examination system and within the framework of regulations set by the Council of Higher Education. Students who graduate from secondary education institutions are placed to the programmes they want to study based on the scores they got from the central examination.

In order for students to start a programme with foreign language instruction, applicants must pass the foreign language proficiency exam at Istanbul Gelişim University.

Creditation and Recognition

Istanbul Gelişim University applies ECTS as a credit transfer and accumulation system.

ECTS credits are calculated based on the course hours, midterm exams, final exams, projects and other assignments, laboratory work, seminars, and other learning components that make up the student workload.

By using the ECTS, the recognition of the period of study the students spent abroad should be facilitated and student mobility should be encouraged.

Certification

To create easily understood and comparable higher education diplomas and / or grades, a Diploma Supplement has been developed for each study programme.

Experts' Evaluation

There is no admission to university organised by the institution itself. The students can enrol after high school or vocational high school and passing the national placement test. Therefore, the quality of students varies as those with a vocational background have the advantage of already having basic kitchen skills. To base the studies on a comparable level of cooking skills of students, the university might consider to set up an additional admission exam focusing on the practical knowledge (see above). However, this would only be manageable if national regulations were to be adapted.

Students with a vocational high school background mainly choose the programme Gastronomy, those with another high school background typically choose Gastronomy & Culinary Arts at the Faculty of Fine Arts. The experts understand that this happens because the aims of the programmes are different as the former programme focuses more on practical skills.

The university collects data on admission as well as on how well students succeed in their studies on a central level. The progression is being followed and the departments as well as the university's management receive information on the success rate so adaptations can be initiated if necessary.

The effort of the university to enable students to study abroad is remarkable. However, the experts were not able to find out if the departments under review use learning agreements to facilitate student mobility because none of the students the experts talked to had experience in studying abroad.

The certification and documentation on graduation is prescribed by CoHE.; the university has to adhere to the rules.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. University admission is centrally organized in Turkey. Progression, recognition and certification are executed on a reasonable level by the university.

5. Teaching Staff

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of the staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

The planned admittance number and admittance cycle for the study programmes is 50 students a year.

In the SER, the university describes the personal resources for the study programmes together with their respective teaching hours. From the Gastronomy Department, eight lecturers are involved in the programmes covering the areas of Management, Food Science, Tourism, Food Science and Safety, Dietetics and Culinary/Chief. The Gastronomy and Culinary Arts Department further enumerates six lecturers. If positions expire in the accreditation period, the university describes that a new advertisement is announced in the Higher Education Institution's official web site.

The state fixes the number of academic and administrative positions for each university every fiscal year. The appointments and promotions are made directly by each university based on the minimum requirements set by the Council of Higher Education and the university senate. The law defines the requirements for academic promotions and the procedures that are to be followed when making appointments. The career advancement for teaching faculty members is regulated by the Civil Servant Law. This law also sets the general parameters for career development of teaching staff members, which is then decided by individual universities that employ them.

The university describes in the SER that it organises training programmes on a regular basis in order for its staff to improve themselves e.g. the university supports the use of new technologies. Newly hired professors or lecturers go through a process of orientation with the help of the head of the department and research assistants.

Experts' Evaluation

The experts appreciate that the university has put effort in recruiting adequate staff for the departments, and the latest employments in the departments have certainly contributed to the increase of quality. The teaching staffs seem to be highly motivated and fully committed to the development of the university which was also underlined by the students and graduates the experts were able to talk to. A sense of shared aims was perceived and it also included the students, giving a sense of participation which is absolutely crucial for the positive evolution of a community. Also, the management supports the departments and gives financial aid to realise projects either of students or of the teaching staff. This makes Gelişim University an institution in which many things are possible.

However, the involvement of the teaching staff might also cause difficulties in detecting and stating an overload of work. The workload of the teaching staff, in fact, appears quite high and it is amazing that they can find time and energy to do research and to publish. Therefore, the workload of the teaching staff should be monitored, and more staff should be hired to relieve the situation and to enable the teaching staff to do more research (**Finding 8**). The quality of the teaching also depends on the possibility of having time to study, read, write and attend conferences and

courses, not to mention the need to follow students' researches properly. The ratio between students and teacher should not be higher than 1 full time professor/35 students. This step should be accomplished in the very next months.

Considering the changes which are needed to further develop the study programmes to reach an adequate level as explained in "Quality of the Curricula", there will probably be the need to hire more professors (it is especially recommended to find young ones, with an international background) who can contribute to a more complete picture of the contemporary level of this kind of studies to the Gastronomy courses in the future. Therefore, the experts demand a specified hiring plan which regards the development of the study programmes and shows the exact number and denomination of teaching positions as well as the required qualifications of candidates who are considered adequate by the university (**Finding 11**). ~~This is specifically relevant for the department of Gastronomy in which the academic staff should come from a greater variety of different disciplines such as Nutrition Science, Agricultural Science, etc. (Finding 12) but also for the department of Gastronomy and Culinary Arts which, by now, has teaching staff with a more diverse background than the other department.~~

Also, the existing teaching team in all departments should be encouraged and trained to work together to be able to coordinate their contents to implement a higher level of an interdisciplinary approach in the curriculum. By that, the possibilities for interdisciplinary research and teaching should be strengthened (see "Quality of the Curricula"; see **Finding 13**).

Also, and maybe above all, the teaching staff could benefit from staying a season abroad that could help them to fully understand how Gastronomy is developed in European universities today, which perspectives are involved in the study programmes and in research, and how this academic path is growing by the attention of researchers, markets, politicians. This process could start immediately and would provide positive results quickly.

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

The university has to check the teaching load of all current members of the teaching staff in the departments and restructure the workload in a more balanced way, hiring more professors if necessary. The number of teaching staff in both departments should be increased, and ~~especially in the department of Gastronomy at the School of Applied Sciences~~ the staff should have a more diverse background.

6. Learning Resources and Student Support

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students to advise on achieving successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

Facilities and resources

In the SER, the university displays the number of research literature, journals and electronic resources (databases, e-books etc.) as well as the facilities and infrastructure: e.g. a Learning Management System, classrooms, laboratories, hardware and audio systems, computer labs, campus-wide wireless internet access, synthetic pitch, graphic and fashion design workshops, cafeterias, health centre, fitness club, radio and television studio. All the campuses and physical areas of the university are designed to be suitable for disabled students.

The study programme ~~iss-are~~ financed by the tuition fees paid by students. Istanbul Gelişim University describes that it supports its students financially by providing them with various scholarships and discounts. Moreover, successful students in particular are financially supported with scholarships.

Information, consultation and guidance

In order to help the students to choose the programme after the university exam, so-called IGU Promotion Days are organised. In this process, students are given detailed information about the department they want to read and the atmosphere of the department/school is shown.

~~Gastronomy and~~ Gastronomy & Culinary Arts offers an introductory event (welcome party) for the firstly enrolled fresh students in the beginning of every academic year, the fall semester. In this activity, the senior students make macaroni and serve it to the Rector, the Deans, faculty and department staff and the first year students.

Gelişim University describes that undergraduate and graduate students are appointed with academic advisors from the related department for guidance in order to help with the resolution of problems they might have related to education and training. Academic advisors should inform students about legislation and advise them on issues such as course selection, add-drop, re-registration procedures and other academic issues. Thesis advisors for graduate students are assigned until the end of the second semester, on the basis of the decision of the Board of Directors of the related Institute. Students can also receive consultation from professors/lecturers and research assistants within their office hours throughout the academic year.

The university further explains that through administrative units such as Psychological Counseling and Guidance and the Centre for Continuing Education and Centre for Career Development, consultancy services are provided to the students. The Career Development Coordination Unit aims to provide service to the students both during their education and after their graduation with respect to their career opportunities.

To support exchange or students in programmes taught in English, Istanbul Gelişim University offers free English Language Courses on Saturdays. In addition, students are offered the opportunity to participate in the Erasmus Exchange Programme and in the Mevlana Exchange Programme.

Within the framework of the “Regulation on the Advisory and Coordination of Higher Education Institutions in Istanbul Gelişim University”, the Disabled Student Unit was established and the working procedures and principles were regulated by the aforementioned Regulation. The general aim of the University Disability Student Unit is to take the necessary precautions and make arrangements in this direction to facilitate the learning life of disabled students with higher education.

Experts' Evaluation

The documents contain a clearly structured curriculum for ~~the-each~~ programme (with the above mentioned shortcomings in level and content; see “Quality of the Curricula”) laid out in a course book in which every course is described including teaching and assessment methods.

The Students informed the experts that the library is used for research, for writing papers or a thesis. There are four libraries at university; if a book is not available, it can be ordered.

The experts recommend that the access to specific databases for the students as well as the teaching staff of ~~Gastronomy and~~ Gastronomy and Culinary Arts should be broadened; the respective licenses should be bought (**Finding 14**).

There is a kitchen with basic utensils in place. A special laboratory on nutrition is supposed to be opened in the future because it was requested by the students. Other existing laboratories and facilities at university, e. g. in the department of dietetics, should also be used for the Gastronomy ~~(and Culinary Arts)~~ programmes. Further laboratories should be established to increase the level

of the programmes and to be able to include adequate courses respectively (**Finding 9**, see also “Quality of the Curricula”).

There are sufficient (class-)rooms for the number of students available. As Gelişim University is a very fast-growing university a new tower was bought to provide further space.

Before the start of the programme students are able to get in contact with the department and discuss the specifics of it. At the start of each programme there is a welcome day. Requirements to consider aspects of diversity are met by the university. The students are informed about the differences between the department of Gastronomy (School of Applied Sciences) and the department of Gastronomy and Culinary Arts (Faculty of Fine Arts) properly. The latter is more oriented on regarding literature and research, the Gastronomy programmes provide a stronger focus on practical skills.

Questions or problems regarding one of the study programmes can be discussed and solved with the teaching staff. The staff is very helpful and the students reported that any obstacle in their studies can be overcome by the help of the teaching personnel. Teaching staff offers office hours in which the students can ask for help and support. Additionally, the students get assigned a student adviser at the start of the programme.

When searching for an internship the university provides help if wanted by the students. The internships last for ~~60 days in the Gastronomy programmes and~~ 40 days in the Gastronomy and Culinary Arts programme; the each internship is divided into two phases. The university even pays for plane tickets if the internship is served abroad and the student does not have a strong financial background. In both programmes the teaching staff contacts the companies during the internship period, if possible they also visit them personally. In the Gastronomy and Culinary Arts programme the students have to write a report. The companies take records on the behaviour and skills of the students.

The departments coordinate the courses offered and students are able to complete the programme in four years. The curriculum is clearly structured and the credit points awarded are reasonable. Only the credits awarded for the internship (2 CP ECTS) do not seem to be fully convenient. However, as far as the experts understood the situation, the amount of credits in this part of the curriculum cannot be changed by the university as it is prescribed by CoHE. Nevertheless, if it is possible, the amount of credits awarded should be increased (**Finding 10**).

Up until now there were no incoming international students in these programmes. This is why the English programme was established. Students who do not have sufficient financial possibilities but would like to study abroad can, for example, get support to study abroad with the ERASMUS programme.

The organisation of the internships works well but the students should be awarded more credit points for it. Furthermore, the possibilities to do internships as well as the scope of cooperating companies should be broadened as possibilities are currently focused mainly on the touristic sector/hotels (**Finding 15**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

The planned laboratory on nutrition is a very important extension of the facilities. The university should set up more specific laboratories with respective equipment enabling the understanding of the cooking process e.g. the training of sensory or hygienic analysis (see also “Quality of the Curricula”). A better coordination with other departments of the university to use their laboratories is recommended.

7. Information

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme. [ESG 1.7]

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders. [ESG 1.8]

Description

Information management

The University states that it gathers and evaluates opinions at different levels of management, with local, regional and national stakeholders, for example with meetings with employers and public authorities, to improve programs and enhance their effectiveness.

Gelişim University also gathers information on the matching of the teaching programmes with the business world's needs. To this end, meetings are held in which the authorities from the business world are participating. The career development centre examines the potentials for which graduates can be employed in which business areas and supports students in this regard. In addition to these, conferences are organised in which participants participate in many different sectors and positions in order to answer and provide information about the students' business world.

Transparency and information to stakeholders

According to the description in the SER, students are informed during their registration process about their programme and helped by the staff of Directorate of Public Affairs. Furthermore, the curriculum of each programme/department is available on the university's website. General information regarding examination regulations, assessment and grading can be found at "IGU's The Rules and the Regulations Concerning the Undergraduate Education, Examinations and Assessment".

Students and other stakeholders have access to evaluation criteria and course descriptions by means of website and their online systems (OBIS). Grades and marks are presented to students via these systems as soon as they get approval of Registrar's Office. Instructors submit original files and evaluation papers to Registrar's Office and these documents are kept in the archive for a certain period of time. Graduated students receive a "Diploma Supplement" as well as their diplomas.

The student provides policies, regulations, directives and Senate Principles The handbook is according to the university updated on a regular basis. Each year, department updates are made by department heads and sent to the dean for update the handbook. Whenever approved by the Dean, it is sent to the Information Processing Directorate and Public Relations Directorate for publication. If there is a change in the current regulations or guidelines, the Dean sends a written request to the heads of departments to update their handbooks. Current regulations and guidelines can also be accessed from the web site of the university.

Experts' Evaluation

The department ~~iss-are~~ already connected to the industry, especially to hotels. The experts were able to talk to representatives of the labour market from different fields during the site visit. These companies (as well as others) take students for internships. To intensify the collection of information of the needs of the labour market the experts suggest a more formalised way of gathering it, e. g. by meetings with representatives on a regular basis and by collecting information about the quality of the students and the study programmes after completing the internships (**Finding 1**, see also "Policy and Procedures for Quality Assurance").

As mentioned before, the university collects data about the students/student body appropriately and uses it for the quality assurance system, as it is requested by CoHE.

The public is informed properly, especially via internet. The students and teachers can provide and receive information by the university's online system.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

The university collects data appropriately and the public as well as the student body is informed properly about the study programmes.

Recommendations of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends the Accreditation Commission of AQAS to accredit the study programme Gastronomy and Culinary Arts (B.A.) (Faculty of Fine Arts) offered by Istanbul Gelişim University **with conditions**.

Findings:

1. The quality assurance system should be formalised further to intensify the communication between the university and the industry.
2. The clear profile of each programme – also in comparison with the other Gastronomy programmes – has to be documented, e. g. in the Diploma Supplement.
3. The curriculumuma of ~~all the~~ programmes ~~have has~~ to transfer academic skills more prominently. In particular:
 - a. The theoretical foundation has to be extended and research skills have to be trained as obligatory part of each curriculum.
 - b. Interdisciplinary courses should be made mandatory, together with such on global issues like hunger or climate change, and an interdisciplinary approach should be strengthened in general.
 - c. More advanced gastronomy skills should be trained, and the amount of courses on practical cooking skills should be reduced to be able to add more academic ones.
4. Managerial skills should be trained.
5. Professional etiquette should be trained.
6. Teaching, learning and assessment methods should be adapted to the revised curricula.
7. The production of alcoholic beverages should be taught so that graduates are better qualified for the labour market.
8. The number of teaching staff should be increased.
9. The university should set up specific laboratories to enable students to understand the cooking process.
10. The number of ECTS credit points should be raised for the internship to better reflect the workload of students.
11. The university has to present a hiring plan which shows how the changes of the curriculumuma of the study programmes ~~s~~ can be implemented by giving the exact number and denomination of teaching positions as well as the required qualifications of candidates.
- ~~12. Academic staff of “Gastronomy” should stem from a larger variety of academic disciplines.~~

13.12. Interdisciplinary research and teaching should be strengthened.

14.13. The access to specific databases for the students as well as the teaching staff of ~~Gastronomy and~~ Gastronomy and Culinary Arts should be broadened.

15.14. The scope of internship opportunities should be broadened.